

The concordat of 1801 helped to consolidate the French revolutionary achievements and the current regime (of Napoleon).

NAME: ZHIQIANG XU

USER NUMBER: U404190

COURSE NAME AND CODE:

SUPERVISOR: Dr. K. Schelkens & Dr. Joep van Gennip

ACADEMIC YEAR OF COURSE: 2019-2020

DATE OF SUBMISSION: 25/08/2020

TILBURG SCHOOL OF CATHOLIC THEOLOGY (TIU)

The concordat of 1801 helped to consolidate the French revolutionary achievements and the current regime (of Napoleon).

Table of Contents

1. Introduction	3-8
1.1 Research questions.....	3-4
1.2 Methods and academic disciplines.....	4
1.3 General overview.....	5-7
1.4 Summary of the Concordat and the affiliated Organic Article.....	7-8
2. The influence of the Concordat of 1801	
2.1 Abolition of Church Privilege and Deprivation of Wealth	8-11
2.2 Supporting <i>Declaration of the Rights of Man</i> by confirming religious tolerance.....	11-13
2.3 Other developments caused by the concordat.....	13-17
2.3.1 Appointment of bishops and payment of clergy by the government and pledge of allegiance to the state.....	14-16
2.3.2 The reorganization of the diocese.....	16-17
2.4 Further control over Church in favor of the regime through the Organic Articles.....	17-19
2.5 The differences between Western Europe's interpretation of the French Revolution and China's; theological debate on the relationship between church and state.....	19-25
3. Conclusion	25-29
4. Bibliography.....	30-32

The concordat of 1801 helped to consolidate the French revolutionary achievements and the current regime (of Napoleon).

Keywords

Catholicism, Pope, Concordat, Organic Articles, Napoleon Bonaparte, French Revolution, Rights of Man, bishops, payment, pledge, diocese

1. Introduction

1.1 Research questions

There is an old saying in China: If you use a mirror, you can wear your clothes neatly. If you use history as a mirror, you can know the rise and fall. If you use other people as a mirror, you can know the gains and losses. The purpose of studying and understanding history is how to correctly evaluate this historical event, how to learn lessons from history, and better use history to serve today's society and religion.

When I read articles such as "*concordat of 1801*" published in Encyclopedia, and *Patriot and Priest: Jean-Baptiste Volfius and the Constitutional Church in the Côte-D'or* written by Annette, etc. These articles respectively introduced the signing of the 1801 concordat and its influence. This makes me want to know about this history and try to find out how the 1801 Concordat affected Catholicism, the regime of Bonaparte, and the achievements of the French Revolution. Through the analysis, we try to find out the influence of this concordat on the French Revolution and Catholicism.

Drawing on the above articles I read, I put forward my premise and assumption that the concordat between Napoleon and Pope Pius VII in 1801 had a significant impact on the achievements of the French Revolution, the rule of Napoleon, and the Catholic Church.¹

Why am I interested in topics like revolution? I think that as long as people are mature and thoughtful in China, they will pay attention to the important issue of revolution because it really concerns your personal interests, even your life. If you stand in the wrong team in the revolution, you will lose your life. In addition, I think the theme of the revolution itself is rich and colorful, but also has an irresistible charm. Whether you are a weather-beaten old man or a young man with little experience, you can be moved. When you read about the history of the revolution, vivid historical facts and vivid

¹ Chapman-Adisho, Annette. *Patriot and Priest: Jean-Baptiste Volfius and the Constitutional Church in the Côte-D'or*. McGill-Queen's University Press, 2020: "Making Peace with the Catholic Church, 1801–2," Liberty, Equality, Fraternity, accessed February 9, 2020, <http://chnm.gmu.edu/revolution/d/504>; "Concordat of 1801." Encyclopedia of Modern Europe: Europe 1789-1914: Encyclopedia of the Age of Industry and Empire. Encyclopedia.com. (February 9, 2020). <https://www.encyclopedia.com/history/encyclopedias-almanacs-transcripts-and-maps/concordat-1801>

characters will appear in front of us. I found that the special experience and destiny of many people in history are inextricably linked with the great historical pattern, which makes me feel fresh and attractive. What's more, every revolution has a significant impact or change on the social system at that time or later, and countless people will pay the cost of their lives. For example, in the modern history of China, the revolution of 1911 successfully overthrew the rule of the Qing Dynasty, formed the imperial system, opened a new era of the Democratic Republic, and spread the concept of the Democratic Republic. The revolution during the war of liberation from 1945 to 1949, the Communist Party of China led the Chinese people's Liberation Army and established the People's Republic of China. The cultural revolution of 1966-1976, the Proletarian Cultural Revolution, was also called the ten-year turmoil because it lasted for ten years. In the Tiananmen event in 1989, more than one million people gathered in Tiananmen Square. Later it turned into a nationwide mass protest. This revolutionary event is famous at home and abroad.²

In China, revolution is a very serious matter, because it concerns the country, the social system, and people's life. I am very interested in what kind of consequences different revolutions in history have brought to state and society, and what kind of influence they have brought to people. In China, new policies or laws and regulations will be promulgated to consolidate the achievements of the revolution after the victory of a revolution; the signing of the agreement in 1801 was similar to this. Finally, through this analysis and research, we can learn from history and these revolutions what meaningful things can be used for reference and sharing while avoiding the same mistakes as in history. Therefore, we can avoid unnecessary detours to achieve win-win and social harmony.

The main question of this paper is the influence of the 1801 concordat between Napoleon and Pius VII. The sub-questions are as follows:

1. How has the 1801 concordat affected the abolition of church privileges and the deprivation of wealth in France?
2. What was the impact of the concordat on religious tolerance?
3. What was the impact of the concordat on the appointment of bishops by the government, the payment of clergy, and the pledge of allegiance to the country?
4. What was the impact of the concordat on the redistribution of parishes?
5. What was the impact of the Organic Articles

1.2 Methods and academic disciplines

² *Revolution and Rebellion list*. Retrieved from zh. wikipedia.org/wiki/革命和叛乱列表. (accessed on Jun 8, 2020).

This paper adopts the method of literature study, which mainly refers to the method of collecting and sorting out documents (For the collection of documents, the first is the documents related to the French Revolution and the 1801 concordat, and then to find the content related to this article according to the catalog) and forming a scientific understanding of historical facts through the research of documents. The literature study method is mainly written investigation, so it goes beyond time and space constraints.

(This article also considers that different or opposite views will be produced over time, such as the right of the Pope's spiritual coronation and the power to remove the nominated bishop, and Catholicism as the religion of the vast majority of French people, but this article does not consider these to constitute actual interest.) Through the investigation of literature, we can study a wide range of historical situations. Books and academic articles from libraries and libraries are precise and trustworthy, and the Internet is also a very convenient way to find useful information, but we should be more careful and discerning about materials from the Internet. The literature study method is a very convenient survey method, as long as we find the relevant literature (The content or catalog of the literature searched is closely related to what I want to write), we can start to study. The literature study method is study based on the achievements of predecessors and others, and it is a shortcut to acquiring knowledge. Therefore, it is an efficient investigation method.

First, according to the existing theories and facts, this paper proposes the topics and hypotheses and then designs the contents of the topics and hypotheses into specific and operable literature research activities. Then collect the literature and analyze the relevant literature. At the same time, try to make the content of the collected literature substantial and rich, and have a clear direction, which is closely related to the research topic and hypothesis of this paper. We should not only collect documents of the same view but also documents of different views. On the basis of a comprehensive collection of relevant documents and materials, through induction, sorting and analysis, this paper makes a systematic and comprehensive analysis of the progress of the topic, and then reaches a thematic overview, so that the content of the discussion is concentrated and specific, and at the same time, it should be targeted and highlighted. Based on the in-depth analysis of historical documents, the paper puts forward the problems to be solved and its own views.³

1.3 General overview

On July 14, 1789, the French Revolution (Révolution française) also known as the French bourgeois revolution, broke out in France. The Bourbon Dynasty, which ruled France for hundreds of years, and

³ *Methodology of the Literature Review*. Retrieved from <https://study.sagepub.com/sites/default/files/Onwuegbuzie%20%26%20Frels.pdf> (accessed on Jun 8, 2020)

its monarchy collapsed. The revolution overthrew the monarchy and established the Republic. During the great revolution, France's political system had many earth-shaking changes, overthrowing the traditional concept of monarchy, aristocracy and the Catholic rule system (As a state religion, Catholicism strongly controlled the French believers and supported the feudal dynasty, collecting tithe, and so on). Historians generally believe that the French Revolution (1789-1799) is one of the most important events in human history, which had a profound and extensive influence on French history and even the whole of Europe. Historians believe that the French Revolution is the greatest and most thorough revolution so far.⁴

During the French Revolution, the National Assembly had seized Church properties and published the Civil Constitution of the Clergy, which made the Church a part of the State, effectively removing it from papal authority. Subsequent laws abolished the traditional Gregorian calendar and Christian holidays. All of these could be seen as the beginning of a non-Christian process. In 1793, hundreds of priests, monks and nuns were killed marking the beginning of the Terror. The French Catholic Church was seen by the authorities as allied with counter-revolutionary and anti-government forces. There were so many clergymen who had refused to take the oath of the National Constitution in exile while remaining hostile to the French Revolution. In addition, during this radical period, even ordinary religious practices and ceremonies had come to be seen as hostile to the nation's new revolutionary ideas and objectives. France had been divided since the National Assembly put the church under state control in 1789. The Pope lost the right to appoint priests and bishops in France (Of course there are also influences from Gallicanism.) ; church property was confiscated. All of these caused great instability, but Napoleon was determined to reach a settlement with the Catholic Church to end the split.⁵

A fragmented religion undermines peace and causes great tension. Napoleon recognized the need to reach some agreements to help France achieve reconciliation and improve his ruling position. Napoleon realized that the French were tired of religious conflicts, and believed that it was necessary to mend the religious conflicts with Catholicism, which had split since the French Revolution, and that a friendly Catholic Church could strengthen his power. He said that there was no society without morality, and only religion could guarantee morality. He believed that the French people needed religion, but religion must be in the hands of the government, and this must have greater authority than the Pope. In his church plan, Bonaparte tried to rebuild a church subject to his discipline, obeying the pope in name, but in fact, the Pope obeyed him, and the Pope needed his protection. In addition, because Catholicism is associated with royalty and monarchy, Napoleon wanted to associate himself with royalty. Therefore, Napoleon's decision to reach an agreement was entirely pragmatic, and it was in his

⁴ *French Revolution*. Retrieved from https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/French_Revolution. Accessed on Jun 1, 2020)

⁵ Coppa, Frank J. *Controversial Concordats: The Vatican's Relations with Napoleon, Mussolini, and Hitler*. Catholic University of America Press, 1999, 34-80.

own interest to do so. He could not only win the favor of French Catholics, but also put French Catholicism under the control of his government, at the same time, he could control Rome politically, and show the French people the correct way of life in the French Empire. Pope Pius VII, as the leader of the Catholic Church and the ruler of the Papal State, proposed that this revolutionary idea should not conflict with Catholicism. Bonaparte sought reconciliation with Rome to end the cleric rebellion and reunite the clergy, which would help consolidate his regime and dominance, while Pius VII agreed to rebuild the Roman Catholic Church in France finally, in 1801, Napoleon signed the concordat with Pope Pius VII in Paris, seeking national reconciliation between revolutionaries and Catholics. Napoleon believed that reconciliation could be achieved, and the utility of religion was an important factor of social cohesion and harmony. He believed that his power over the pope would exceed that of the former French regime. Napoleon's method is utilitarian, in order to consolidate the achievements of the French Revolution and his regime and rule and to affirm the disposition of church property, the appointment of bishops and the reorganization of parish areas, etc., while Rome sought the protection of Catholicism by Bonaparte and his regime, and recognized the special status of Catholicism in France. In the end, Napoleon acknowledged that Catholicism was the religion of most French people, and that Catholic resentment to the country was now largely ended.⁶

As part of the concordat, Napoleon proposed another set of laws called Organic Articles, which were published in 1802 as a unilateral add-on. One of Napoleon's methods was to propose additional components, which allowed the state to control the concordat to help the state monitor any politically harmful Catholic or Protestant movement or activity. In the end, the concordat consolidated the policy proposed by the French Revolution at the expense of the interests of the church, increased the authority of the state, weakened the privileges and wealth of the church, and supported the principle of religious tolerance and the authority of the state in religion.⁷

1.4 Summary of the Concordat and affiliated Organic Article

The Concordat was an agreement signed by Napoleon and Pope Pius VII in Paris in 1801. Both Napoleon and the Pope found this useful because it sought national reconciliation between Catholics and revolutionaries. However, during the revolution, church land sold and occupied donations were not returned. All the 'old' bishops who stuck to the old tradition had to resign, the new selected bishops and clergies returned to their posts,, Napoleon had an absolute advantage in the relationship between

⁶ *An Imperial Revival: government and Religion under the Reign of Napoleon*. Retrieved from http://archive2.armstrong.edu/archive/Initiatives/history_journal/history_journal_an_imperial_revival_government_and_religion_under_the_reign.html#:~:text=He%20stated%20that%20he%20was,Pope%20and%20the%20full%20backing. Accessed on June 8, 2020)

⁷ Lyons, Martyn. *Napoleon Bonaparte and the legacy of the French Revolution*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1994, 77-94.

the state and the church through the control of the government; and the government had the right to choose the bishop and supervise almost all the church activities according to the concordat of 1801 and the subsequent Organic Articles.

- Summary of the Concordat:

Under the concordat, Catholicism is declared the religion of the overwhelming majority of the people in France, but it is not an official religion in the country, thereby guaranteeing freedom of religion, especially for Protestants. According to the agreement, the Pope has the right to remove bishops, but the French government still has the right to nominate new bishops. The concordat also stipulates that the church should worship in public places in accordance with the public laws and regulations necessary to maintain public order. Sundays are designated as non-working Christian day. What's more, it's important that the Catholic Church relinquishes all rights to the confiscated land under the agreement, but the concordat will pay wages to priests who are loyal to the country.⁸

- Summary of the Organic Articles (the important part pertaining to Catholics):

According to the Organic Articles, the government controls the archbishops, bishops, parishes, and the buildings of worship. At the same time, it stipulates the specific jurisdiction of bishops and stipulates that all churches in France have only one catechism, and also stipulates that the publication and implementation of papal documents in France need the government's authorization, and controls the total wages and religious holidays. The Organic Articles also explain the restrictions on public processions and require believers to respect and obey the emperor. In addition, the rules and principles of the seminary must also be approved by the state, and priests appointed in important parishes must be approved by the state.⁹

2. The influence of the Concordat of 1801

In the early days of the French Revolution, in order to eradicate the old feudal system, the constitutional assembly carried out a reform policy for the Catholic Church and issued a series of orders, which not only had a heavy blow to the church but also had a great impact on the domestic politics, economy, culture and many other aspects. The church reform policy made France venerable to more than ten years

⁸ Coppa, Frank J. *Controversial Concordats: The Vatican's Relations with Napoleon, Mussolini, and Hitler*. Washington, District of Columbia: Catholic University of America Press, 1999, 47.

⁹ CF. *Organic Articles*. Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia. Retrieved from https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Organic_Articles. (Accessed on 23 February, 2020)

of religious division and conflicts. It was not until 1801 that Napoleon and the Vatican signed the concordat that enabled France to achieve religious “peace”.¹⁰

The treaty signed by Napoleon Bonaparte and Pope Pius VII on July 15, 1801 influenced the political and religious relations in France. The concordat tried to reconcile the religious conflicts that had plagued France since the beginning of the French Revolution in 1789. Napoleon demanded the Catholic Church to agree to the disposition of church property, the reorganization of parishes, religious tolerance policy, the appointment of bishops and priests as state employees, and swearing allegiance to the country, etc., while Rome asked to protect Catholics and recognize their special status in France. However, the concordat seriously inclined to Napoleon at the expense of the interests of the church, consolidating the achievements of the French Revolution and strengthening the current regime.¹¹

2.1 Abolition of Church Privilege and Deprivation of Wealth

During the French Revolution, many of the privileges of the church were abolished and a great deal of its wealth was deprived. Let's first review what these privileges of the church were before the French Revolution and how much wealth they possessed. French society before the revolution was divided into three classes: clergy, aristocracy, and the common people. Clergy belong to the first estate. There were approximately 100,000 clerics, divided into two groups: the high clergy and the low clergy. The high clergy occupied the highest position in society. The Catholic Church kept a strict hierarchy, the high-level clergy had a significant impact on government and national policies. They were earthly landlords, lords, tithes collectors, and administrative officials; the church had religious power which could judge clergy. The first level of French society was an important part of the feudal ruling class. They enjoyed the right of tax exemption, mastered the civil registration, hosted education, poverty relief, charity, and religious ceremonies. As a result, the secular society is closely dependent on the power of religion. Under the Ancien Régime, the church owned a lot of land and collected tithes from all French people. The Catholic Church possesses 10% of the land. They run monasteries, churches, and educational institutions in France. They didn't pay taxes to the monarch. They were very powerful and rich.

“The clergy is the first order of France, even richer in land and money than the nobility. The bishops, all of whom in the past century have come from the nobility, as well as the powerful abbots of the great monasteries, hold almost half the real estate of France. Property is presumed to be the product of accumulated centuries of endowments and is

¹⁰ Lyons, Martyn. *Napoleon Bonaparte and the Legacy of the French Revolution*. St. Martin's Press, New York, 1994, 77-93.

¹¹ Coppa, Frank J. *Controversial Concordats: The Vatican's Relations with Napoleon, Mussolini, and Hitler*. Catholic University of America Press, 1999, 34-80.

regarded as sacred, untouchable by any form of taxation. Every year, thanks to the tithe system...it grows.”¹²

The French Catholic Church played an important role in the political, economic and social life of the old feudal system. As a national religion in France at that time, it played an important role in supporting the autocratic monarchy. The church and the royal power depended on each other, which was the spiritual pillar of maintaining the old feudal system. Generally speaking, the church had a strict hierarchy and administrative organization, which was subordinated to the Pope and the (arch)bishops. (there were also a lot of tensions between the French bishops and the pope in previous centuries) Because it was a political system, it occupied the most privileged and influential position. Because of the great power and influence of the Catholic Church and the Pope, the National Assembly expected to eliminate their power, so the reform of the Catholic church by the constituent assembly began in 1789. The first thing to be hit was the privileges of the church. According to the law promulgated, the church's hierarchical privileges, judicial privileges, the right to collect tithes and other feudal privileges were abolished. In order to alleviate the state's financial situation, the National Assembly also announced the nationalization of the church industry, thus ending the church's economic monopoly. (The civil constitution of the clergy stipulates that archbishops should be removed. Like other officials, bishops are elected by the people and their salaries will be paid by the state. The number of the existing 135 bishops is reduced to 50. In addition, all priests must swear to the constitution, including those clerical Assemblymen, in order to bring the church into line with the newly established government norms. “Religious space was now treated in the same way as any other.”)¹³ Moreover, the Assembly abolished the status of Catholicism as a national religion and deprived the Church of the right to manage the property. The formulation and adoption of the Civil Constitution of the Clergy, especially the disposal of the property of the original church, was directly related to the fundamental interests of Catholicism, which made it lose its political and economic privileged status.¹⁴

In several ways, the concordat maintained the abolition of church privileges by the revolution. From August 1789, the church's right to collect tithes was abolished and part of the church's land was sold. In November 1789, the National Assembly confiscated all the church land that generated income and later sold it to raise funds for the French state. Although this was mainly for economic reasons, it

¹² Hunt, Jocelyn. *The French Revolution: Questions and Analysis in History*. Hoboken: Routledge, 1998, 1-5.

¹³ Coppa, Frank J. *Controversial Concordats: The Vatican's Relations with Napoleon, Mussolini, and Hitler*. Washington, District of Columbia: Catholic University of America Press, 1999, 9. Stone, Bailey. *Reinterpreting the French Revolution: A global-historical perspective*. University of Houston. Cambridge, U.K.; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002, 180. McPhee, Peter. *Wiley-Blackwell companions to European History: A companion to the French Revolution*. A John Wiley & Sons, Ltd., Publication, 2013, 99.

¹⁴ Dwyer, Philip and McPhee, Peter. *The French Revolution and Napoleon: A Sourcebook*. Routledge, 2002, 91, 182.

also reflected the prevention of the church's economic privileges. In France, the church no longer possessed a large part of the land, nor could it get income from the land. According to the concordat of 1801, the Catholic Church gave up all rights to church land seized after 1790. The concordat maintained these revolutionary achievements by proclaiming that neither the Pope nor his successors would interfere in any way with those who had got the church property. The church was now an unprivileged institution. Therefore, the concordat legitimized land transferred during the revolution, thus upholding the revolutionary principle by eliminating the main source of church wealth.¹⁵

The crucial issue here is that the Catholic Church had lost its economic base, so it could not continue its superstructure. According to the theory of economic foundation and superstructure founded by Marx and Engels. The economic basis refers to the sum of the productive relations determined by the productive forces in a certain stage of social development, which is the basis of a certain society; the superstructure refers to the ideology based on the economic foundation and the corresponding systems, organizations, and facilities, which mainly refers to the political and legal systems and facilities in the class society. The economic foundation is the root of the superstructure, and the superstructure is the political and ideological expression of economic foundation. In the class society, the superstructure has the class nature, that is, the class that dominates the material means of production and the spiritual means of production; the thought of the ruling class is the thought that the society occupies the dominant position. The economic basis determines the superstructure, and what kind of economic basis will produce what kind of superstructure. A country built on the basis of a feudal (A political system in which the monarch divided the land among the clans and heroes. Large landowners or lords can earn income from land and exercise government functions and powers on their land.) economy is a country with a feudal dictatorship and an ideology centered on the landlord class thought. By contrast, on the basis of the capitalist economy, the state is under the dictatorship of the bourgeoisie and the ideology with bourgeois ideology as the core. The economic basis determines the change of superstructure. The economic basis is the cause, and the superstructure is the result. From this perspective, it is clear why the concordat must firmly uphold the confiscated church land and property.¹⁶

2.2 Supporting *Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen* by confirming religious tolerance

On August 26, 1789, the Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen (*Déclaration des droits de l'homme et du citoyen*) was promulgated. According to the extracts from the Declaration of the

¹⁵ Coppa, Frank J. *Controversial Concordats: The Vatican's Relations with Napoleon, Mussolini, and Hitler*, 9,34,44,55.

¹⁶ CF. *The economic base and the superstructure*. Retrieved from <https://baike.baidu.com/item/经济基础与上层建筑/1947805?fr=aladdin>. (accessed 25 March 2020)

Rights of Man and of the Citizen, no one might be harassed for his opinions, even on religious issues, as long as the opinions expressed did not threaten public order. The free exchange of ideas and opinions was one of the most precious rights of human beings. Therefore, under the circumstances prescribed by law, every citizen was free to say, write, print, and so on. The declaration was one of the most powerful announcements of liberalism and ended the autocracy and feudalism of France in the 18th century.¹⁷

Religious freedom was a principle of the declaration and was considered a basic right of man. Religious freedom was generally considered as a religious activity without persecution of believers of other faiths. It supported the freedom of individuals or communities to manifest their religion or belief in public or private settings. It also included the freedom to change religion or belief. Because the Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen in the revolution of 1789 established the principle of religious tolerance and stipulated that no one's opinions could be disturbed even in religion, Protestants had full political and civil rights. (The Nantes edict signed in 1598, whose main purpose was to promote the unity of citizens and to grant French Protestants substantive rights, opened a way for secularism and tolerance, and the decree made many specific concessions to Protestants, such as amnesty and the restoration of its citizens right.)¹⁸ The French Revolution recognized the right of the French people to participate in or withdraw from any religion. The principle of religious tolerance was established by the revolution, which was further confirmed and consolidated by the 1801 concordat.

According to the provisions of the concordat, although Catholicism was declared as the religion of the vast majority of the French people, it was not the official religion of the country (state religion), thus religious freedom was safeguarded. Especially for the Protestants, their rights were protected by provisions attached to the concordat, which prohibited from ill-treating other religions by Catholic clergy. This further proved that the principle of religious tolerance had been consolidated. At the same time, the concordat successfully put Calvinists(Huguenotes) on a legal basis equal to that of the Catholic Church. This also gave Calvinists and Lutheran churches to gain more legal recognition and tolerance

Pope Pius VII wanted Bonaparte to declare Catholicism as the official religion of France but this was rejected. In contrast, the concordat did not declare Catholicism as the official religion of France, nor did it grant the Pope the right to monopolize religion in France. Instead, the concordat clearly set up the principle of religious tolerance by depriving Catholicism of its monopoly position. It can be seen that, to a large extent, the concordat sticks to the principle of religious pluralism in France, establishing and consolidating the principle of religious tolerance and the revolutionary achievements set up during the revolutionary period.¹⁹

¹⁷ CF. Hunt, Jocelyn. *The French Revolution: Questions and Analysis in History*. Routledge, 1998, 34.

¹⁸ Cf. *Edict of Nantes*. Retrieved from the free encyclopedia.

[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Edict_of_Nantes#:~:text=The%20Edict%20of%20Nantes%20\(French,essentially%20Catholic%20at%20the%20time.](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Edict_of_Nantes#:~:text=The%20Edict%20of%20Nantes%20(French,essentially%20Catholic%20at%20the%20time.) (Accessed on July 12, 2020).

¹⁹ Lyons, Martyn. *Napoleon Bonaparte and the legacy of the French Revolution*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1994, 77-94.

2.3 Other developments caused by concordat

The following two sections (2.3.1-2.3.2) will analyze how to consolidate the achievements of the French Revolution and Napoleon's regime by appointing bishops, paying clergy and swearing allegiance to the country and redistributing parishes, while weakening the rights of Catholics and popes.

Firstly, during the French Revolution, an important part of the revolutionary religious policy was the government's overall control over the church, which was mainly achieved through the Civil Constitution of the Clergy. According to the Civil Constitution of the Clergy, citizens elected bishops and priests. The constitution greatly weakened the authority of the Pope, who no longer had a say in the selection of the higher clergy. Different from this procedure, the 1801 concordat gave the state the right to choose bishops instead of citizens. Although the Pope had the right to remove the bishop, the French government still had the right to nominate the bishop. Napoleon's power to appoint bishops led to greater national supervision of the church and the loyalty of clergy to the country, which further strengthened Napoleon's rule and consolidated the achievements of the revolution.

Secondly, during the French Revolution, the salaries of bishops and priests were guaranteed by the constitution. While the concordat stipulates that the state paid the salaries of the clergy, making all clergy becoming state employees and subject to state control. Their appointment was depended on the state, Bonaparte and his government, not the Pope. Therefore, the state represented by Napoleon consolidated its power at the expense of the interests of the church.

Thirdly, according to the Civil Constitution of the Clergy, the newly appointed bishops had to swear allegiance to France and support the constitution. (Half of France's clergy refused to take the oath, and even the constitutional clergy found themselves considered suspects.)²⁰ Similarly, the concordat of 1801 ordered all clergy to swear allegiance to the government and pray for the country and consuls at the end of each mass, so that they could be regarded as allies and became an important part of the national ideological institutions. This is the same as that in the feudal system, the higher clergy prayed for the French king, which also became an important part of feudal ideology.

Fourthly, under the ancient system, the first class (the clergy) owned one-tenth of France's land and collected rents every year. "A few very rich bishoprics contrasted with a multitude of small and poorer ones, mainly in the south."²¹ However, the concordat of 1801 further legalized the land transfer that the church was disposed of during the revolution, and the newly demarcated parish boundary eliminated the inequality in the ancient system. Therefore, some priests could not become so rich as before just because of the size or location of their parish. In addition, because the church no longer has

²⁰ Hunt, Jocelyn. *The French Revolution: Questions and Analysis in History*. Routledge, 1998, 55-56.

²¹ Lyons, Martyn. *Napoleon Bonaparte and the Legacy of the French Revolution*. St. Martin's Press, New York, 1994, 92.

a special status, the privileges of some priests have been totally cancelled. Hence, the concordat upheld the will of revolutionaries and the rule of Napoleon during the French Revolution.

Lastly, Finally, the influence of Gallicanism must be mentioned, because it has had a significant impact on the political and religious relations of the country. It is based on two principles: separation of powers and constitutionalism. Separation of powers refers to the protection of the state from any interference by the pope; constitutionalism means that the Pope has the obligation to obey the canon of the church. Gallicanism can also be applied to explain the reform of Catholicism during the French Revolution. It puts the Pope under the authority of the church represented by the General Council and refuses to accept his complete accuracy.²²

2.3.1 Appointment of bishops and payment of clergy by the government and pledge of allegiance to the state:

- Appointment of bishops:

French revolutionaries weakened Rome's authority by giving the state more control over the church. An important part of the revolutionary religious policy is the government's overall control over the French clergy and the church as a whole. In the revolutionary period, this was mainly achieved through the Civil Constitution of Clergy. (The Civil Constitution of the Clergy promulgated in 1790 made the French Catholic Church obey the French government, which completely destroyed the monastic order. It stipulates that bishops and pastors are elected by the people, not appointed by the church, and the internal hierarchy, so the church loses most of its power to manage itself and emphasizes that church officials cannot make promises to the pope. Moreover, the parishes were unified and standardized to be consistent with the administrative districts and it tried to solve the problems caused by the confiscation of church land and the abolition of the tithe tax.)

According to Civil Constitution of Clergy, only the people could elect their priests and bishops to ensure that believers had the most trustworthy and moral priests. The constitution would guarantee their wages. Many pastors benefited greatly from the new salary scale, only the senior pastor's allowance was greatly reduced. Priests had to swear allegiance to the law and the country. The oath was a test for priests to see if they accepted the revolution as a whole. The constitution led to the loss of authority of the Pope and the loss of voice in the selection of clergy, thus giving the state full control of the church.²³

²² Encyclopedia of the Early Modern World. Encyclopedia.com. (July 10, 2020). <https://www.encyclopedia.com/history/encyclopedias-almanacs-transcripts-and-maps/gallicanism>. (Accessed on July 12, 2020)

²³ McPhee, Peter. *The French Revolution: 1789-1799*. Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press, 2002, 64-86.

Unlike the democratic procedure in which the revolutionaries gave the people democratic rights and allowed French citizens to choose their own bishops and priests through a series of elections, the concordat of 1801 gave the state the right to choose bishops, and then the bishops selected priests. It gives the state the right to make decisions, not French citizens. This agreement created conditions for Napoleon to further influence and interfere with Catholicism. Napoleon forced the Pope to remove the uncompromising anti-revolutionary bishops who opposed the clergy's civil constitution, and the bishops who were loyal to the traditional church were dismissed. The government could fire all the anti-revolutionary bishops who refused to take the oath, which would push the clergy in France to accept the Concordat. The agreement gives the state the power to appoint the bishop, not the Pope, whose only role in this matter is to sanctify the nominees, which makes the church subject to greater state supervision. The practice of Napoleon's power to appoint new bishops led to the loyalty of the clergy to the state and to the French government, which further strengthened Napoleon's rule.²⁴

- Payment of clergy:

During the French Revolution, after nationalizing the church's property and abolishing the church's tithe, the Parliament promised to support the church financially. Since the salaries of bishops, pastors, and assistant pastors are guaranteed by the Constitution, bishops, pastors, and assistant pastors should perform their duties free of charge.

The concordat of 1801 recognizes Catholicism as the religion of the vast majority of citizens, and clergy, including bishops and priests, became state employees. The concordat stipulated that the state would pay the salaries of the clergy, which effectively makes all clergy state employees and therefore subject to state power. The clergy would receive their salaries, then their appointment would be subject to the state, Bonaparte and his government, not the Pope since they had no choice. In this way, from the perspective of making the clergy get the salary of the state employees, as the Civil Constitution of the Clergy in 1790 intended, the concordat reached the aim of the Civil Constitution of the Clergy, that is, to put the clergy under the control of the state and reduce the power of the Pope. As all bishops and vicars were paid by the state, the government had huge control over them. Although the Pope still had the right to remove the current bishop, he could not get any real benefits from the removal, nor any real power in the spiritual authority granted to the clergy. The state represented by Napoleon further consolidated its control over the church.²⁵

- Pledge of allegiance to the state:

²⁴ Lyons, Martyn. *Napoleon Bonaparte and the Legacy of the French Revolution*. St. Martin's Press, New York, 1994, 84,86,87.

²⁵ Lyons, Martyn. *Napoleon Bonaparte and the Legacy of the French Revolution*. St. Martin's Press, New York, 1994, 86, 88.

During the French revolution, according to the Civil Constitution of the Clergy, the newly nominated bishops had to make a formal oath, also known as a compulsory pledge, before the commencement of the consecration ceremony. It was necessary to swear in front of the clergy, people, and municipal officials, be faithful to France and favor the constitution promulgated by the National Assembly.

The revolutionaries required the clergy to swear allegiance, which forced them to make a clear decision to support or resist the revolution. For parish priests, the oath ensured better wages and pensions, and the government expelled all anti-revolutionary bishops who refused to be sworn in. (A group of counter-revolutionaries was exiled to Australia, “including Truehart, Captain of the National Guard, and the Prince Braggart, Baron Swindle, Judge Blunder, the abbot Smarmy, the financier Leech, and the monk Greedy.”)²⁶ The concordat ordered all clergy to swear allegiance to the government and pray for the country and the consul at the end of each mass. Bonaparte believed that the status of the clergy who made a declaration of loyalty to the government had changed, and they could be regarded as allies of his political order and became an important part of the national ideology.²⁷

2.3.2 The reorganization of the dioceses

Under the ancient system, the church's wealth mainly came from the collection of a tithe of the farm, as well as the extensive possession of land by religious organizations and cathedrals. With these resources and privileges, many parishes paid allowances to parish clergy. The first class (the clergy) owns one-tenth of French land, according to which the Catholic Church collected rents every year. For example, the allowance for priests in the west part of France is much higher than the others; some of the very rich bishops are in severe contrast to numerous poor ones. In this regard, the concordat legitimated and approved the land circulation during the revolution, thus sticking to the code of revolution by removing the main foundation of church wealth. As a result of this reformation, it was no longer possible for some priests to enrich themselves simply because of the size or location of their parish.

During the French Revolution, according to the new administrative divisions, the boundaries of the church parishes were defined by National Assembly. Each division had a parish, each of which could hold 6000 people. The number of parishes in France had been reduced to 83 and divided into 10 metropolitan areas. The only church leaders accepted in these parishes were bishops, priests, and

²⁶ McPhee, Peter. *The French Revolution: 1789-1799*. Oxford; New York : Oxford University Press, 2002, 102-103.

²⁷ Lyons, Martyn. *Napoleon Bonaparte and the Legacy of the French Revolution*. St. Martin's Press, New York, 1994, 32, 78,86 .

assistant priests. Bishops and priests must be elected by the public, and the right to vote was limited to citizens who had paid taxes. The newly elected bishop does not need to obtain the Pope's consent or the Pope's coronation.

According to the newly established 83 administrative departments, the National Assembly redefined the parish boundary during the revolutionary period. On the basis of this, the concordat further adjusted the parish boundary and further reorganized the French parish boundary. Compared with 83 parishes in the French Revolution, there were only 50 parishes created according to the concordat of 1801. Due to the provisions of the concordat, the newly designated parishes eliminated the inequalities that existed in the ancient system.

In addition, since the church had no tax-free or any other privileges any more, it no longer had a particular status in the country, but was under the control of the government, as envisaged by the National Assembly. As a result of the reorganization of the dioceses according to the concordat, a few rich bishops in the ancient system were effectively eradicated, and the privileges of some priests were entirely lost, thus eliminating another inequality within the church. It can be seen that the concordat of 1801 maintained the will of revolutionaries and the rule of Napoleon during the French Revolution.²⁸

2.4 Further control over Church in favor of the regime through Organic Articles

The formulation of organic articles may also be inspired by the counter-revolutionary uprising in Vendée. The Wendean War in 1793 was a counter-revolution during the French Revolution. The revolt led by the newly established Catholic and Royal Army caused the number of both parties who died in the conflict is between 117,000 and 450,000.²⁹ Moreover, Bonaparte has recognized the need for administrative measures to further illustrate the details of the concordat of 1801 and the need to further strengthen it. Without fear of the Pope, he had designed a series of Organic Articles to strengthen the control of his regime over the clergy. The Organic Articles of April 8, 1802, as a unilateral supplement to the French concordat in 1801, was also known as the French concordat. The Organic Articles was mainly composed of four parts and 77 articles. Bonaparte designed this clause to allow the regime under his leadership to more effectively rearrange and manage the French church. Although the French government regards Organic Articles as the law inseparable from the Concorde of 1801, Pope Pius VII had different views on this. The Pope protested against the Organic Articles and officially declared that

²⁸ Coppa, Frank J. *Controversial Concordats: The Vatican's Relations with Napoleon, Mussolini, and Hitler*. Catholic University of America Press, 1999, 34-80. Lyons, Martyn. *Napoleon Bonaparte and the Legacy of the French Revolution*. St. Martin's Press, New York, 1994. Chapter 7.

"Civil Constitution of the Clergy." New Catholic Encyclopedia. Encyclopedia.com. (March 27, 2020). Retrieved from <https://www.encyclopedia.com/religion/encyclopedias-almanacs-transcripts-and-maps/civil-constitution-clergy>

²⁹ War in the Vendée. Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/War_in_the_Vend%C3%A9e (Accessed on July 16, 2020)

they were issued without his knowledge (which was correct), saying that he did not know the additional terms of the concordat of 1801 signed by Napoleon, but in any case, the Pope's protest was futile.

The Organic Articles here referred only to administrative regulations rather than basic principles. Bonaparte hoped to strengthen the regulation and restriction of public ceremonies within the church through the administrative provisions contained in these additional organic provisions. In short, the main contents of the articles were: the state and the diocese synods needed the authorization of the government, and the number and scale of dioceses needed the permission of the government. National doctrines, worship, religious banquets and wedding blessings all needed the permission of the government; papal representatives in France also needed the authorization of the government to carry out their mission, and without the permission of the government, they were not allowed to publish papal bulls. Bishops were forbidden to leave the diocese or even go to Rome without permission from the government. At the same time, they needed the permission of the Minister to leave their diocese or set up a branch of the cathedral.³⁰

The purpose of the Organic Articles was to help Napoleon manage the concordat well in order to help the state to supervise and control any movement or activity of Catholicism or Protestants that would be politically harmful. Many of these administrative terms and regulations approved by the French legislature were related to the relationship between the state and the Catholic Church. Bonaparte tried to establish strict control of the current Catholic system and to limit the rights of the Holy See. After these regulations were promulgated, almost all church activities were under the control of the government. According to these provisions, the date of a religious festival even needed the consent of the state to decide. Therefore, it was very difficult for the church to carry out any activities without the permission of the government, which was what Bonaparte had expected, that the Pope would not enjoy a superior position after signing the treaty. The content of these articles clearly showed that the state would have the final decision-making power on religious affairs, which ultimately led to clergy who had no choice but to rely on the government.

As a result, the government under the leadership of Bonaparte unilaterally added Organic Articles on the basis of the 1801 agreement. These Provisions further restricted the church, which undoubtedly enhanced the secular power to the clergy and made the clergy subject to greater restrictions and supervision of the government. In fact, these regulations firmly held the power of the church in the hands of the state, because, without the explicit approval of the government, it was difficult for the church to make a difference. This showed that the country under Bonaparte could decide what the church would do. If he did not agree with the church's actions, he would intervene through legal channels. Since the treaty allowed the state the right to appoint bishops instead of popes, and bishops had great power in their parishes. Therefore, in view of these problems, it was absolutely necessary to

³⁰ *The Organic Articles*. Catholic Encyclopedia, Free World Class Education. Retrieved from <https://www.catholic.org/encyclopedia/view.php?id=8774> (accessed on 7, June)

limit the behavior of bishops through the Organic Articles, and strengthen the state's control over bishops and churches. These provisions greatly limited the scope of the bishop's rights and the Pope's interference in the affairs of the French church. (To a large extent, Organic Articles are equivalent to regulations for Catholicism, such as the publication of the Pope's bull, the establishment of new parishes and churches, and the religious synod, all of which require government permission. Any violation of the organic law will be regarded as a criminal offence, which further strengthens the government's supervision of church affairs.) Not only did the church fail to restore its privileged status in the agreement, but the organizational terms further helped to reduce the power of the pope. These regulations maintain the country's independent authority over the church. Organic Articles are equivalent to strengthening Bonaparte's centralization of power at the expense of the helpless pope.³¹

2.5 The differences between Western Europe's interpretation of the French Revolution and China's; theological debate on the relationship between church and state

There are differences in thinking between the East and the West. Eastern and Western cultures have their own characteristics. The difference between the means of life and the means of production, as well as the way of life and production, determines the difference in the national culture. It also determines the cultural characteristics and social psychology of a nation. Each of us is the carrier of a certain national culture, and the ideology of a nation is reflected by the specific people of the nation, which has the common characteristics of national culture.³²

Ideology has directivity and always points to reality. Political ideology is either the maintenance of the existing political system or the criticism of the existing political system.³³ Different ideologies have different understanding and cognition of the same thing. Ideology is directly related to the economy and politics of a certain society. It is the reflection of the economic foundation and political system of society and the economic and political relations between people. Different social groups and classes have different ideologies because of their different interests, and the status of different ideologies in society is determined by the status of the class they represent. The basis of ideology is the

³¹ Lyons, Martyn. *Napoleon Bonaparte and the Legacy of the French Revolution*. St. Martin's Press, New York, 1994. Chapter 7. Coppa, Frank J. *Controversial Concordats: The Vatican's Relations with Napoleon, Mussolini, and Hitler*. Catholic University of America Press, 1999, 34-80.

"Concordat of 1801." *Encyclopedia of Modern Europe: Europe 1789-1914: Encyclopedia of the Age of Industry and Empire*. Encyclopedia.com. (March 29, 2020). Retrieved from <https://www.encyclopedia.com/history/encyclopedias-almanacs-transcripts-and-maps/concordat-1801>

³² Yubo, Hou. *The Theoretical and Practical Basis of Eastern and Western Thinking Differences*. 2009.

³³ Values. *Popular Science China, Science Encyclopedia*. <https://baike.baidu.com/item/价值观#:~:text=价值观是基于人的,认知和需求状况%E3%80%82>.

moral values of some societies. In terms of values in class society, different classes have different values. Values have the characteristics of stability and persistence, historicity and selectivity, subjectivity.³⁴

Marxism as the guiding ideology is the soul of the socialist core value system, determines the nature and direction of the socialist core value system, is the common ideal recognized and accepted all social strata and interest groups of contemporary Chinese society, and is the core of socialism. The theme of the value system is the expression of values of the fundamental theoretical position, basic views and methods of Marxism in China. The values and political ideas of socialism with Chinese characteristics are closely linked. Marx and Engels pointed out that "all movements in the past were those of or for the benefit of minorities. The proletarian movement is an independent movement for the benefit of the overwhelming majority. "For the interests of the vast majority" is Marx and Engels' concentrated generalization of the proletarian outlook on life and values. Major political issues include what kind of country we want to build, what kind of society we want to build, and what kind of citizens we want to cultivate.³⁵

Under the socialist political system, it is the people's democratic dictatorship under the leadership of the working class through the Communist Party. Firstly, responsibility is prior to Freedom: it claims that the relationship between the individual and the other party cannot be self-centered, and the individual interests should obey the requirements of responsibility. It emphasizes the responsibility of individuals to the countries, not individual freedom. Secondly, according to eastern values, they emphasize the priority of obligations rather than human rights, while Westerners emphasize the priority of individual human rights. Oriental people believe that values-centered on individual rights are one of the root causes of many problems. Because the idea of individual rights priority overemphasizes the protection of individual freedom and rights, ignores the attention to social welfare, and fails to face up to the conflict between social welfare and personal interests, which will do more harm than good to modern society.

Western values are based on the capitalist private ownership of means of production. Only the capitalist market economy can guarantee the realization of the values of democracy, freedom, equality, and human rights. It regards capitalism as the best system of human society, and advocates that the capitalist system is the common value pursued by mankind. The west is individual-oriented, emphasizing self-reliance. The central principle of modern western liberalism morality is the priority of individual rights. It advocates that everyone has the right to conduct activities according to his own values. It is against the basic individual freedom to require all citizens with a common concept.³⁶ In the comparison between European values and Eastern values, it can be found that European values contain individualism and human rights, which is in sharp contrast to the collectivism tendency of the East.

³⁴ *Ideology*. Baidu Encyclopedia. <https://baike.baidu.com/item/意识形态>

³⁵ *Deeply understand the nature and soul of socialist core values*. 2015. Guangming Daily, 2015.

³⁶ *What are Chinese values? How is it different from Western values?* People's Daily, 2015.

Based on the above analysis of different social cultures, social ideologies, and values, the analysis of the differences between Western Europe's interpretation of the French Revolution and China's are divided into five parts (A, B, C, D, E) as the followings:

A. When you analyze the theme of revolutionary history, what is the most important theoretical basis to support you?

When Chinese historians study and analyze revolutionary themes, they usually use Marxism as the theoretical basis. Because China is the ideology of Marxism. Take an example to see how to use Marxist theory to analyze the importance of confiscation of Catholic property in the French Revolution. An important theory of Marxism is the discussion of economic foundation and superstructure. The economic basis refers to the sum of the productive relations determined by the productive forces; the superstructure refers to the ideology based on the economic basis and the corresponding systems, organizations, and facilities, which mainly refers to the political and legal systems and facilities in the class society. The economic base determines the superstructure. Because the economic basis determines the superstructure, we can draw the conclusion that the most deadly blow to Catholicism in the French Revolution came from the confiscation of its property so that Catholicism naturally lost the ability to engage in political, legal, institutional and other aspects, such as making tax system, supporting the feudal dynasty, appointing archbishops and other rights; Western scholars did not like Chinese scholars to emphasize which aspect is the most important, whether in the right to appoint bishops, or confiscation of land and property, and so on.³⁷

B. Discussing the theme of revolution usually emphasizes that it is caused by class conflict

According to the Chinese high school history textbook, "such a great revolution did not happen by chance but was the result of the development and struggle of the class contradiction which was gestated for a long time in French society. Chinese scholars will think that the main reason for the French Revolution is the result of the long-standing opposition of class contradictions. It is that the working people are oppressed and exploited for a long time, leading to their inability to survive and finally revolt, leading to the destruction of the feudal dynasty and the birth of a new social system.

According to our analysis of the content of ideology, it is the reflection of the economic foundation and political system of society and the economic relationship between people. Various forms of ideology originate from the social material life based on productive labor and reflect the real social

³⁷ Shou Fu, Li. *The Differences, Origins and Influences of Chinese and Western Cultural Traditions*. Beijing University, 2019.

life from different aspects. At that time, the French society had no livelihood and the class contradiction became increasingly prominent, which ultimately failed to reconcile the contradiction between the feudal lord and the proletariat. When the production relationship has become a shackle that seriously hinders the development of productive forces, there is a sharp contradiction between the superstructure and the trend of fundamental change required by the economic foundation. This contradiction can only be solved by social revolution, overthrowing the old regime, and changing the old superstructure.³⁸

C. Generally speaking, people are the main force of the revolution and the driving force of social development. And we should emphasize the question of who to serve because ideology has class nature.

Marx and Engels pointed out that "all movements in the past were those of or for the benefit of minorities. The proletarian movement is an independent movement for the benefit of the overwhelming majority. Therefore, in the historical analysis of the French Revolution, the role of the masses is often emphasized. According to Chinese high school textbooks, "the people have shown great power, repeatedly saving the revolution from the crisis and pushing it forward." This is rare in the analysis of the French Revolution by western scholars. According to western literature, we can see that the people who took part in the French Revolution at that time came from all walks of life. But Marx and Engels' concentrated generalization of proletarian outlook on life and values is to seek interests for the vast majority of people, so we can say that this movement is seeking interests for the majority of proletarians, which is the most fully reflected in the socialist core values. Therefore, the discussion should also focus on the proletarians.

And we must emphasize the question of who we serve because ideology has a class nature. Either the maintenance of the existing political system or the criticism of the existing political system. For example, the news that happened in the United States now, the US VOA radio station reported the news that Wuhan, China, celebrated the unblocking of the city by eliminating the coronavirus, and Grand celebration scene. President Trump gave serious criticism on Twitter and pointedly pointed out that radio and news should serve the United States, not praise China because you take money from the US government. If you report good news about China again, you will not get funding in the future. This should be rare in western countries that pursue freedom, equality, and democracy. But this fact is in line with Marxist theory, ideology has a class nature, and the question of who it serves-whether it is capitalism or socialism.³⁹

D. The discussion of revolutionary themes usually emphasizes something of historical significance to highlight an event that has reached the goal of emphasis.

³⁸ Yu, li. *How to evaluate the French Revolution?* 2017.

³⁹ Journal of Zhejiang University. Apr.1999.

On July 14, 1789, the uprising people of Paris captured the Bastille, a prison symbolizing feudal rule, marking the beginning of the victory of the French Revolution. In China's history textbook of the French Revolution, the capture and occupation of Bastille are very important, which is an important symbol of the French Revolution. In Western books, it was described that Bastille only held a few prisoners at the time, so the capture of Bastille was not as important as described by Chinese historians. Because China is an ancient civilization with a history of 5,000 years, people often endow historical sites with great historical significance. For example, there are various murder cases in every country, such as the case of immigrants in the Netherlands in 2019 who are not adapted to local life, causing a great sensation. If it happened in a city in China, it would not cause the same sensation. On the contrary, if it happened in a symbolic place, such as historical sites, the Great Wall, Tiananmen Gate, etc., it would have a shocking effect. That's because Chinese people pay more attention to the meaning of symbolic things. In the eyes of scholars, the former Bastille is a prison in China. Controlling it symbolizes the key to controlling Paris. Therefore, the Bastille became the symbol of the French autocratic Dynasty. Its decline means the end of the feudal dynasty, which is of great significance. Although western scholars also believe that the Bastille, as a national prison, is a symbol of authoritarianism and represents a lot of things to Parisians, its occupation is a huge victory, but the weight given by Eastern and Western scholars to the occupation of Bastille is quite different. Oriental scholars give more weight.⁴⁰

E. The analysis of the Western Revolution often ends up mentioning the negative educational significance and the lessons learned and its shortcomings, because this is also determined by ideology and values since only socialism has superiority.

“In the French Revolution, it was the French people character who like to go to extremes, which caused the mass movement to trigger uncontrolled and unrestrained radical actions, which led to the destruction of the democratic order and legal system, causing political turmoil and social chaos. Irrational mass movements, if they embark on extreme roads, may become uncontrollable forces and cause serious damage to social stability. This is a profound experience and lesson that future generations must remember”.⁴¹

From the above examples, we can see those different ideologies have different understanding and cognition of the same thing, and ideology always points to reality, either to the maintenance of the political system or to the criticism of the political system. Ideology has a distinct class function. Generally, social moral values form the basis of ideology. In class society, different classes have different values. Values have the characteristics of stability and persistence, historicity and selectivity,

⁴⁰ *How to evaluate the French Revolution?* Journal of Zhejiang University. Apr.1999.

⁴¹ Yu, li. *How to evaluate the French Revolution?* 2017.

subjectivity. Therefore, the above examples and theories show that the conflict between socialism and capitalist ideology will be staged for a long time. In the end, it will affect Chinese scholars' and Western scholars' analysis of the theme of historical revolution.

- Theological debate on the relationship between church and state

Religion is an important political aspect of French society. Starting from the ancient regime before the French Revolution, religion has always played an important role in politics in many different historical periods and under the rule of many different governments.⁴² Human beings have the power and the right to overthrow the ethical life of their own times, but no one knows who has the right to destroy ethics. The world is basically as it should be. Even though the ties and control of the Church over political matters were loosening by the 1780s, the connection between politics and religion in France still became intertwined.⁴³

Dissatisfaction with the Catholic Church, influenced by the mixture of religious intellectual ideals and new religious groups, led to the establishment of a new religious-political structure in French society. With the joint efforts of Jansenism and Deism movement, Catholicism lost its power status after centuries of political control. Therefore, it symbols the end of the French traditional religion and the start of non-traditional secular religion as the focus of political power.⁴⁴

As a form of consolidating power, religion changed with the decline of the original political structure. During his reign, Napoleon used more than one religion for political confirmation. Even though Napoleon's religious policy changed throughout his regime, religion and power remained a recurring theme. Napoleon's political rule will continue the role played by the French religion, and won the support of French people through religious ceremonies and language. This form of political action is consistent with the ancient regime and the revolutionary government due to the maintenance of Catholic-based performances.⁴⁵

The language and rituals of Catholicism are particularly important for the use of religion for political power. Despite many changes in French society, the traditional Catholic ritual structure and language have been preserved to popularize the new political structure. The emergence of the Napoleon Empire created a new way to use religion in politics, such as the agreement in 1801, which not only established his position as the leader of France but also established his status as the representative of

⁴² Weight, Alexa. *God and Revolution: Religion and Power from PreRevolutionary France to the Napoleonic Empire*. Western Oregon University, 2017, 23-24.

⁴³ Gascoigne, Robert. *Religion, rationality and community: sacred and secular in the thought of Hegel and his critics*. The Hague: Nijhoff, 1985, 23-24, 59-62.

⁴⁴ Weight, Alexa. *God and Revolution: Religion and Power from PreRevolutionary France to the Napoleonic Empire*. 2017, 19-20, 34.

⁴⁵ Weight, Alexa. *God and Revolution: Religion and Power from PreRevolutionary France to the Napoleonic Empire*. 2017, 35.

the Catholic Church in France. The agreement between Napoleon and Pope Pius VII even Napoleon even declared “the Catholic Church the best religion for the maintaining of democracy. The Roman Catholic religion is the only one able to procure real happiness to a well-ordered society and to strengthen the bases of good government.” Napoleon's alliance with the Catholic Church was a method of realizing political ambition. The political agreement brought together the church and the state in France, with each party recognizing each other.⁴⁶

Although great changes have taken place in French politics, one major aspect of French political power remains unchanged: the maintenance of religious rituals and the use of language in order to consolidate political power. It shows the importance of religion and politics in French history. From the ancient regime to the French Revolution to the Napoleonic Empire, there are social and political differences, but religion has always been a major and recurring theme. The use of religion to consolidate power has made religion a major idea in French history. There are two different ways in which religion is used in politics: liturgy and religious language.⁴⁷

The new revolutionary calendar replaced the old Catholic calendar and led to a new religious and political environment. Although it was not anti-religious, it was anti-clerical. This anti-clerical sentiment has led to massive desecration in French society. One of the important reasons is the fear that the Catholic Church will regain power because, in the ancient regime, the Catholic Church was politically intertwined with the French monarchy. Only by accepting the secular world as the legal stage can Christianity maintain its loyalty to itself. All Christian truths can be associated with modern people's political activities. The combination of religion and secular humanism was also the reconciliation of the French Revolution and its response to the revolution. It advocates the existence and power of divinity, as well as human freedom and dignity. Because religion is the absolute realized in the finite spiritual activities (through the image of feeling and sensibility), religion cannot oppose rational thinking and secular ethics, and people's worship of God can not oppose their own activities.⁴⁸

3. Conclusion

In general, on July 14, 1789, the French Revolution (Révolution française) broke out and the Republic was founded. During the French revolution, the political system of France changed dramatically, overthrowing the traditional monarchy, aristocracy and Catholic decree, and finally reached a climax in the period of Napoleon's dictatorship. During the French Revolution, the National Assembly took over the property of the church, the land of the church was confiscated, and the Civil Constitution of

⁴⁶ Weight, Alexa. *God and Revolution: Religion and Power from PreRevolutionary France to the Napoleonic Empire*. 2017, 32,36, 38.

⁴⁷ Weight, Alexa. *God and Revolution: Religion and Power from PreRevolutionary France to the Napoleonic Empire*. 2017, 44-45.

⁴⁸ Gascoigne, Robert. *Religion, rationality and community: sacred and secular in the thought of Hegel and his critics*. The Hague: Nijhoff, 1985, 59-62.

the Clergy was published. The Pope lost the right to appoint priests and bishops in France, and then the law abolished the traditional Gregorian calendar and Christian festivals. All of these could be seen as non-Christian processes. Since the National Assembly put the church under the control of the state in 1789, France had been in a state of division, all of which had caused great social instability in France.

Because Bonaparte realized that the French were tired of religious conflicts and that reconciliation with the Catholic Church could consolidate his dominance, he also understood that reconciliation with the pope would bring him immediate benefits, so Napoleon was determined to reach a reconciliation with the Catholic Church and end the division. According to him, if he were to rule the Jewish people, he would rebuild the Temple of Solomon. According to his other sentence, unless someone tells people that it is God's will, people cannot accept wealth inequality in society. He believed that religion was one of the main means of controlling society. He also thought that there was no society without morality, and only religion could guarantee morality. But religion had to be in the hands of the government, and he had to have greater authority than the Pope. Bonaparte tried to rebuild a disciplined church, nominally subordinate to the Pope but in fact, the Pope obeyed him (In the eyes of outsiders, the French Catholic Church is under the leadership of the Pope. In fact, according to the Concordat and Organic Articles, all matters concerning the religious affairs must be approved by the government), so that he could not only win the favor of French Catholics but also put French Catholicism under the control of the government and control Rome politically. By contrast, Pope Pius VII, the leader of the Catholic Church, proposed that the revolutionary idea should not conflict with Catholicism. Pius VII agreed to rebuild the Roman Catholicism in France. In 1801, Napoleon signed the concordat with Pope Pius VII in Paris, and the hostility of Catholicism to the country was basically over.

Bonaparte's aim was to seek to consolidate the achievements of the French Revolution and his regime under its leadership through the concordat, confirming the disposal of church property, the appointment of bishops and the reorganization of parishes, while Rome sought to protect the Catholic Church and demanded recognition of its special status in France. Napoleon acknowledged that Catholicism is the religion of most French people, but as part of the Concordat, he put forward another set of laws, called Organic Articles, which was published in 1802 as a unilateral additional article. Its purpose was to control the concordat better by the state, so as to help the state monitor the Catholic or Protestants movement or activities that might do harmful things politically. The concordat and the affiliated articles increased the authority of the state at the expense of the interests of the church, weakened the privileges and wealth of the church, and supported the principle of religious tolerance and the authority of the state in religion. Therefore, it effectively safeguarded the achievements, principles, and ideals of the French Revolution, and realized almost all Napoleon's wishes.

The concrete impact of the concordat and the Organic Articles was to consolidate the achievements of the French Revolution and further strengthen the rule of Bonaparte through a series of restrictions on Catholicism. In the early days of the French Revolution, in order to eradicate the old

feudal system (A political system in which the monarch divided the land among the clans and heroes. Large landowners or lords can earn income from land and exercise government functions and powers on their land.) , the National Assembly issued a series of orders, including the reform policy for the Catholic Church. The French Revolution not only brought a heavy blow to the Catholic Church but also to the old system of the country. These policies had serious impacts on the old feudal system in various fields of economy, politics, religion, ideology, and culture. The concordat played an important role in consolidating these policies.

Firstly, during the French Revolution, the nationalization and sale of church property and the abolition of church tithes not only destroyed the church power economically but also made the old feudal system lose its strong support. After the church property was sold, the French land ownership changed qualitatively: the feudal hierarchical ownership became capitalist private ownership, thus, the economic foundation on which the old feudal system depended on was destroyed and disintegrated. According to the agreement, the 1801 concordat forced the church to agree to give up the claim of lost land, and the lost donations during the revolution were not returned. Bonaparte also forced the Pope to accept the inviolability of the rights of new owners of church property that had been sold during the revolution. The agreement consolidated the practices of the French revolution and helped Napoleon achieve social and political control.

Secondly, in terms of religion, the Declaration on the Rights of Man in the revolution of 1789 established the principle of religious tolerance and stipulated that no one's opinions could be disturbed even in religion. The church reform policy itself was a denial of religious theocracy, the status of the state religion was abolished, the theory of monarchy, the supremacy of the church and even the old feudal system itself collapsed, and the subordinate relationship between the French church and the Holy See was weakened. In this way, in terms of ideology and culture, the religious reform policy ended the monopoly position of the church, the principle of religious tolerance was established in the period of the French revolution, which was further confirmed and consolidated by the concordat of 1801. According to the stipulation of the principle, although Catholicism was declared as the religion of the vast majority of French people, it was not the official religion of France, so as to guarantee religious freedom. It can be seen that the concordat of 1801 adhered to the principle of religious tolerance to a large extent.

Thirdly the economic base determines the superstructure. During the French Revolution, the Catholic church lost its property, which means it lost its economic base. Therefore, the church could not continue its superstructure politically. The church reform policy denied the privileged status of the clergy, deprived the secular power of religion and made it dependent on the state. The Pope lost the right to appoint priests and bishops in France. The Archbishop would be nominated by the government, but the Pope would sanctify the nominees. The vicar was appointed by the bishop with the approval of the government. Bonaparte tried to rebuild a disciplined church, nominally obedient to the Pope, but

only if the Pope obeyed him and needed his protection. Bonaparte personally selected all these bishops to cooperate with the diocese he planned to rebuild. The redefinition of Diocese was based on the diocese boundary established during the French Revolution, which eliminated the inequality existing in the ancient system, that is, the inequality between some very rich bishops and many poor bishops. During the French Revolution, after nationalizing and abolishing the tithe of church land, the Assemble promised to support the church financially. The wages of bishops and priests were guaranteed by the constitution, and they would perform their duties free of charge. By contrast, in 1801, the concordat made clergy, including bishops and priests, state employees. The state paid the clergy, so all clergy were subject to state power. Their appointment would depend on the country, Bonaparte and his government, not the Pope because they had no choice. According to the Civil Constitution of the Clergy during the French revolution, the clergy were required to swear allegiance to France and support the constitution promulgated by the National Assembly. In the same way, the concordat ordered all clergy to pray for the country and the Consul at the end of each mass. Bonaparte believed that the status of the clergy who declared allegiance to the government had changed and that they could be seen as allies of obedience and once again as an important part of the state's ideological institutions.⁴⁹

Fourthly, as part of the concordat of 1801, Napoleon proposed another set of articles, called Organic Articles. They were published in 1802 as a unilateral add-on to the concordat. It was a method of Napoleon to propose additional parts, that was, additional terms increase Napoleon's control over church activities. According to these provisions, without the prior permission of the state, no papal or government document could be published in France, no assembly of the clergy could be held without the permission of the government, even the date of religious festivals had to be decided with the consent of the state, and the state had the final decision right on religious affairs. Although these Organic Articles were not approved by the Pope, they further enhanced the dominance of Bonaparte.⁵⁰

For the analysis of the French Revolution, scholars in the East and the West will be somewhat different. Because there are differences in thinking between the East and the West, and each culture has its own characteristics. Every society has its own ideology. Ideology is directional and always points to reality. It is either to maintain the existing political system or to criticize the existing political system. Different ideologies have different understandings of the same thing. Ideology is directly related to the economy and politics of a society. Different social groups and classes have different ideologies because

⁴⁹ Lyons, Martyn. *Napoleon Bonaparte and the Legacy of the French Revolution*. St. Martin's Press, New York, 1994, 77-93. Coppa, Frank J. *Controversial Concordats: The Vatican's Relations with Napoleon, Mussolini, and Hitler*. Catholic University of America Press, 1999, 34-80. Hunt, Jocelyn. *The French Revolution: Questions and Analysis in History*. Hoboken: Routledge, 1998, 1-13.

⁵⁰ Lyons, Martyn. *Napoleon Bonaparte and the Legacy of the French Revolution*. St. Martin's Press, New York, 1994. Chapter 7. Coppa, Frank J. *Controversial Concordats: The Vatican's Relations with Napoleon, Mussolini, and Hitler*. Catholic University of America Press, 1999, 34-80. *Concordat of 1801*. Encyclopedia of Modern Europe: Europe 1789-1914: Encyclopedia of the Age of Industry and Empire. Encyclopedia.com. (March 29, 2020). Retrieved from <https://www.encyclopedia.com/history/encyclopedias-almanacs-transcripts-and-maps/concordat-1801>

of their different interests. Ideology is based on values, and different classes have different values. Therefore, these differences in social culture, ideology, and values will affect the analysis of the French Revolution by Chinese and European scholars.

As for other views on the relationships between church and state: Starting from the ancient regime before the French Revolution, religion has always played an important role in politics in many different historical periods and under the rule of many different governments. The language and rituals of Catholicism are particularly important for the use of religion for political power. Napoleon's alliance with the Catholic Church was a method of realizing political ambition. The political agreement brought together the church and the state in France, with each party recognizing each other. Although great changes have taken place in French politics, one major aspect of French political power remains unchanged: the maintenance of religious rituals and the use of language in order to consolidate political power. All Christian truths can be associated with modern people's political activities. The combination of religion and secular humanism was also the reconciliation of the French Revolution and its response to the revolution. Because religion is the absolute realized in the finite spiritual activities, religion cannot oppose rational thinking and secular ethics, and people's worship of God can not oppose their own activities

In conclusion, the concordat signed by Napoleon Bonaparte and Pope Pius VII on July 15, 1801 and the subsequent additional provisions influenced the political and religious relations in France. The concordat tried to reconcile the religious conflicts that had plagued France since the beginning of the French Revolution in 1789. According to the concordat, the Catholic Church agreed to the disposal of church property, the principle of religious tolerance, the right to appoint bishops, and the minister became a national employee and swore allegiance to the country. The redefinition of the diocese had eliminated the privileges and unfair wealth of a few rich bishops. Although Catholicism is declared to be the religion of the vast majority of French people, it was not the official religion of France, thus guaranteeing religious freedom, especially for Protestants. Although the Pope had the right to invest them with their spiritual authority, it has no practical significance. In addition, according to the Organic Articles, the state would have the final decision-making power on religious affairs, which would eventually lead to the clergy's dependence on the government. The concordat leaned firmly to Napoleon, not only did not restore the privileges and status of the church, but also greatly weakened the authority of the Pope, achieved what the early revolutionaries expected, maintained the principles and ideals of the revolution, and strengthened the ruling rights of the current regime.⁵¹

⁵¹ Coppa, Frank J. *Controversial Concordats: The Vatican's Relations with Napoleon, Mussolini, and Hitler*. Catholic University of America Press, 1999, 34-80

Bibliography

- An Imperial Revival: government and Religion under the Reign of Napoleon*. Retrieved from http://archive2.armstrong.edu/archive/Initiatives/history_journal/history_journal_an_imperial_revival_government_and_religion_under_the_reign.html#:~:text=He%20stated%20that%20he%20was,Pope%20and%20the%20full%20backing. (Accessed on June 8, 2020)
- Burke, Edmund. *Reflections on the Reflections in France*. South Bend: infomotions, Inc, 2000.
- Carlyle, Thomas & Scurr, Ruth. *The French Revolutions*. London; New York: Continuum, 2010.
- Civil Constitution of the Clergy*. New Catholic Encyclopedia. Encyclopedia.com. Retrieved from <https://www.encyclopedia.com/religion/encyclopedias-almanacs-transcripts-and-maps/civil-constitution-clergy> (accessed on March 27, 2020).
- Coppa, Frank J. *Controversial Concordats: The Vatican's Relations with Napoleon, Mussolini, and Hitler*. Washington, District of Columbia: Catholic University of America Press, 1999, 47.
- Concordat of 1801*. Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia. Retrieved from https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Concordat_of_1801. (accessed on March 29, 2020).
- Chapman-Adisho, Annette. *Patriot and Priest: Jean-Baptiste Volfius and the Constitutional Church in the Côte-D'or*. McGill-Queen's University Press, 2020.
- Concordat of 1801*. Encyclopedia of Modern Europe: Europe 1789-1914: Encyclopedia of the Age of Industry and Empire. Encyclopedia.com. Retrieved from <https://www.encyclopedia.com/history/encyclopedias-almanacs-transcripts-and-maps/concordat-1801> (accessed on March 29, 2020).
- "Concordat of 1801 ." Encyclopedia of Modern Europe: Europe 1789-1914: Encyclopedia of the Age of Industry and Empire . . Encyclopedia.com. (February 9, 2020). <https://www.encyclopedia.com/history/encyclopedias-almanacs-transcripts-and-maps/concordat-1801>
- Dwyer, Philip and McPhee, Peter. *The French Revolution and Napoleon: A Sourcebook*. London: Routledge, 2002.
- Deeply understand the nature and soul of socialist core values.2015*. Guangming Daily, 2015.
- Edict of Nantes*. Retrieved from the free encyclopedia. [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Edict_of_Nantes#:~:text=The%20Edict%20of%20Nantes%20\(French,e ssentially%20Catholic%20at%20the%20time](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Edict_of_Nantes#:~:text=The%20Edict%20of%20Nantes%20(French,e ssentially%20Catholic%20at%20the%20time). (Accessed on July 12, 2020).
- Encyclopedia of the Early Modern World. Encyclopedia.com. (July 10, 2020). <https://www.encyclopedia.com/history/encyclopedias-almanacs-transcripts-and-maps/gallicanism>. (Accessed on July 12, 2020)
- French Revolution*. Retrieved from https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/French_Revolution. Accessed on Jun 1, 2020)

Gascoigne, Robert. *Religion, rationality and community : sacred and secular in the thought of Hegel and his critics*. The Hague: Nijhoff, 1985, 59-62.

Hunt, Jocelyn. *The French Revolution: Questions and Analysis in History*. Hoboken: Routledge, 1998.

How to evaluate the French Revolution? Journal of Zhejiang University. Apr.1999.

Ideology. Baidu Encyclopedia. <https://baike.baidu.com/item/意识形态>

Lyons, Martyn. *Napoleon Bonaparte and the Legacy of the French Revolution*. St. Martin's Press, New York, 1994.

“*Making Peace with the Catholic Church, 1801–2*,” Liberty, Equality, Fraternity, accessed February 9, 2020, <http://chnm.gmu.edu/revolution/d/504>.

McPhee, Peter. *A Companion to the French Revolution: Blackwell Companions to European History Ser.* John Wiley & Sons, Incorporated, 2012.

Mignet, Francois-Auguste. *History of the French Revolution from 1789 to 1814*. Kindle Edition, 2006.

McPhee, Peter. *The French Revolution: 1789-1799*. Oxford; New York : Oxford University Press, 2002.

Methodology of the Literature Review. Retrieved from

<https://study.sagepub.com/sites/default/files/Onwuegbuzie%20%26%20Frels.pdf> (accessed on Jun 8, 2020)

Organic Articles. Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia. Retrieved from

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Organic_Articles. (accessed 23 February 2020)

Revolution and Rebellion list. Retrieved from [zh. wikipedia.org/wiki/革命和叛乱列表](https://zh.wikipedia.org/wiki/革命和叛乱列表). (accessed on Jun 8, 2020).

The Organic Articles. Catholic Encyclopedia, Free World Class Education. Retrieved from

<https://www.catholic.org/encyclopedia/view.php?id=8774> (accessed on 7, June)

Shou Fu, Li. *The Differences, Origins and Influences of Chinese and Western Cultural Traditions*. Beijing University, 2019.

Stone, Bailey. *Reinterpreting the French Revolution: A global-historical perspective*. University of Houston. Cambridge, U.K.; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002.

The economic base and the superstructure. Retrieved from <https://baike.baidu.com/item/经济基础与上层建筑/1947805?fr=aladdin>. (accessed 25 March 2020)

Values. *Popular Science China, Science Encyclopedia*. <https://baike.baidu.com/item/价值观#:~:text=价值观是基于人的,认知和需求状况%E3%80%82>.

What are Chinese values? How is it different from Western values? People's Daily, 2015.

War in the Vendée. Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/War_in_the_Vend%C3%A9e (Accessed on July 16, 2020)

Weight, Alexa. *God and Revolution: Religion and Power from PreRevolutionary France to the Napoleonic Empire*. Western Oregon University, 2017.

Yu, li. *How to evaluate the French Revolution?* 2017.

Yubo, Hou. *The Theoretical and Practical Basis of Eastern and Western Thinking Differences*. 2009. *Methodology of the Literature Review*. Retrieved from <https://study.sagepub.com/sites/default/files/Onwuegbuzie%20%26%20Frels.pdf> (accessed on Jun 8, 2020)