(Re)Framing Gangsterism in the Western Cape: Facilitating a Dialogue between Local Government and Ex-Gang Members

Lin van Schalkwyk

ANR: 528760

Supervisor: dr. P.G.M. van Eck-

Aarten Co-supervisor: Irma Cleven

Victimology and Criminal Justice: Master Thesis

May 2016

NOTES ON APPROACH

This dissertation is part of the requirements for a Master's degree in Victimology and Criminal Justice at Tilburg University. It was written by Lin van Schalkwyk, supervised by dr. van Eck-Aarten and co-supervised by Irma Cleven.

The dissertation formed part of an overarching thesis circle on 'victim-offender overlap'. The circle was led by dr. van Eck Aarten and Irma Cleven. The circle consisted of three students, namely Bo Gijsen, Ninja Nuhn and Lin van Schalkwyk. Thesis circle meetings were held at designated stages of the writing process. During these meetings, students were asked to give feedback on each other's work and to make recommendations on how to improve writing style, literature use, data analysis, etc. Both dr. van Eck-Aarten and Irma Cleven also gave feedback during these meetings and sent written feedback to all students.

The supervisors and students of the thesis circle proofread (excerpts of) this dissertation throughout all ongoing phases of the study.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In August 2015, I had set foot on Tilburg University campus for the first time. I was far from home (South Africa), a stranger to the city and completely new to the academic world of victimology and what it had to offer. I was excited about the multidisciplinary nature of victimology, its fluidity, its recognition of the world *as is* and not only how it should be. While the law so often aims to direct the world in a normative manner, I found the empirical questioning throughout victimology so incredibly valuable, so necessary. Victimology is *law in action*. It is law made alive. But it is also something that exists before and beyond the law, that transcends and outlives laws. Victimology is an undeniable part of life— the countless victims of countless crimes, the victims of natural disasters, victims of war and armed conflict, victims of stigmatization, marginalization and disadvantage, victims of economic systems that do not serve them, the list goes on and on. Victimology is a large and crucial part of life. Yet, regardless of the harm, pain and suffering that victimology may imply, it is also one of the greatest sources to inspire change, to fuel empathy, to rethink and to reimagine countless worlds. I thank victimology, in its infinity, for opening up this door, these many doors. For making heard what needs to be heard, and for showing what needs to be shown. Thank you.

I would also like to thank and acknowledge my home country, South Africa. Regardless of past segregations, regardless of the ongoing struggles that there will always be between people, South Africa and her people have undeniably shaped me and allowed me the vast inner landscape from which I continue to learn and grow. For this reason and many others, I thank South Africa and all my fellow South Africans. You have breathed life into my veins and have always given me more than enough reason to fight for us. To fight for justice, to fight for voice and to fight for healing. Healing of the self, healing of our fellows, of communities, of generations, of nations. Thank you for having guided me through life's labyrinths, for continuing to be a home to me, a place of return.

I also thank my dear friend and colleague, Nanine Steenkamp, for her willingness to share past research with me, for always sending heaps of inspiration, articles, ideas, and quality conversation my way. It has been such a support to talk to you and to have you by my side throughout this entire process. You understand the subtle complexities of life and of our country. Your work ethic is impeccable, your kind and honest nature unequivocally loyal to service, and your character remains one of inspiration wherever you go. Thank you for allowing me to share

in your journeys and for being witness to my own.

To my supervisor, Pauline van Eck-Aarten, you have been a true Master of guidance and unconditional support. Your sensitivity toward the topic of victim-offender overlap provided such a solid foundation for this study. Thank you for making this thesis circle available to us students. It is such an important intersection in the long and winding road of victimological research.

To both Pauline and Irma who co-supervised this thesis, thank you for guiding me, listening to my questions, calming my habitual uncertainties and being such an inviting light at the end of each relentless writing tunnel. I could not have asked for more.

To all my friends and fellow pilgrims — for listening, for being excited about this work with me, for being supportive and for asserting so much strength and insane amounts of inspiration in the times when the going got tough. *Conversations with my friends*…What a memoire that would be! Thank you.

Finally, To Maarten Deleye, who has been nothing but good to me since the day we met. Your unending ability to listen, to support and to encourage has been such a source of inspiration and calm throughout this entire journey. Through your example, you have shown me such an unworldly love, a love which inspires and motivates me to grow and expand, infinitely. The harbour that you give, makes many of my journeys away from home and comfort possible. May we always keep on moving, learning and expanding — alongside and together with one another.

To any reader of this dissertation, I thank you as well. It is hard to put so much energy and commitment into a project that may not be read more than a handful of times. Of course, this dissertation is merely a small and timely part of the many kaleidoscopic endeavours of victimology, the ever-growing and endless roads of research and value. As the road widens and change persists, I thank you— for at this very moment, standing still at these pages, which ultimately form but a brief moment in time. Thank you.

PREFACE

One of the earliest Roman deities was a god named Janus. Within ancient Roman religion, Janus was "the god of the beginnings and the ends" and was believed to preside "over every entrance and departure" (Wasson, 2015, para. 5). Every door and every passageway was thought to be guarded by Janus. He was, (as I like to believe) 'the god of the thresholds'. Insofar as each threshold holds the existence of two worlds, i.e. the world that exists before the threshold and the world that exists beyond it, Janus was also believed to have two faces – one for each of the two worlds he presided over. And so he later became known as "the god who looked both ways" (Wasson, 2015, para. 5).

Today, we still refer to Janus and his two-faced nature, although no longer with sole reference to his deity. We now call upon Janus in our attempts to conceive of dissonance. We refer to things as Janus-faced when we assert that it has two (often contradicting sides); sides that each tell a different story and that each look out on a different truth. We call on Janus to describe polarity, to illustrate the existence of two different interpretative spaces, often standing in contrast or tension with one another. And it is here, precisely within the recognition of this modern-day Janus, that I first embarked on the writing of this dissertation.

The current dissertation was motivated by a deep-felt acknowledgement of the Janus-faced realities facing my home province in Western Cape, South Africa. Often, as I had worked on this study, I could see in my mind's eye – Janus, standing there – presiding over the social landscapes of the Cape. There I imagined him, guarding the many thresholds that divide social prosperity from social decay; his two faces painted in the style of theatre masks – showing both a laughing and a weeping face. Looking one way, he sees a South African province with foreigners "lounging on palm-lined Camps Bay beach, gazing at the steep mountains framed by gossamer clouds" (Pinnock, 2016, p.2). Looking the other way, he observes countless drug wars, human trafficking, rival gang-shoot-outs and poverty, no more than a stone throw away from where the lounging foreigners sit (Pinnock, 2016). Don Pinnock so plainly describes the City of Cape Town in his recent book entitled *Gang Town* (2016) that I cannot help but clearly recognize the faces of Janus in his words, as he writes:

> […] my adopted city had changed almost beyond recognition. On the one hand it is now more attractive, with many of the country's best restaurants, clubs and coffee shops. It is

> consistently rated in the top 10 international tourist destinations and celebrities from abroad are often seen strolling along its waterfront, tanning on its beaches or enjoying themselves on elegant wine farms nearby. […] Many foreigners, charmed by its languid atmosphere and with strong First World currencies, have bought see-facing homes they'd never afford back home. For holidaymakers it's easy Africa, offering the amenities of Europe or America with added sunshine and the spice of adventure. But the city has also become increasingly violent. As the sun dips in the west, the iconic mountains cast a dark shadow across the Cape Flats and some of the most dangerous neighbourhoods in the world. […] In overcrowded townships the chance of death by violence is now higher than in some of the world's most volatile war zones. Here statistics trump hyperbole. (Pinnock, 2016, p.2-3)

This dissertation is not about the Western Cape's elegance, grandeur or charm. It is about facing the world of tragedy and social decay that lies on the other side. Taken even further, it is about recognizing that there is in fact no 'other side'. There is no 'other world' to be denied or silenced by those in the Western Cape who are lucky enough to not suffer from it. There is only but *one Western Cape,* albeit one of relentless disparities. And so I argue that there is an urgent need for both these worlds to acknowledge each other; to engage and to be accountable to one another. For as far as the Western Cape belongs to all its citizens, there will be no victory in denial.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

The Western Cape province of South Africa is considered home to some of the most dangerous gang-affected neighbourhoods in the world (Pinnock, 2016). Through the continuation of large scale violence and crime, Western Cape gangsterism has notoriously advanced to being a key player in the creation of perplexity and social desolation (See Kinnes, 1996; Pinnock, 1997). The debilitating role that gangsterism is seen to play in school functioning (Magidi, 2014), family relationships (Magidi, 2014) and social control by the state (Lambrechts, 2013), presents but a few examples of the many ways in which gangsterism threatens to dismantle the very social fabric that helps to make the very notion of community possible.

The widespread impact and "entrenched presence" of gangsterism in the Western Cape (Redpath, 2001, p.34) has led the Western Cape Government to insistently call for intervention. While the Western Cape Government (WCG or local government) continues to signal the calamities of damage and distress, gangsterism nevertheless continues to destabilize communities through violence, crime and social disorganization (Lambrechts, 2013; Magidi, 2014; Pinnock, 2016). At present, numerous governmental projects and interventions have been introduced in an attempt to counter gangsterism in the province. These have included afterschool programmes and recreational activities aimed at high school learners, urban transformation projects aimed at the development of infrastructure and service-delivery in disadvantaged communities, and the WCG's continued attempts to reinstate specialized gang-units in the province. Notwithstanding these attempts, the prevalence and threat of gangsterism has nevertheless been seen to persist.

While the WCG continues to engage in dialogues with local and national stakeholders on how best to respond to the problem of gangsterism (Lambrechts, 2013), these responses have been argued by critics to be predominantly reactive, insofar as they do not allow for the necessary inclusion of target-group members in the planning and/ or implementation of anti-gang policies and interventions (Van Wyk & Theron, 2005). It has also been suggested that the exclusion of target-group members has led to crucial differences in how the WCG understands the problem of gangsterism, compared to how it is understood or experienced by target-group members themselves (Daniels & Adams, 2010; Pinnock, 2016; Standing, 2003). Henceforth, an important task is to investigate the extent to which these possible disparities do in fact exist; and if they do, to ask what can be done to counter them.

This study sets out to aid in the development of a more inclusive and integrated understanding of Western Cape gangsterism. In recognizing that the local government could benefit from the inclusion of target-group members in order to help produce or give effect to real solutions, a first thought was directed toward accessing gangs or gang-members themselves. However, due to the existing tensions in power dynamics between state actors and gangs (Lambrechts, 2013), this presented a somewhat unattainable task. Furthermore, the difficulties in accessing gangs became further exacerbated in the knowledge that many gangs have advanced to organized crime syndicates (See Kinnes, 2000; Lambrechts, 2013; Standing 2006). With the metamorphosis of street gangs into criminal empires (Kinnes, 2000), the likelihood of facilitating a functional dialogue between local government and existing gang members therefore remains an understandably questionable endeavour for researchers.

Given these difficulties, this dissertation aims to redirect the possibility of target-group member inclusion, by attempting to facilitate a dialogue between the WCG and ex-gang members of the Western Cape. It is argued here that a focus on ex-gang members could likely aid in establishing a much needed inclusion of target-group members, albeit through a slightly different angle. Focusing on this target-group may not only provide insights into why individuals become gang members, but may also reveal some of the factors that lead to gang members' desistance — both of which may aid in the development of more effective programmes and interventions targeting gangsterism in the province.

The purpose of this study is to facilitate a dialogue between the WCG and ex-gang members of the Western Cape. To this end, the study is divided into three research phases. Through using a qualitative research approach that focuses on narratives (and the way in which frames are embedded and made manifest in narrative texts) the first two phases set out to investigate how gangsterism is framed by the WCG and by ex-gang members respectively. The third phase looks at how these framings compare, by facilitating a dialogue between them. The use of the term 'dialogue' is important here, insofar as the aim is not to achieve frame dominance or to have the framings of local government and ex-gang members compete through notions of debate. The aim is rather to achieve a level of frame parity, whereby both frames may share equally in the development of a more inclusive and integrated understanding of what constitutes the problem of Western Cape gangsterism. While such an approach is certainly not argued to be a full replacement of real dialogue between these stakeholders, it may nevertheless prove its

functionality in both identifying and bridging some of the disparities in understanding gangsterism in this province.

The first section of this study presents a literature overview on *frames and framing theory*, *narratives and narrative inquiry*, as well as previous research done on *gangsterism* (both globally and in the Western Cape). The second section discusses the methodology used in this study, reflecting on all three research phases separately. The third section presents the results of all three research phases, i.e. the framing of gangsterism by the Western Cape Government, the framing of gangsterism by ex-gang members of the Western Cape, and the comparison of these frames through dialogue. The final sections give a brief delineation of the strengths and limitations of this study and conclude with the possibilities for future research.

1. OVERVIEW OF LITERATURE

1.1. Frames and framing theory

As a general point of departure, frames can be understood as "cognitive shortcuts that people use to help make sense of complex information" (Kaufman, Elliot, & Shmueli, 2013, p.1). To this end, we use frames (either consciously or subconsciously) to help us interpret the world and also to assist us in representing our interpretations to others (Kaufman et al., 2013). When we observe the world around us, frames play an important role in determining whether or not we notice a particular problem, as well as how we understand, remember, evaluate and choose to act upon that problem (Entman, 1993). By the same token, frames are generally understood to provide us with "a field of vision for a problem" (Kaufman et al., 2013, p.1).

Entman defines the process of framing as "selecting and highlighting some facets of events or issues, and making connections among them so as to promote a particular interpretation, evaluation, and/ or solution" (Entman, 2004, p.5). In keeping to this definition, frames are then typically understood to "diagnose, evaluate, and prescribe" (Entman, 1993, p.52). According to Entman (1993, 2004, 2007), fully developed frames will typically be seen to perform four functions, namely *problem definition, causal analysis, moral judgement* and *remedy promotion.*

In the first instance, frames can *define problems* by determining exactly "what a causal agent is doing [and] with what costs and benefits" (Entman, 1993, p.52). Second, frames can draw a *causal analysis* by identifying "the forces creating the problem" (Entman, 1993, p.52). Third,

frames can also evaluate the identified causal agents by making *moral judgements* about them (Entman, 1993). Finally, frames can promote and/ or justify particular *remedies* in various attempts to counter or solve the problem (Entman, 1993). While fully developed frames will mostly perform all four these functions, Entman argues that most substantive frames at least include any two of these functions (Entman, 2004).

The power of frames lies in the argument that they have a particular effect on audience members' thinking (Entman, 2007). Entman's work specifically illustrates that "[f]raming works to shape and alter audience members' interpretations and preferences through priming" (Entman, 2007, p.164). This means that frames and processes of framing ultimately work to "introduce or raise the salience or apparent importance of certain ideas, activating schemas that encourage target audiences to think, feel, and decide in a certain way" (Entman, 2004, p.164). As a consequence of understanding frames in this way, Entman then also argues that "the analysis of frames illuminates the precise way in which influence over a human consciousness is exerted by the transfer (or communication) of information" (Entman, 1993, p.51-52).

The central function of frames can thus be understood to involve both selection and salience (Entman, 1993). This means that frames can affect audience members' thinking by exerting power through the selection and salience of certain information (Entman 1993, 1994, 2004, 2007). While some fully developed frames could have "a common effect on large proportions of the receiving audience", it is not to say that frames will necessarily have "a universal effect on all" (Entman, 1993, p.54). Yet apart from merely affecting audience members' thinking, research on cognitive appraisal models of emotion has also suggested that "frames can alter [audience members'] emotional reactions" (Gross & D' Ambrosio, 2004, p.1). In so recognising that frames may affect both the thinking and emotional responses of audience members, either by producing and/ or promoting a particular interpretation of reality, frames can ultimately also serve to inspire a particular form of action (Entman, 1993).

If we are to accept that the power of frames lies partly in its ability to motivate audience members to respond to a problem in a particular way, it also becomes clear why frames are thought to play an important role within processes of conflict development (Kaufman et al., 2013). As Kaufman and colleagues note:

> In the context of a conflict, we create frames to help us understand why the conflict exists, what actions are important to the conflict, why the parties act as they do, and

> how we should act in response. During the evolution of a conflict, frames acts as sieves through which information is gathered and analysed, positions are determined (including priorities, means and solutions), and action plans developed. Depending on the context, framing may be used to conceptualize and interpret, or to manipulate and convince. (Kaufman et al., 2013, p. 3)

The functions of frames in processes of conflict development stand central in this study. If frames are created to help us understand why conflicts exist and why certain actions are important within the development of such conflicts (Kaufman et al., 2013), it is also possible to argue that analysing the frames present within a certain conflict can aid in the development of resolving that conflict. Following Kaufman and colleagues, it follows thus that an investigation into the framings of different stakeholders to a conflict could ultimately help to reveal the tensions in positions, including the "priorities, means and solutions" that the various stakeholders might foster or encourage (Kaufman et al., 2013, p.3). Gaining clear insight into these tensions and disparities may then help to effectively pave the way to possible solutions.

The question now remains as to how an investigation into frames may even be made possible. Here it is useful to draw on Entman's description of framing as a process whereby *communicators of a text* "make conscious or unconscious framing judgments in deciding what to say" (Entman, 1993, p.52). Through this assertion it becomes clear that one of the ways to gain access to frames, is by looking at communicating texts that tell a particular story. Insofar as frames are then understood to become manifest in communicating texts, identifying and gaining access to such texts now stands central in the attempt to analyse frames and processes of framing in this study.

In what follows, the nature and function of communicating texts will now further be discussed under the notion of narrative. It will also be shown to what extent the notion of narrative inquiry may aid in both the identification and analysis of frames and processes of framing.

1.2. Narratives and narrative inquiry

In this section, it will first be demonstrated to what extent the nature and function of communicative texts can be understood through the notion of narrative. Secondly, it will also be argued that a general reliance on narrative inquiry can be a useful means through which to study frames and processes of framing.

The relationship between communicative texts and narrative

If we accept that frames "select some aspects of a perceived reality and make them more salient in a communicating text" (Entman, 1993, p.52), we have thus implied that one of the ways in which we can gain access to frames is by studying communicating texts, i.e. by studying texts that tell a particular story (Entman, 1993). Henceforth, it is important to understand what the nature and function of communicating texts entail. This is important insofar as the sources used to investigate frames in this study, must then at least be shown to have a communicating nature and to serve a communicating function. In what follows, it will first be demonstrated in what way the notion of *narrative* may present a useful gateway to understanding the nature and function of communicating texts.

While the notion of narrative has been employed with some inconsistency (Bal, 1997; Polkinghorne, 1995), it is nevertheless possible to determine some of the key characteristics that narratives are typically thought to entail. In its broadest sense, the term *narrative* can be understood as a means by which human beings "[characterize] the phenomenon of experience" (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990, p.2). As living organisms, we are continuously experiencing a series of life-events which, given our storytelling nature, we account for through the use of narratives (Bryman, 2012). In this light, human beings are understood to be "storytelling organisms who, individually and socially, live storied lives" (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990, p.2).

If we are to understand narrative as a means to characterise our experiences, it then becomes useful to ask what the essential characteristics of narratives need to be in order for them to fulfil this function. To this end, Bruner identifies what he argues to be the most essential characteristics of narrative, when he writes:

> There is widespread agreement that stories are about the vicissitudes of human intention and that […] story structure is composed minimally of the pentad of an Agent,

> an Action, a Goal, a Setting, an Instrument – and Trouble (Burke, 1945). Trouble is what drives the drama, and it is generated by a mismatch between two or more of the five constituents of Burke's pentad… (Bruner, 2004, p.697)

Following Bruner's (2004) interpretation, there are at least six key characteristics of narrative that can now be identified. These include *Agent, Action, Goal, Setting, Instrument and Trouble.* Typically, narrative is understood to always be set in motion by a particular event (Agnew, 2006) or form of Trouble (Bruner, 2004). This event or Trouble will "usually [be] out of the ordinary, representing a deviation from the routine aspects of [a] individual's life" (Agnew, 2006, p.121). Once the narrative has been set in motion by Trouble, it then typically involves an "Agent, performing an Action to achieve a Goal" (Pemberton & Aarten, 2015, p.20). All this takes place in a particular Setting, whilst the Agent uses a particular Instrument as a means to tell the story. While each narrative may reveal a different Agent, Action, Goal, Setting and form of Trouble, so too may the Instrument by which the Agent tells the story be seen to differ. This means that the term *narrative* could thus be applied to a wide range of phenomena, including written documents, the spoken word, song, or even visual imagery. Importantly, this also shows that both the nature and function of narrative can also be found in communicating texts that tells a particular story.

If we accept that frames can be investigated through the study of communicating texts, and that in turn, communicating texts can be understood (both in nature and in function) as a form of narrative, then it also becomes possible to argue that narrative inquiry could be a useful methodology for investigating frames and the ways in which framing components and processes are made manifest in a communicating text.

Investigating frames through narrative inquiry

As a general point of departure, narrative inquiry can be understood as a means to shift our attention to how people make sense of life-experiences and with what intention they do so (Bryman, 2012). This brings us back to Bruner's statement that "stories are about the vicissitudes of human intention" (Bruner, 2004, p.697). If stories are indeed understood to reflect various forms and modifications of human intention, it becomes clear why narratives are argued to be "nearly always told with a purpose in mind" (Bryman, 2012, p.582). When undertaking a process of narrative inquiry, it is thus of central importance to be particularly aware of the possible

intention(s) with which the story is being told. Subsequently, this would also mean that any investigation into frames must indeed consider the possible intentions that may have given rise to certain frames.

Apart from nearly always being told with a purpose in mind, narratives are also generally understood to impose a particular structure on accounts of events (Pemberton & Aarten, 2015, p.21). The structuring function of narrative makes it possible for human beings to not only order their experiences in a certain way, but to also make their experiences accessible to others (Clandinin and Connelly, 2000). Once we acknowledge that the phenomena of experience may become accessible to us through narrative, we must however still delineate exactly what a research inquiry into narratives might entail. In attempting to answer this, narrative inquiry certainly presents its own challenges in exact delineation. As Riessman (2008) notes:

> Narrative [inquiry] refers to a family of methods for interpreting texts that have in common a storied form. As in all families, there is conflict and disagreement among those holding different perspectives. (Riessman, 2008, p.11)

While the disagreement and conflict surrounding narrative inquiry does not deem the use thereof determinably problematic in and of itself, it does encourage researchers to articulate exactly what they understand (or think they understand) when using narrative inquiry as a methodology. For example, in using narrative inquiry for the purposes of investigating frames, a number of advantages and theoretical underpinnings can now be brought to the fore.

Firstly, narrative inquiry can be a useful way of analysing salience in a communicating text. Insofar as frames tend to produce and promote particular interpretations of reality by making certain aspects more salient than others (Entman, 1993), narrative inquiry posits a useful tool by which such salience can be investigated. Through the use of narrative inquiry, we are able to investigate which pieces of information are made "more noticeable, meaningful or memorable" (Entman, 1993, p.53) in the narratives under study. It should be noted here that both the presence and absence of information can lead to salience in a communicating text (Entman, 1993). This means that narrative inquiry should not only investigate the ways in which a narrative might direct audience members' attention *towards* particular aspects of perceived reality, but should also investigate the ways in which attention might be directed *away* from possible other aspects (Entman, 1993, 1994, 2004, 2007). Consequently, in using narrative inquiry as a methodology to investigate frames and processes of framing, it will be important to

look at both *emphasis and repetition,* as well as the *omission* of certain information in the narrative under study (Entman, 1993).

Secondly, narrative inquiry can also be used to investigate common metaphors, themes, plotlines, etc. (Clandinin, 2007). This ties to processes of framing, insofar as frames not only become manifest through "the presence or absence of certain keywords, stock phrases, stereotyped images, sources of information, and sentences" (Entman, 1993, p.52), but also ultimately sustain the power to influence action by sticking to a convincing plotline and by utilising metaphors and themes that are both emotionally charged (Entman, 2004) and that can serve to convince audience members of a particular vision for a problem (Kaufman et al., 2013). To this end, narrative inquiry can thus aid in investigating these components as they manifest in narrative form, both by identifying them and by scrutinising their function within the broader narrative.

These identified advantages of using narrative inquiry as a methodology to investigate frames are by no means an exhaustive list. Indeed, many varying relationships between narrative inquiry and framing analysis are likely to be found, depending on the particular study and research questions at hand. What is important to note at this stage however, is that the use of narrative inquiry already in theory provides a valuable and functional way of investigating frames and processes of framing, also acting as a designated methodological compass to guide framing analysis in communicating texts.

The exact delineation of how narrative inquiry will be used in this study is set out in the methodology chapter. In what follows, we will now first turn to a discussion on gangsterism research and the main themes that have manifested therein, both globally and within the Western Cape specifically.

1.3. Gangsterism globally

Academic interest in the phenomenon of gangsterism is certainly not a new trend. From as early as the 1890's, there has been a global upsurge in academic and public interest in gangs and gang membership (Decker & van Winkle, 1996). Gangsterism indeed has a long history that spreads

across time, countries and cultures (Covey, 2010, McMaster, 2010, Spergel, 1995).[1] Yet surprisingly, most research on gangsterism in the global academic scene seems to be centred around gangs from the United States of America (Covey, 2010). While there has been some increased interest in gangsterism in the United Kingdom and across Europe (Hallsworth & Young, 2008), American gangsterism nevertheless still dominates the global research scene. This has led most media portrayals of gangsterism to put 'American gangsterism' forth as the generic archetype, leaving typical images of 'the American gangster' to represent the stereotypical and/ or universal gangster persona (Covey, 2010). Ultimately, this strong focus on American gangsterism continues to play a crucial role in misunderstanding gangsterism as principally an American phenomenon (Covey, 2010), with research narrowing down even further in its trending focus on Latino and African American communities (McMaster, 2010).

Although research on American gangsterism is undoubtedly of value in and of itself, its dominance can nonetheless be argued to limit a much needed understanding of gangsterism as a broader, global phenomenon (Covey, 2010). This also means that researching gangs and gangsterism within other contexts remains crucial if researchers are to effectively acknowledge and respond to gangsterism for what it truly is – a widespread and global phenomenon (Covey, 2010; Spergel, 1995). Furthermore, researching gangsterism in various settings also offers the opportunity to critically consider the possible influences that different social-, political-, economic- and cultural contexts may have on the existence and development of gangsterism around the world. In this way, researchers will at least be able to compare findings and draw from each other's insights in a shared attempt to respond to the problem of gangsterism in its true complexity. For the purposes of this study, specific attention will now be drawn to research that has been done on gangsterism in the Western Cape province of South Africa.

1.4. Gangsterism in the Western Cape

The Western Cape province is argued to be "the only province in South Africa where [gangsterism] has been the point of political debate over such a long period of time" (McMaster,

[1] "[Gangs] have been reported in England, Scotland, Germany, Italy, Russia and other republics of the former Soviet Union, Bosnia (formerly part of Yugoslavia), Albania, Kenya, Tanzania, South Africa, Mexico, El Salvador, Brazil, Peru, Taiwan, South Korea, Japan, Hong Kong, Australia, New Zealand, The People's Republic of China and Papua New Guinea. [Gangs] are present in socialist and free-market societies, in developing and developed countries" (Spergel, 1995, p.3).

2010, p.230). Home to both street and prison gangs, each with their own unique formation and history,[2] the Western Cape has long bore witness to the rapid expansion of gangsterism and its aftermath. At present, the perpetration of gang-related activity in the province is found to operate on a largely varied spectrum, ranging from accounts of "highly sophisticated drug smuggling syndicates" to less sophisticated, yet "well entrenched territory-based gangs" (Redpath, 2001, p.34). With Western Cape gangs now accounting for the majority of crime within the province, they have arguably become highly influential role players in Western Cape society (Kinnes, 2000), covering a large and diverse scope of criminal activity which includes financial crimes, crimes of violence and sexual crimes (Charlton, n.d.).

Understanding gangsterism in the Western Cape cannot be cut off from understanding its origins, the latter of which lie deeply rooted in the country's history of apartheid. Under apartheid's racial segregation policies, the social structure of the Western Cape had been gravely affected by the forced removals of 'coloured' population groups, who were taken away from their homes in the inner City of Cape Town and its southern suburbs (Dixon & Johns, 2001). The aim of these removals was to move all coloured population groups out of designated 'white' areas and into to designated 'coloured' areas such as Manenberg, Hanover Park, Heideveld, Lavender Hill, Bonteheuwel, Elsies River, Mitchells Plain, etc. – areas which all form part of what is generally referred to today as the 'Cape Flats' (Bowers Du Toit, 2014; Dixon & Johns, 2001). This system of racial segregation not only gave rise to what later became known as the 'coloured ghettos' on the Cape Flats (Dixon & Johns, 2001), but also resulted in the creation of designated geographical areas that ultimately "perpetuated patterns of poverty and inequality" in Western Cape society (Bowers Du Toit, 2014, p.2).

Together with the creation of the so called coloured ghettos on the Cape Flats, an historic rise in gang-prone communities and gang-related activity had started to take form in these areas (Dixon

[2]The most prominent gangs situated in the Western Cape are believed to have originated in prison life, and are generally traced back as far as 1836 (Haefele, 1998). Prison gangs are constituted by three main groups or rankings known as the 26's, 27's and 28's (Charlton, n.d.). Together, these rankings constitute the Number Gangs (Charlton, n.d.). The Number Gangs generally reflect particular levels of offenses. Accordingly, gang members are usually classified into 26's (economic offenses), 27's (crimes of violence) and 28's (sexual offences) (Charlton, n.d.). The particular offense committed is thus understood to determine a member's gang affiliation. It is also possible for a gang member to change affiliation by committing a higher offense (Charlton, n.d.). It has been suggested that up until the 1980's, membership into prison gangs could only be secured by actually obtaining a prison sentence (Redpath, 2001). Today, conviction no longer seems to be a prerequisite to membership, seeing that many non-convicted members are also found to operate within prison gangs, albeit outside of prison walls (Redpath, 2001). Furthermore, concerning street gangs, it seems that the latter have also mostly been found to be aligned with one of the three major prison gangs mentioned above (Redpath, 2001).

& Johns, 2001). Still today, these geographical areas remain the most crucial focal points of Western Cape gangsterism (Bowers Du Toit, 2014; Dixon & Johns, 2001; Lambrechts, 2013), demonstrating why research on Western Cape gangsterism is most often situated within "a very specific demographical context: the so called coloured population of the Cape Flats" (Dixon & Johns, 2001, p.9). This demographic situatedness has also led some scholars to argue that gangsterism has become a defining characteristic of coloured identity (Adhikari, 2009; Calix, 2013), also bearing in mind the long tradition of "the 'skollie' (young hooligan or lawbreaker)" in many coloured communities (Dixon & Johns, 2001, p.3).

Apart from the strong influence that apartheid's forced removals had on the general rise of gangsterism in the Western Cape province, the impact of post-apartheid, neo-liberalism and globalization have also played their own crucial roles in the "economy, culture and social structure of the Western Cape" (Dixon & Johns, 2001, p.4). Indeed, it should be noted that it is especially in post-apartheid South Africa that gangsterism has "extended its tentacles of power to become a 'power player' in the lives of many communities" (Dixon & Johns 2001, p.6). As a result of this, many Western Cape gangs have now "progressed beyond the boundaries of the Cape Flats, into other urban areas and even rural towns in the Western Cape" (Lambrechts, 2013, p.210). Furthermore, there has also been an expansion and shifting of economic operations "to affluent areas and a recruitment drive beyond the Cape Peninsula" (Redpath, 2001, p.34).

The expansion and shifting of economic operations might also be explained by the growth in illegitimate opportunity structures during South Africa's political transitions (Kinnes, 2000). Due to social controls often becoming invariably relaxed during times of political transition, many borders had in this way been opened up to the gang underworld abroad (Kinnes, 2000). With the loosening of social controls contributing to both social disorganisation and political uncertainty, opportunities for crime growth would often expand in response to the ambivalence brought forth by these circumstances (Kinnes, 2000). As opportunities for crime growth continued to expand in post-apartheid South Africa, Western Cape gangs also started their own metamorphosis into organised criminal enterprises (Kinnes, 2000; Weisel, 2002). With scholars recognising the evolvement of gangsterism into forms of organised crime, research also started to focus on the resulting negative impact that gangs can have on social control by the state (Lambrechts, 2013). Looking at Western Cape gangsterism through the lens of organised crime, the relationship between gangs and the state now often represents "a manifestation of power

dynamics", the impact of which "[hampers] the promotion of strong state-society relations" (Lambrechts, 2013, p.207).

While the growth in crime opportunity through gangsterism seems uncontested (Kinnes, 2000; Lambrechts, 2013; Pinnock, 2016), there still remains some difficulties in coherently defining gangs and gangsterism in the Western Cape (Kinnes, 2000). With there being "many different manifestations of criminal gangs" in the province, it is indeed "unlikely that one single definition will ever be adequate or comprehensive enough to cover all shades and variations" (Gastrow, 1998, p.9). Attempts at defining gangs are even further complicated by the fact that the structure of gangs are not static, but remain "open to change as the [gangs] progress in a world of changing criminality" (Kinnes, 2000, p.5). Insofar as there is no static concept that can unequivocally define either what a gang or who a gang member is, it has been argued that "public officials find themselves responding to an amorphous, ill-defined problem" (Decker & Van Winkle, 1996, p.3). At the moment, one of the central ways to define gangs in the Western Cape thus seems to be largely dependent on the specific demographical context of coloured populations and the gangs that operate within dominantly coloured communities (Bowers Du Toit, 2014; Dixon & Johns, 2001).

Considering the research suggestions that have been made on how to address the problem of gangsterism in the Western Cape, it is clear that no simple solution exists on the matter (Lambrechts, 2013; McMaster 2007, Pinnock, 2016). One of the most apparent themes in this regard has been the need to address socio-economic factors (Daniels and Adams, 2010; Dixon & Johns, 2001; Lambrechts, 2013). Within the context of socio-economic factors, the problem of violence has been argued to stand central (Dixon & Johns, 2001). To this end, the problem of overall violence is thought to constitute one of the largest concerns in the light of its "devastating effects on [both] economic and social life" (Dixon & Johns, 2001, p.5). Consequently, it has been suggested that one of the primary long-term goals in the fight against gangsterism should be to identify and tackle the roots of societal violence (Dixon & Johns, 2001).

The issue of violence and its destructive effects on social life also suggests that it will not be sufficient to only respond to gangsterism as a criminal entity (Daniels & Adams, 2010). Beyond its criminal nature, gangsterism is understood to be an inherently complex "social and cultural phenomenon" (Daniels & Adams, 2010, p.46). In critically engaging with gangsterism in its complexity, research has also emphasised the importance of "[revisiting] theories about gangs and delinquency" (Decker & van Winkle, 1996, p.8). To this end, scholars have reiterated the

need to investigate “how the individual has been shaped by his or her community culture and how community history influenced the individuals decision to become a gangster” (Daniels & Adams, 2010, p.45). Insight into these themes seem to constitute serious limitations in existing research (Daniels & Adams, 2010). Furthermore, in moving beyond mere evaluations and analyses of gangsterism as labelled criminal acts, researchers have articulated the need to “make meaning of why [some people] continue to live violent lives despite the opportunities that their democratic society now makes available to them” (Daniels & Adams, 2010, p.46). In this light, research on Western Cape gangsterism has especially been thought to lack sufficient research on “the well-being of youth who grew up in gang-infested areas” (Daniels & Adams, 2010, p.1). It has therefore been suggested that there is an urgent need to thoroughly explore the wide range of youth-hardships, including economic crises and violence-related trauma, which have for too long been left out of the dominant research agenda (Daniels and Adams, 2010).

Overall, research on Western Cape gangsterism does seem to reveal close ties between the problem of gangsterism and “a deprivation trap of poverty, marginalization, isolation, unemployment and, ultimately, powerlessness” (Bowers Du Toit, 2014, p.1). Even though these ties demonstrate a strong link between past victimisation and the later perpetration of gang-related offenses (Daniels & Adams, 2010), it is a link that often remains neglected in the dominant discourse on gangsterism. One of the main reasons for neglecting the link between victim and offender, seems to stem from the fact that research on Western Cape gangsterism focuses too closely on ongoing policies or existing programme initiatives. This largely limits the possibility of investigating gangsterism outside of pre-determined research structures, leaving suggested anti-gang policies and interventions largely dependent on existing policy initiatives previously designed to tackle the problem (Decker & Van Winkle, 1996). As long as these existing policies and interventions do not emphasise the relationship between past victimization and the later perpetration of gang-related offenses, this cycle of neglect thus easily continues.

While gangsterism in the Western Cape is certainly a complex phenomenon, the need for constructive engagement on the issue is a pressing one (Dixon & Johns, 2001). Scholars have long been urging the WCG to critically consider how to deal with the problem of gangsterism in the province. To this end, it has been argued that the WCG needs to focus on developing both short and long-term plans that can “assist in redirecting people away gangs” (Kinnes, 2000, p.40). Although the WCG has indeed been engaging with local and national stakeholders on how to address the problem of gangsterism, their general lack in the inclusion of target-group

members in both the planning and implementation of anti-gang policies and interventions has been generally disappointing (Van Wyk & Theron, 2005). As a consequence, scholars are now calling for an active response by government, urging public officials to respond to the problem of gangsterism "without alienating and marginalising communities" (Kinnes, 2000, p.39).

With government interventions currently not proving sufficiently effective in countering the problem of gangsterism in the province, this study suggests that there may be existing disparities between the WCG and target-group members' understandings of what constitutes the problem of gangsterism and the reasons for its prolonged continuation in the Western Cape. If such disparities are found to exist, it is argued here that they indeed need to be tackled through constructive engagement that includes target-group members in responding to the problem (Van Wyk & Theron, 2005). The hope is that the inclusion of target-group members might reveal some of the neglected factors that lead individuals to becoming gang members, as well as some of the factors that have lead to gang members' desistance — both of which may aid in the development of more effective programmes and interventions targeting gangsterism in the province.

In what follows, this study now posits an investigation into frames as a means to identify some of the issues concerning the possible abovementioned disparities. The aim is henceforth to investigate how the issue of gangsterism is framed by the WCG and by ex-gang members of the Western Cape respectively, and to ultimately explore the ways in which these framings compare. Through using a qualitative research approach that focuses on narratives and the way in which frames are embedded and made manifest in narrative texts, the aim is to facilitate a dialogue between the frames of the WCG and ex-gang members, particularly as a means to construct theoretical engagement between these parties. Up to date, research on Western Cape gangsterism has not been found to critically engage with issues of framing, and has neither attempted to facilitate a dialogue between parties through the use of frames and framing analysis.

2. METHODOLOGY

This chapter outlines the processes by which the research data was collected and analysed. The first section describes the research purposes, questions and sub-questions guiding this study. The second section consists of a discussion on the research strategy and design. The third

section divides the study into three separate research phases, each treated in accordance with one of the three research sub-questions proposed in section one. Herein the methodological processes followed in all three research phases are discussed, including a delineation of the general research approach, data selection, target population and data analysis. Finally, the forth section presents a discussion on ethical considerations and the protection of human subjects who formed part of this research.

2.1. Research purposes and questions

2.1.1. Research purposes

The purpose of this study is to investigate the way(s) in which gangsterism is framed by the Western Cape Government and ex-gang members of the Western Cape, and to facilitate a dialogue between these framings. In facilitating such a dialogue, the aim is to achieve a level of frame parity, wherein both the framing of the WCG and the framing of ex-gang members can share equally in the development of a more inclusive and integrated understanding of what constitutes the problem of Western Cape gangsterism. In following this route, the hope is that it will be a functional method to both identify and possibly bridge some of the disparities in understanding gangsterism in the province, so as to ultimately aid in the development of more effective programmes and interventions targeting gangsterism in the Western Cape.

In focussing on Western Cape gangsterism specifically, this study attempts to first and foremost address the problem of gangsterism as it uniquely exists in the province itself. To this end, the research questions are designed to target Western Cape gangsterism exclusively and to possibly gain insight into why gangsterism continues to be such a pressing concern in this province. Apart from addressing the issue of Western Cape gangsterism, an additional purpose of this study is to contribute further to the expansion of research boundaries in the global academic arena. Acknowledging that global research on gangsterism is often still centred around American gangs, the present study knowingly places its focus elsewhere, without losing sight of the value in exploring the possible ways in which insights gained into Western Cape gangsterism and the WCG's response thereto, could possibly translate to functional ways of supporting the global fight against gangsterism and its threatening influence on society.

2.1.2. Research questions

The main research question guiding this study is: How is gangsterism in the Western Cape framed by the Western Cape Government and by ex-gang members of the Western Cape, and how do these framings compare?

The research aims of this study are subsequently tri-linear, positing three sub-questions:

I. How does the Western Cape Government frame gangsterism in the Western Cape?
II. How do ex-gang members of the Western Cape frame gangsterism?
III. How do these framings compare?

2.2. Research strategy and design

2.2.1. Research strategy

This study follows a qualitative research approach. Insofar as the various framings of gangsterism are investigated through the use of narratives, a qualitative research method allows for an approach to the data that ultimately "[emphasizes] the stories that people employ to account for events" (Bryman, 2012, p.584). By using this research approach, it is thus be possible to not only usefully engage in narratives and narrative inquiry, but also to ultimately generate theory on the way(s) in which gangsterism is being framed by the WCG and ex-gang members, as based on the empirical data.

Within the more general qualitative research scope, this study specifically uses the methodological approach of narrative inquiry in analysing the data. Given the general ambiguity that exists in the methodological use of narrative inquiry, it will be necessary to first identify the exact forms of narrative inquiry that are to be used in this study. To this end, Polkinghorne's distinction between *narrative analysis* and *analysis of narratives* will serve as a theoretical point of departure. Both the aforementioned types of narrative inquiry will be used in this study, and will be further discussed under the appropriate research phase.

2.2.2. Research design

The present study only makes use of existing data, the latter of which has been chosen for various reasons. In the first instance, it was found that the necessary primary data needed for

this study was already available and accessible. In the case of the WCG documents, key speeches and public statements made by members of the WCG were published on the government's website, and were freely accessible to the public. In the case of ex-gang members of the Western Cape, existing data in the form of interviews and video recordings were made available by a fellow researcher who had collected such data in function of including short extracts of ex-gang members' life stories in a self-help book for South African teenagers. It was not found that either of these two data sets had been analysed for the same research purposes put forth in this study.

The advantages of using existing data were mainly two-fold. On the one hand, time limitations of this study made it difficult to conduct primary fieldwork in South Africa and therefore the availability of existing data was welcomed. Furthermore, the decision to go forth in the use of existing data was affirmed by the quality of data that was available. In the case of the WCG, the use of speeches and public statements made by the WCG was argued to be the most appropriate means to investigate how the WCG was framing gangsterism in the province, seeing that these sources contained and represented the government's communication to and with the public. These sources were also sufficiently detailed and were found to include insights from a variety of sectors, governmental departments and public officials. Due to time limitations, it was considered highly unlikely (and less relevant for the research questions posed in this study) to collect data through in-depth interviews with individual members of the WCG themselves.

The data provided on ex-gang members' life-narratives was also of a high qualitative value. Both the existing transcriptions of interviews as well as the (later transcribed) video recordings of ex-gang-members telling their life-stories, were found to produce detailed narratives that gave clear and valuable insights into the lived experiences of ex-gang members in the Western Cape. The data provided was therefore considered sufficient to answer the proposed research question relating to the way in which ex-gang members of the Western Cape were framing their experience(s) of gangsterism.

2.3. Research phases

Following the three research sub-questions, this study is divided into three research phases. In this section, the methodological processes followed in all three phases will be described.

I. Phase 1: Western Cape Government

General research approach

The goal of this research phase was to answer research question one: How does the Western Cape Government frame gangsterism in the Western Cape?

In order to answer this question, the WCG's narrative on gangsterism had to be analysed. However, there was no unified narrative that comprised of all the WCG's speeches and public statements on gangsterism. While many individual speeches and public statements were available on the government's official website, these were all scattered and fragmented, leaving no broad or all-inclusive narrative that could be analysed for the purpose of demonstrating the WCG's framing of gangsterism.

The first methodological step was thus to comprise a unified narrative by combining all the available speeches and public statements that dealt with the issue of gangsterism. In order to arrive at such a unified narrative, Polkinghorne's (1995) theory on narrative analysis was used. Drawing on Bruner's (1986) paradigmatic mode of cognition, Polkinghorne describes the aim of narrative analysis as essentially "[attending] to the features or attributes that […] define particular instances of a category" (Polkinghorne, 1995, p.1). Translated to the aim of this research phase, the overarching category identified was that of *gangsterism in the Western Cape*. Accordingly, all public statements and speeches dealing with the topic of gangsterism in the Western Cape had to be collected and combined into an *emplotted story* (Polkinghorne, 1995). This also meant that the only speeches and public documents that could be included, were those that shared the common feature of dealing with the topic of gangsterism in the province, in one way or another.

The second methodological step was then to investigate the way(s) in which the WCG was framing the issue of gangsterism. To this end, Entman's four key components of a fully developed frame were used to structure the comprised narrative into the four categories of *problem definition, causal analysis, moral judgement and remedy promotion* (Entman, 1993). After structuring the WCG's narrative in accordance with these components, the aim was to investigate the WCG's framing of gangsterism in relation to all four these key components.

Data selection

For the purposes of data collection, the search was limited to the official website of the Western Cape Government.[3] This website granted access to a variety of sources, including vacancies, latest news and speeches, public statements, tenders, etc. Gaining access to speeches and public statements stood central to this research phase, insofar as these sources were considered most relevant to ascertaining the way in which the WCG was framing gangsterism in their communication with and to the public. Consequently, a general search was done in the "news"-category, which was found to be the category containing the government's published speeches and public statements.

The category of "news" contained documents from as early as 2003 up until 2016 and onwards. However, for the purposes of this study, it was conceived of as impractical to construct a political narrative that stretched across multiple years. The reason for this was mainly that politics and political discourse are not static phenomena, but are rather known to be influenced by changing power-dynamics, election results and agenda-settings. The changing nature of politics is thus also seen to influence governmental discourses and approaches to societal issues. For these reasons, the search was limited to only include speeches and public statements that had been published on the website starting from 1 January 2015. This gave the opportunity to investigate how the WCG had been framing gangsterism approximately over the last year. This would also assist in later facilitating a dialogue between frames that were in fact current, rather than retrospective or historical.

The keywords used in the search were "gang OR gangs OR gangsterism". All materials that had been published since the start of 2015 were searched through for one or more of these three keywords. The physical search ended on 16 March 2016. Consequently, all documents that contained any one of the three keywords, and that had been published before or on 16 March 2016, were included in this study. All the search results were read through, keeping only the documents which dealt with one of the three keywords in at least some detail. Documents which merely included a mention of one of the three keywords without any detailed narrative on the keywords themselves, were not included in this study. This left the study with a total of 38 relevant documents, all of which were included in the data collection.[4]

[3] The website can be found at https://www.westerncape.gov.za
[4] See the Appendix for a list of all 38 governmental documents used in this study.

Target population

Within this research phase, the goal was to investigate the way in which gangsterism was being framed by the WCG over the selected time period. The target population thus pertained to the WCG as an official governmental entity. Such an entity was understood to be comprised of any and all members employed by the local government who had either spoken or written on the issue of gangsterism in the province, provided that such published statements had been made on behalf of the WCG and in the communicators' capacity as an employee of the government.

Data analysis

In the first instance, Polkinghorne's method of narrative analysis was used to construct a unified narrative of all the collected sources. Having collected all the published documents that dealt in any way with the issue of gangsterism in the Western Cape between 1 January 2015 and 16 March 2016, the aim thereafter was to extract only the information that dealt specifically with gangsterism. While some sources gave much attention to addressing the particular issue of gangsterism, others only briefly mentioned aspects thereof within a wider scope of societal concerns. Regardless of such differences, all the information pertaining to gangsterism in one form or another were emplotted into one unified narrative.

Seeing as the ultimate aim of this research phase was to investigate the way in which the WCG was framing gangsterism, it was decided to functionally structure the unified narrative in accordance to Entman's four key components of a fully developed frame (Entman, 1993). Accordingly, the narrative was divided into the four categories of *problem definition, causal analysis, moral evaluation and remedy promotion.*

After structuring the narrative according to Entman's (1993) four key components, the aim was to analyse each of the four sub-categories respectively. Here it was investigated which aspects were made most salient in each of these four categories. This also included an investigation into the aspects that were least salient or perhaps even omitted in the WCG's narrative on gangsterism. In following Entman, both "the presence and absence of certain keywords, stock phrases, stereotyped images, sources of information, and sentences" were all investigated to this end (Entman, 1993, p.52).

Central to the analysis was Entman's idea that "[t]he words and images that make up the frame can be distinguished from the rest of the news by their capacity to stimulate support or opposition to the sides in a political conflict" (Entman, 2004, p.6). In following this idea, the analysis was guided by the following argument put forth by Entman (2004):

> We can measure [the capacity to stimulate support or opposition] by *cultural resonance and magnitude.* Those frames that employ more culturally resonant terms have the greatest potential for influence. They use words and images highly salient in the culture, which is to say *noticeable, understandable, memorable and emotionally charged. Magnitude* taps the *prominence and repetition* of the framing words and images. The more resonance and magnitude, the more likely the framing is to evoke similar thoughts and feelings in large portions of the audience. However, some highly resonant words or images may not need much repetition. (Entman, 2004, p.6, original emphasis).

In following this assertion, the analysis undertaken thus also focussed specifically on words, sentences or phrases that were particularly "noticeable, understandable, memorable and emotionally charged" (Entman, 2004, p.6).

II. Phase 2: Ex-gang members of the Western Cape

General research approach

The goal of this research phase was to answer research question two: How do ex-gang members of the Western Cape frame gangsterism?

In order to answer this question, the narratives of ex-gang members of the Western Cape had to be analysed. The aim here was to specifically gain insight into the lived experiences of ex-gang members themselves, by focusing on their autobiographical life stories. Insofar as the data pertaining to ex-gang members was already in narrative form, there was no need to first construct a narrative as in the case of the WCG. Furthermore, while the WCG was treated as a single entity with a unified narrative, the narratives of ex-gang members were each treated and analysed separately, appreciating that each ex-gang member had their own personal structured narrative and that the aim would therefore be to investigate the similarities and differences between these narratives.

In order to analyse the narratives of ex-gang members, Polkinghorne's (1995) theory on analysis of narratives was used. Drawing this time on Bruner's (1986) narrative mode of cognition, Polkinghorne describes the analysis of narratives as having the cumulative effect of "a collection of individual cases in which thought moves from case to case" (Polkinghorne, 1995, p.11). Translated to the purpose of this research phase, the aim was thus to look for the various framing elements in and between the narratives of ex-gang members, with each ex-gang member representing their own respective case.

In using Polkinghorne's (1995) methodology on analysis of narratives, the research aim was to identify "general themes or concepts" across all the collected life stories (Clandinin, 2007, p.xv). In order to arrive at a description of general themes and concepts, it was thus necessary to analyse the narratives for shared plotlines, common sub-themes, etc. (See Clandinin, 2007; Polkinghorne, 1995). In following Polkinghorne's (1995) use of narrative reasoning, this research phase was guided by giving regard to both the similarities and differences in ex-gang members' narratives, with the ultimate aim being to investigate the way in which ex-gang members' narratives were found to frame the issue of gangsterism.

In contrast to the case of the WCG, it did not prove useful to structure the life-stories of ex-gang members according to the four key components of a fully developed frame. This was mainly due to the fact that the speeches and public statements made by the WCG were created with the clear intention of communicating information to the general public, whereas the life-stories of the ex-gang members were not. Consequently, it would have been insufficient to structure the narratives of ex-gang members according to the components of a fully developed frame. Instead, Clandinin and Connelly's (2000) theory on the use of a three-dimensional narrative inquiry space was used as an interpretative framework in analysing the ways in which these narratives were framing gangsterism. The particulars of this narrative inquiry space will be further elaborated on in the discussion on data analysis.

Data selection

For this research phase, existing data in the form of transcribed interviews and untranscribed video recordings were made available by a fellow researcher. The data provided was previously collected by the fellow researcher with the purpose of including short extracts of ex-gang

members' life stories in a self-help book for South African teenagers. In total, the data made available for the purposes of this study included the narratives of five ex-gang members of the Western Cape, namely John*, Sam*, Ryan*, Noah* and Brad*.[5] The full set of data consisted of the following:

- Two transcribed interviews that the abovementioned researcher had individually conducted with ex-gang members John and Sam.
- One "profile feature" newspaper article, based on an interview with ex-gang member Ryan.
- Three short promotional videos in which ex-gang members John, Sam and Ryan each give a brief summary of their life-stories as part of a video series produced by a private, non-profit organization on the topic of spiritual growth.
- Two video testimonials of ex-gang member Noah, where he tells his life story in front of an audience on two separate and non-related occasions.
- One video testimonial of ex-gang member Brad, where he tells his life story in front of an audience.

All the above data was included in this study. While the two transcribed interviews were kept in the same form as they were received, all video materials (six sources in total) were originally transcribed for the purposes of this study. Concerning the "profile feature'' article of Ryan, only the direct quotes from his interview were used in this study.

Target population

Within this research phase, the goal was to investigate the way in which gangsterism was being framed by ex-gang members of the Western Cape. The target population thus pertains to ex-gang members of the Western Cape in general, also acknowledging that their life-stories are understood in this study to give access to some of the realities of (existing) gang members as well. To this end, the ex-gang members are understood to also represent a means of target-group member inclusion, where 'target groups' refers to groups towards which the WCG's programmes and interventions against gangsterism are directed.

[5] *Due to ethical considerations, these are not the real names of the participants.

Data analysis

In this research phase, Polkinghorne's method of analysis of narratives was used. As mentioned above, the aim of this phase was to investigate the salience in and between the narratives under study. Insofar as the narratives of ex-gang members represented a temporally structured telling of their life-events, it was anticipated that these narratives would not be framing the issue of gangsterism in the same way as the WCG. However, in following Polletta (2009), it was still acknowledged that "[a]s a rhetorical form, stories are persuasive" (Polletta, 2009, p.1). By attending to the power exerted by these narratives, the aim was thus to conceive of the ways in which ex-gang members were in fact framing (their experiences of) gangsterism. The conceptualisation of these frames would ultimately form the necessary cornerstone for facilitating a dialogue between the framing results of the WCG and those of ex-gang members.

In order to investigate the power exerted by the narratives of ex-gang members, it was necessary to first envisage an interpretative frame for this research phase. To this end, Clandinin and Connelly's (2000) development of a three-dimensional narrative inquiry space was used. This meant that three separate dimensions had to be kept in mind during the data analysis, namely *temporality, the personal and the social*, and *place* (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000). Temporality was understood in this study to refer to notions of past, present and future (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000). This related largely to Clandinin and Connelly's (1994) use of the *backward and forward* directions in the analysis of narratives. The personal and the social were understood here to reflect Clandinin and Connelly's (1994) use of the *inward and outward* directions of analysis. The personal (inward) was understood to refer to "the internal conditions, such as feelings, hopes, aesthetic reactions, and moral dispositions" (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000, p.50). The social (external) was understood to refer to the "[existential] conditions under which people's experiences and events are unfolding" – including cultural, social and institutional settings (Clandinin & Connelly, 2006, p.480). Finally, the notion of place was understood to refer to "the specific concrete physical and topological boundaries of inquiry landscapes" (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000, p.51).

By using these dimensions to analyse the narratives under study, the ultimate aim was to interpret these results in the light of processes of framing. Although the key components of a fully developed frame were not used to this end, it was nonetheless still possible to investigate the way in which ex-gang members' narratives were "selecting and highlighting some facets of

events or issues, and making connections between them", which would also help to reveal the ex-gang members' particular "interpretation[s], evaluation[s] and/ or solution[s]" of gangsterism (Entman, 2004, p.5). These particular interpretations/evaluations/solutions subsequently aided in also giving insight into the ex-gang members' *problem definitions, causal analyses, moral judgements* and *remedy promotions*– all of which were used to compare frames in the third research phase.

III. Phase 3: Comparing frames

General research approach

The goal of this research phase was to answer research question three: How do the framings of the WCG and of ex-gang members compare?

In order to answer this question, the aim was to facilitate a dialogue between the framing results of the WCG and of ex-gang members respectively. As mentioned in the general introduction to this study, the notion of *dialogue* was of central importance for this research phase. To this end, it was attempted to develop a level of frame parity, by allowing all frames to share equally in the development of a more inclusive and integrated understanding of what constitutes the problem of gangsterism in the Western Cape. This meant that the various framing elements found in the previous two research phases had to be discussed in relation to and alongside one another.

In facilitating a dialogue between these frames, the framing elements that were found to be salient in the narratives of the WCG and of ex-gang members, were thus brought together, compared and contrasted. The aim of this research phase was not only to identify possible disparities in the way that the problem of gangsterism was being framed by these parties, but also to investigate whether or not these disparities could to some extent be overcome. While it was certainly acknowledged that the use of such an approach would not act as a full replacement of real dialogue between these stakeholders, the hope was nonetheless that through the facilitation of such dialogue, the study would somehow aid in identifying and responding to some of the issues surrounding gangsterism in the province.

To this end, Entman's (1993) four key components of a fully developed frame were again used to guide the dialogue. This meant that the various insights from both framing parties that either directly or indirectly were found to relate to *problem definition, causal analysis, moral judgement and remedy promotion,* had to be considered. Furthermore, it also had to be investigated to what extent the frames could be seen to inform one another, i.e. to add to a broader understanding of the issue under study, even where elements could not necessarily be directly compared between frames. Throughout this research phase, it was also aimed to demonstrate the extent to which an investigation into frames and proper framing analysis, could aid in bringing the understandings of different parties to a conflict together, by facilitating a useful theoretical engagement between them.

2.4. Ethical considerations & protection of human subjects

Because narrative inquiry is considered to be "a profoundly relational form of inquiry" (Clandinin, 2007, p.xv), ethical matters also presented a central concern in this study. As Clandinin & Murphy (2007) note, narrative inquiry is largely about the "attitude of listening, of empathic listening" and about "not being judgemental" (Clandinin & Murphy, 2007, p.647). However, seeing as this study relied solely on existing data, it had not been possible to apply these considerations apart from the actual analysis of the data. Consequently, these considerations were translated to the procedures followed in the data analysis conducted in this study. So translated, this meant that it was necessary to at least "suspend disbelief" (Clandinin & Murphy, 2007, p.647) in attending to the narratives, and to "respectfully present" that which was revealed within them (Clandinin & Murphy, in press, p.15).

An awareness of ethical considerations stood particularly central in dealing with the narratives of ex-gang members. Here it was indeed acknowledged that "narrative inquirers [must] understand that a person's lived and told stories are who they are and who they are becoming and that these stories sustain them" (Clandinin & Huber, in press, p.15). Bearing this in mind, both anonymity and confidentiality were particularly important in the case of ex-gang members. To this end, no third party was informed of the identities of the ex-gang members, and pseudonyms were used to represent their stories in the results. In cases where the interviews with ex-gang members were privately held and not otherwise accessible to the public, consent was given by the parties involved to use their stories for the purposes of this study.

Concerning the documents used to construct the narrative of the WCG, all speeches and public statements used were published and public documents, fully accessible to any member of the public through the WCG's official website.[6]

3. RESULTS

3.1. Western Cape Government

This section presents the results on the WCG's narrative on gangsterism. The results will be grouped thematically into the different sections of problem definition, causal analysis, moral judgements and remedy promotion.

Problem definition

In the first instance, the WCG's narrative was found to unequivocally acknowledge that gangsterism was indeed a problem in the province. The WCG showed no denial of this problem and frequently reiterated that gangsterism was a large-scale and pressing concern in Western Cape communities. It was repeatedly stated that people were feeling unsafe in gang-affected communities and that many people were living with the daily fear of being killed. The WCG was also found to refer to the presence of a gang culture in the province, with phrases like *"[the] gang culture require[s] critical attention"* (WCG 10).

Geographically, the central focal points of gangsterism in the WCG's narrative, were the areas that together comprised the Cape Flats. These included areas such as Manenberg, Mitchells Plain, Bonteheuwel, Elsies River, etc. Manenberg was put forth as the most problematic residential area, accounting for approximately 70% of all gang activity in the province. The abovementioned areas were framed by the WCG as constituting a *"Cape gang epidemic"* (WCG 6). Apart from using the notion of an epidemic, the WCG was frequently found to rely on a general disease metaphor when dealing with the issue of gangsterism. For example, the WCG argued that many communities were *"inflicted with gangsterism"* (WCG 17) and that gangsterism was a *"social ill"* (WCG 13, 26, 38) that was *"plaguing communities"* (WCG 3).

[6] The website can be found at https://www.westerncape.gov.za

In addition to framing the problem of gangsterism through the metaphor of disease, the WCG also repeatedly referred to the problem as a *"battle"* that they were not only fighting, but ultimately losing (WCG 8, 9, 10, 21). Example statements included that the Western Cape was *"losing the battle against gangsterism and drugs"* (WCG 8, 9) and that both the Western Cape community and the police service were *"fighting a losing battle against violence and crime"* (WCG 10, 21).

While it was clear that the WCG was unambiguously acknowledging the problem of gangsterism, it was not always clear what their exact delineation or workable definition of the problem was. Consequently, whenever the WCG dealt with the issue of gangsterism, a myriad constituents to the problem were usually found to follow. The most salient problems in this regard were those of crime, violence, murder, attempted murder, substance abuse, illegal drug trade and the possession and/ or use of illegal firearms. While all these terms were found to be included in the WCG's narrative on gangsterism, emphasis was mostly placed on the perceived cycle of *gangs, drugs and guns*, also leaving these three words repeatedly grouped together in various variations. It was indeed also this perceived cycle that the WCG argued was *"continuing to destabilise the Western Cape* (WCG 23).

It was clear from the WCG's narrative that the problem of violence bore a direct association with gangs and gang-related activity. However, it was not always clear whether or not the government was treating gang-violence separately from other forms of violence that were not gang-related, but that the Western Cape was nonetheless understood to suffer from. The only clear exception to this was the WCG's perceived link between gangsterism and the high rates of murder and attempted murder in the province. To this end, the WCG emphasised the *"horrendously high number of murders"* committed in the province each year (WCG 9). The WCG noted that in the past three years alone, there had been more than 950 gang-related murders and more than 2207 attempted murders in the province. In total, almost a quarter of all murders and attempted murders in the province were understood to be gang-related.

Overall, the WCG did however seem to frame gangsterism primarily as a safety concern. Not only was this clear through the WCG's reiteration that gangsterism was posing a serious threat to community safety, but it was also noted that much of the WCG's narrative on gangsterism was being provided by the Western Cape Minister of Community Safety. Regarding the WCG's framing of the urgency of the concern, the gravity of the matter was made clear by statements such as *"[t]his situation is beyond crisis level and cannot continue without intervention"* (WCG 6).

The WCG also emphasised that the situation in the province presented *"an abnormal state of affairs"* (WCG 10) and that there were *"daily please from communities for urgent intervention into the scourge of gangs"* in Western Cape communities (WCG 9).

Finally, the WCG was also largely focussed on the negative impact that gangsterism was having on the development and well-being of the youth. Here the WCG was found to frame the problem of gangsterism as constituting a *"war on young people"* (WCG 12), stating that there were indeed many young people *"whose lives have been wrecked"* at the hands of gangsterism and its aftermath (WCG 12). A particularly important theme regarding the youth, was the destructive influence that gangsterism had on the functioning of schools and on the safety and well-being of school children. Here the government emphasised repeatedly that schools were *"plagued"*, either by *"gangsterism and violence"* or by *"very difficult circumstances"* (WCG 1).

Causal analysis

The WCG's causal analysis was by no means found to be self-explanatory. Although the WCG's narrative stated that *"the main cause, motivator and opportunity for crime to occur [were] identified respectively as substance abuse, poverty, and inadequate police visibility"* (WCG 5), they did not limit nor structure there causal analyses according to these concerns. Strangely, even though the WCG had identified poverty as the main motivator for crime to occur, the issue of poverty was not substantively dealt with in the government's narrative on gangsterism. On the contrary, more emphasis was generally found to be placed on those who were *"benefitting from gangsterism, drugs and illegal activities"* (WCG 36). Furthermore, the WCG was found to only once directly refer to *"a legacy of forced removals and the destruction of the social fabric under apartheid"* (WCG 18).

The causal concern most acknowledged throughout the WCG's narrative, was that of policing deficiencies in the Western Cape. Here the WCG was found to repeatedly state variations of the fact that the Western Cape Province was *"one of the lowest performing provinces in terms of policing"* (WCG 21). Low police performance was understood by the WCG to include issues of substantive understaffing (shortage of 3000 police officers), inadequate visible policing and a general lack of police resources such as office equipment and vehicles. The issue of under resourcing was put forth as the main reason for the police's inability *"to prevent crime and to effectively combat crime"* (WCG 10). The WCG also emphasised that police stations dealing with

the highest amounts of crime and the most difficult policing environments, were also found to have the lowest police-to-population ratios in the province. The WCG did not attribute these policing failures to themselves, but to national government – claiming that the latter's continuation of empty promises were the main cause of concern. This included failures on the part of national government to reinstate the necessary specialised gang- and drug-units requested by the WCG. The WCG repeatedly laid claim on the fact that these units had long been promised by national government, while the national government refused to give any details on either the resourcing or implementation of these units. Here the WCG emphasised that *"[t]he people of the Western Cape want to know why it has it taken more than four years of campaigning and the loss of countless lives before the national government has even considered the introduction of these much needed specialised gang units?"*(WCG 6).

A second salient causal concern was the WCG's perception of large-scale systemic injustices brought forth by problems within the country's criminal justice system. Here the WCG repeatedly stated that murderers were walking free and simply returning to communities without ever being caught, convicted or punished. This was confirmed by statements asserting that those responsible for crimes were *"not removed from communities"* and could therefore *"continue their reign of terror"* (WCG 33). The WCG also pronounced the fact that important court cases were continuously being scrapped from the role, and that this was leading to the acquittal of accused even before the start of their trials. Overall, the conviction rate for murder cases in the province stood at less than 3%, with only 85 successful prosecutions out of a total of 3157 murder and attempted murder cases in the last three years.

A third concern was the *"worrying reality of the accessibility of guns in [Western Cape] communities"* (WCG 24). Here the WCG repeatedly stated their concern that official South African Police Service (SAPS) guns were somehow landing in the hands of gangsters in the Western Cape. According to the WCG, at least 3361 illegal firearms had been recovered and seized in the province over the past year alone. While stating that approximately 35 illegal firearms were being confiscated per week on the Cape Flats, the government was not of the opinion that these confiscations had yet ensured any less shootings or killings of the people that lived in these areas.

A fourth causal concern was specifically aimed at Western Cape communities — particularly the communities living in and/or near the geographical area of the Cape Flats. Here the WCG was found to accuse communities for working against police officers and for not taking any action to

report or to prevent harm. The WCG also emphasised the fact that victims were not reporting the crimes they fell victim to and that witnesses to gang-related crimes were not making use of the Justice Department's Witness Protection programme. To a large extent, the WCG was found to accuse communities in general for not working well enough with local government to combat the problem of gangsterism. Although the WCG did acknowledge that a possible reason for this was the general *"breakdown between the police and communities"* (WCG 33) –understood by the WCG to be brought forth by the community's lack of confidence in the police – the WCG nevertheless maintained their impression that the community's lack of cooperation was fuelling the problem of gangsterism in the province. The communities living in gang-affected areas were particularly framed as using their community networks to protect criminals. To this end, parents were largely held responsible by the WCG for *"[absconding] the responsibility of their child/children" or "[attempting] to legitimate their child's illegal and criminal acts by remaining silent or pretending that they do not know what their child is getting up to"* (WCG 2).

Fifth, it was found that the WCG's narrative on gangsterism strongly emphasised the extent to which the problem of gangsterism was affecting the youth. The WCG was often found to argue that gangsterism was largely driven by youth who were susceptible to joining gangs, and that such susceptibility was somehow stronger during holiday periods. To this end, the WCG saw the lack of recreational activities and other services to the youth, as some of the main reasons for concern. Here the government made use of statements such as *"young people are vulnerable to making unhealthy and risky lifestyle choices when they have limited access to recreational opportunities. This is especially the case in high crime, drug and gang activity areas and even more specifically so during school holiday periods"* (WCG 27).

Finally, throughout large parts of the WCG's narrative, corruption was found to be a pressing causal concern. Here the WCG maintained that corruption, particularly on the part of national government, was one of the main driving forces behind the continuation of gangsterism in the province. Apart from the fraudulent firearms and firearm licences that were found to be issued to people of the Western Cape by members of the SAPS, other salient examples of corruption also included what the WCG termed *"The 'unholy triad' of gangs, cops and elections"* (WCG 25). This triad not only referred to the WCG's perception of *"a concerted effort by the national government to prevent [the WCG] from conducting effective oversight over the SAPS"* (WCG 25), but also included the WCG's continued emphasis of mounting evidence that the ANC (national ruling party) had *"an unholy alliance with some senior police officers, and ANC-aligned gangsters*

and drug dealers, to drive the ANC's political agenda" — all of which was framed as an ultimate attempt to destabilise the WCG (WCG 25).

Moral judgements

The moral judgements made by the WCG were not only found to be directed towards gang members and gang-related activity, but also to the WCG's ideas on safety, community and notions of accountability in general. Most salient here was the idea that *safety is everyone's responsibility*, which interestingly also constituted the most salient phrase throughout the entire WCG narrative. Here the WCG made unequivocally clear that every member of the community had a responsibility towards safety in their area, and that every person had to *"[take] up their responsibility to not look the other way when being confronted by crime, gangs and drugs"* (WCG 2).

Moral judgements were also made in relation to the issues of police deficiencies and corruption. The WCG often reiterated that it was unacceptable that poor policing service delivery was still failing communities; that it was unacceptable that the systemic injustice brought forth by the criminal justice system saw murderers walking free; and that it was unacceptable that official SAPS firearms were landing up in the hands of gangsters in the Western Cape.

Concerning the particular moral evaluations of gang members, the WCG was found to generally equate gang members with criminals, drug lord and murderers, sometimes also using the phrase *"gangster killers"* (WCG 4). Equating gangsters to killers and criminals, the WCG maintained that gangsters should *be "taken off the streets"* and *"remain off the streets"* (WCG 17). In claiming that gangsters had no right to remain in communities, the WCG often asserted that the conviction and sentencing of gangsters had to be welcomed, and that to this end, conviction and sentencing were both considered to be victories in the face of gangsterism and related crime.

Concerning the moral evaluation of community action, the WCG first and foremost reiterated the need for communities to work with police and not against them, stating that it is wrong and unacceptable for community networks to protect criminals. Only once in their narrative, did the WCG refer to the idea that every murderer was *"someone's child, brother, sister, family member or friend"* (WCG 2). This assertion was put forward by the WCG in emphasizing that it was unthinkable for communities to be oblivious to the crimes being committed around them,

arguing that it was time for the people of the province to speak up about these crimes and to *"identify and report the elements […] threatening everyone's safety"* (WCG 2). Most salient here was the idea that *"[w]hen you do not speak out against the criminals around you, you choose to become an accessory to crime"* (WCG 30). The WCG's reliance on notions of choice was also affirmed by statements such as *"[w]e all have a choice whether or not to act within the boundaries of the law or whether we become a criminal*" (WCG 30). Apart from addressing communities in general, the WCG was also found to address parents in particular. Example statements included that *"parents have the responsibility to provide for the immediate safety and protection of their children"* and that *"[g]overnment could never compensate for the role that responsible, committed parents must play in the lives of their children"* (WCG 27).

Remedy promotion

The remedies promoted by the WCG were roughly found to be situated within the government's long term vision to develop a *"highly skilled, innovation driven, resource efficient, connected, high opportunity society for all"* (WCG 11). Important to this vision, was the government's need for *"a collaborative and long term sustainable approach […] to ensure that communities are rid of gangsters and drugs and that everyone's safety is prioritized"* (WCG 10). Bearing in mind that community safety was found to be a central concern for the WCG, the remedy promotions put forth by them were mostly directed to combating crime in general, and not always toward gangsterism in particular.

The most salient remedy promotion found in the WCG's narrative, was that of a *"whole-of society-approach"* to the problem of gangsterism (WCG 2, 3, 16, 22, 24, 27, 35, 37). In emphasizing such an approach, the WCG government reiterated the need for communities and organizations to *"help create safer communities through a whole-of society-approach where everyone has to play their part in making communities safer"* (WCG 10). The WCG made clear that they would continue to *"capacitate"* organizations, *"to help build the necessary united front which is needed to combat crime"* (WCG 21). Furthermore, the WCG also reiterated the need for communities to work with them, asserting that they would *"continue to partner with anyone who is willing to help create safer environments"* (WCG 10). However, it was unclear who the WCG included in their understanding of *the community.* While they did seem to emphasize that *"[e]veryone deserved to be considered a legitimate part of the community"* (WCG 18), they also

strongly asserted that the notion of community was *"one of the most abused words in the political lexicon"* (WCG 18). Stating that the notion of community was often used as a *"figleaf"* for complainants to hide behind, the WCG claimed that many individuals tended to speak *"on behalf of 'the community'"*, while only having *"a personal interest or agenda in a matter"* (WCG 18). For this reason, it was largely unclear who exactly the government considered legitimate and eligible members of the community for the purposes of partaking in the WCG's developmental visions.

Apart from the WCG's whole-of-society approach, they also extensively promoted the use of law. Indeed many of their remedies were either promoted or justified with reference to the law. To this end, the WCG was found to particularly emphasize the idea that the biggest crime deterrent and strongest weapon against crime was, in fact, the law – stating the need for government to ensure that criminals faced *"the full might of the law"* (WCG 30). In emphasizing the role of the law, specific legislation was also presented by the government as *"a powerful tool against gangsters, drugs and criminals"* (WCG 35). Here the WCG most saliently referred to the Prevention of Organised Crime Act (POCA). The WCG stated that POCA was *"[empowering] communities to assist police in getting the gangsters off [their] streets, put druglords behind bars and break down the daily stronghold criminals have over communities"* (WCG 35). The WCG emphasized that POCA not only made it possible for them to target those guilty of an offence, but also to target anyone who was found to protect offenders. Here the government specifically stated that the act *"criminalizes activities associated with gangs" and "also criminalizes the failure of members of the public to meet their obligation to report certain information"* (WCG 35).

Furthermore, the WCG strongly asserted that *"[u]ndoubtedly, one of the biggest game-changers in [Western Cape] society would be to dramatically reduce crime" (*WCG 29). However, the WCG also admitted to the fact that reducing crime was not part of their direct focus. According to the WCG, the main reason for this was that they *"[did] not have the power to take the necessary action to achieve it"* (WCG 29). This meant that the WCG did not consider the necessary steps to reducing crime to fall within their *"constitutional mandate"* (WCG 29). Here the WCG specifically blamed national government for not taking up their responsibility and accountability in taking the necessary steps to reduce crime in the province. The WCG repeatedly asserted that there was large-scale corruption, empty political promises and self-seeking political agendas on the part of national government, and that these issues urgently had to be exposed to the general public. While the WCG did not necessarily present particular remedies to solve these issues,

they placed a general focus on the need to inform the public on these matters, stating that *"the word is already out"* and that *"this time the general public [was] more ready to believe some awful truths that they were, perhaps, not ready to acknowledge about their democratic government, even five years ago"* (WCG 25).

With reference to the above, the WCG made clear that their oversight powers indeed provided an important counter to corruption. Here the WCG pronounced their undertaking to define and implement these powers as best as was constitutionally possible. While the WCG did state that *"oversight, on its own, cannot curb crime", they nevertheless argued that it could at least "reveal the reasons why [they were] losing the war"* (WCG 8).

Within the limits of their oversight powers, various remedies were found to be proposed. In the first instance, the WCG emphasised the need to put pressure on national government to increase the number of police officers employed in the Western Cape, and to improve visible policing as a deterrent to crime. This included the WCG's continued request for national government to reinstate specialized drug- and gang-units in the province, arguing that these units could assist both in stabilizing the situation in the province and in delivering conviction-ready court cases. While the WCG stated that gangsters *"like to believe that they operate above the law and are untouchable due to the fear they instill in communities"* (WCG 30), they subsequently argued that *"the best crime deterrent is the knowledge among would-be criminals that they will be caught, convicted and punished"* (WCG 23).

Secondly, the WCG stressed the need to tackle illegal firearms, stating that they needed to *"ensure that energy in resources are placed to disarm those in contravention with firearm legislation and [those] responsible for killings in [their] community"* (WCG 8). Third, the WCG also emphasized the need for the Department of Correctional Services to ensure that *criminals "are not extended the opportunity to continue their reign of terror over the communities they have been removed from"* (WCG 11). To this end, the WCG specifically focused on the fact that there were *"serious problems in prison across the country that [required] immediate and urgent attention"* (WCG 11). The main problem that the WCG was referring to here, was the concern that some prisoners still had unlimited and unsupervised cellular access to the outside world, and that they were thereby able to continue their illegal operations even while imprisoned. The WCG often argued that *"communities need to feel safe and assured that when criminals go to jail, they have no hold over the community anymore"* (WCG 11).

In the fourth instance, the WCG also acknowledged the need for effective substance abuse treatment programs. Here the government stated that they would not only continue to develop drug intervention sites around the province, but that they would also *"continue to bring hope to sufferers of drug and alcohol addiction"* (WCG 38). Furthermore, the WCG also dedicated a large part of their narrative to giving details on their Violence Prevention through Urban Upgrading (VPUU) project, specifically focusing on their developmental visions for the large-scale urban transformations of previously disadvantaged areas. Here the area of Manenberg, which was argued to account for approximately 70% of all gang activity in the province, was found to be the most salient focal point of the VPUU.

Finally, the WCG was again found to focus on serving the youth and securing service delivery to the youth as a remedy against gangsterism. Most salient here was their development and implementation of youth holiday programs, where school children would get the opportunity to come together and take part in sporting and other recreational activities. The WCG also asserted that the youth needed to know that *"although they live in a poverty stricken and gang-ridden area their future is not determined by where they came from, but by their discipline, positive attitude and the will to be successful"* (WCG 13).

3.2. Ex-gang members

This section presents the results on the ex-gang members' narratives. After a brief discussion of the demographics of the five research subjects (John, Sam, Ryan, Noah and Brad), the results are thereafter grouped thematically. The different sections are: defining gangs and gang membership, gang-culture, violence, other push factors, identity, the law, characteristics of gang membership, desisting from gangs, after desistance, as well as a short conclusion.[7]

Demographics

All five research subjects were men of a coloured race. Four subjects had been raised in geographical areas forming part of the 'Cape Flats'. At the time of telling their life-stories, all five

[7] The original narratives of ex-gang members were autobiographically told in either English or Afrikaans. In some cases, subjects would also use a mixture of these languages throughout their narrative. Due to this, all quotes given in this section have been fully translated to English, also keeping to the original English found in the narratives as far as possible.

subjects had already desisted from gangsterism, and none were found to have returned to gangsterism after their initial desistance.

Defining gangs and gang membership

Although the current ages of the subjects were unknown, it could be deducted from their narratives that their participation in gangsterism had mostly started between the ages of 11 and 18, with desistance mostly occurring in their early to mid 20's.

While the majority of subjects (4 of 5) admitted to belonging to particular gangs, the case of John presented an unique exception. Although John admitted to instilling both threat and violence in his community, he also stated that he never got so far as to allow himself to become an initiated gang member, even though many high ranking gangs often tried to recruit him. Because of these recruiting attempts, John often moved within various high ranking gang-circles. While it was clear that the explicit swearing of an oath to a particular group would imply membership, it was unclear whether a gang-like lifestyle, being part of gang-circles and perpetrating gang-like activity could in fact also be considered as a form of gangsterism. If anything, the case of John at least seemed to reveal some of the difficulties in definitively defining gangs and gang members. Regardless, John's narrative was kept in the analyses of all the themes explored here.

Gang-culture

Throughout all five narratives, the subjects' acknowledgment of a strong and persistent gang-culture in the Western Cape was noted. Gangsterism was presented by all subjects to be a highly integrated and visible part of everyday life in their communities. Its visibility stemmed not only from the general violence associated with gangsterism, but also to typical forms of dress, a shared language used by gang members, visible tattoos, particular tastes in music, etc. This embeddedness of gangsterism as a culture was not only found to be present within prison settings, but also in community- and social networks outside of prisons — including high numbers of gang-activity in the local neighbourhoods where the subjects had all spent their childhoods and the larger parts of their adult lives.

Apart from larger community- and neighbourhood contexts, the school environment was found to be another focal point of interaction with gang members, and consequently, an additional space of daily exposure to gang-culture. Recruited gang members would be seen to have a lot of

authority on school grounds, with gang rivalries also bringing a lot of violence into the school environment. Fights between rivals would often spill over into after-school violence and turf-wars. To this end, the school environment was indeed presented as a space where the witnessing of gang-culture, gang-authority and gang-related activity was a frequent occurrence:

John: *In high school there were a lot of gang members and for me it was awesome to see how they were running the school. Eventually many of the 28 gang members were men that I knew… they were in their last year of school and later left… at that stage I was in my first and second year of high school […] and after they were gone… I took over.*

Violence

Aside from acknowledging the existence of a strong and persistent gang-culture within their schools and broader communities, the subjects also reflected extensively on the impact that the persistent exposure to violence had on their lives. Here it was clear that violence formed a prominent theme in the lives of all subjects — not only during their gang membership, but also in the years preceding gang entry. Exposure to violence was found to occur in various stages of the subjects' early childhood development, as well as throughout their childhoods and into their early adult lives. Such exposure mostly included the witnessing of domestic violence, physical abuse (abusive parents), and frequent exposure to violent gang-activity in general neighbourhood areas (including residential areas, schools, parks, etc.). The quotes given below serve to give an example of each of these exposures:

Ryan: *My mom would take us into a room where the iron was already plugged in and it was already getting warm. She would unplug that iron, role the cord around her hand and then she would literally beat you. And wherever the iron catch you, that's where it will burn you, you know […] and she wouldn't leave that room without there being blood on the walls. That was my mother.*

John: *I witnessed a lot of abuse in my household… where my dad would hit my mom for no reason and put his hands on her and take an axe and beat [her] with the axe… breaking [her] ribs…times when he would come home from work under the influence of alcohol…still with his safety boots on… and he [would] just pull her to the ground… for no reason and kick her and go crazy. Once he even kicked her skull open. Many times I was watching this happen and I couldn't do anything about it… I am young…I am a child… I can't do anything. I don't understand what is happening…*

Ryan: *We would sit and play in front of our house, and we would see the gangs driving by. And in front of our house we would see how they would literally pin some guy down in the mud, sticking a garden fork through his body. In broad daylight. And we would see how [those gangsters] would chop him into pieces. And they would lift him up and show him*

to the [rival gang] and shout: "Here's your man! Come and fight for him!"… That's what we grew up in.

While violence presented a clear and explicit theme throughout all narratives, the forms of violence and the subjects' relationship to violence differed between narratives. While some narratives focused more on the exposure to violence (i.e. witnessing the violent acts of others), some would place more emphasis on the participation in violence (i.e. the perpetration of violent acts). This revealed that the very notion of violence was indeed a highly complex and multi-layered concept in these narratives. To say the least, violence was not only found to play a crucial role in what the subjects experienced throughout their lives, but was also found to eventually become one of the central means through which they had started to assert themselves in gangsterism. Having entered a life of gangsterism, subjects acknowledged that both the threat and perpetration of violence formed a cornerstone of their gang-activities, emphasizing the extent to which gangsterism and violence seemed to be two sides of the same coin:

John: *[…] and anything that I saw that was out of order… I would hit it back into order… and later I started using in violence. If I saw young kids outside smoking cigarettes or marijuana then I would hit that kid and say "Go tell your dad!", because I wanted to fix everything […] and my life was like this: I wanted to fix everything. Homes where my friends' dads would abuse them… I would go into that house and hit that man. Everything that I couldn't fix in my own life and home, I wanted [those things] to go smooth in other people's lives.*

Noah: *And while I was in the sixth year of my prison sentence… I became the leader of this gang. And I began sending them out… to kill people in the prison […] You know… this [one] night we got up… and we got to this man's bed and we started to cut him up […] we cut this man's head off. We cut his body into pieces, broke his legs, cut them up and laid it all out in that cell.*

Other push factors

Apart from the central role of violence in all five narratives, varying push factors were identified by the subjects as factors leading them into a life of gangsterism. A prominent theme in this regard was the presence of broken homes, including growing up in single parent households, the lack of a stable father figure, high levels of domestic abuse, parental neglect, substance abuse within the home, economic difficulties within the home, and drug-selling from within the home. Bearing these circumstances in mind, the main push factors included the promise of material

gain, security, respect, power/authority, affirmation, belonging and a means of channeling feelings of anger and rage. The quotes given below summarize some of these factors as follows:

Ryan: *Gangs offered me a lot of stuff. That's why I always wanted to do well and impress them. So… I shot somebody or stabbed somebody, [be]cause they always gave me that affirmation. And they always had the cars, the money, and everything I wanted as a young boy […] If I stole from someone or robbed someone, then the men of the gangs would give me affirmation. That thing that I never got from my mom or my dad. And then they would say: "We respect you for doing this"… I belonged.*

John: *Basically, why guys find themselves in gangs… they want that power… meaning that if I speak now, there is authority […]*

Sam: *I was seeking that familyship... that unity... that thing I didn't [feel] I received at home. I saw the gangs were always in groups and stuff like that. They had all the nice clothes, all the blings, all the chains, uhm, all the cars and the money. And I thought that's... that became my role models and that's where I wanted to be.*

Identity

In the years following gang-entry, both the personal and social identities of the subjects were found to be largely dependent on gangsterism. Indeed, gangsterism was acknowledged by the subjects to come with a variety of expectations concerning both their personhood and social role within society. To this end, entry into gangsterism meant closing the door to expressing any forms of weakness or vulnerability. Some subjects even admitted that their character development through gangsterism had later left them incapable of feeling any guilt or remorse, while they seemed to gain feelings of overall power and invincibility. As one subject so powerfully stated:

Sam: *I had no respect for society, I had no respect for life, I had no respect for the law or anything. Because in gangsterism I was taught how to break all the rules and therefore [I] had no feelings for other people. I was running away from town to town and I thought the police will never catch me. And in every place I came, my lifestyle of crime and violence just escalated.*

The law

Many narratives seemed to reveal either a resentment or complete apathy for the law. During years of active gang membership, the feelings of power and invincibility seemed to be sufficient in convincing subjects that they were operating above the law and that they were therefore untouchable. For others, especially in the case of Noah, there seemed to be strong feelings of

resentment toward the law. Having had no criminal record or association with gangs prior to his arrest, Noah stated that he was wrongly arrested at the age of 13 for a crime he did not commit. After spending 4 years in juvenile detention, he was finally sentenced to six months imprisonment at the legal age of 18. It was only during these six months that Noah not only become a gang member in prison, but also secured an additional 29 years imprisonment for the crimes he had committed only after entering prison. Noah acknowledged that during this time, he had "a lot of resentment for the law". He noted that he "wanted to fix this thing", because he was "innocent in this place". Amidst fostering a deep resentment for the law, Noah also admitted to fearing for his own safety within prison walls. As a result, he quickly joined and later became the leader of a prison gang. Overall, a majority of the subjects (3 of 5) stated that they had been to prison during their lifetime, two of whom had also been imprisoned for crimes they did not commit (Noah and Brad). Finally, some narratives also revealed that the subjects' experience of prison life tended to mimic the lives they felt they were living outside of prison as well:

Sam: *In prison my life was exactly the same as it was outside. It was full of violence, full of bitterness, full of pain.*

Characteristics of gang membership

In exploring what it had meant for the subjects to be part of a gang, various pertinent themes were identified. These themes included strong reference to asserting traditional ideas on masculinity (strength, power, authority) and the importance of obeying the rules of gangsterism at all times. In some cases, gangsterism had also temporarily secured a life of wealth and prosperity for the subjects, although these securities would often not last long. It was especially in the case of Brad where economic prosperity seemed to stand central to gang-membership. However, in being a drug-addict, Brad would often end up in economic crises as his addiction escalated:

Brad: *And so it went. I went from cocaine to the injection [heroine]. [Then] the injection became too weak for me […] and so it happened that I went over to Tik8… and then Tik got to weak […] And so my life went for five months. Downhill. I can remember…strong wine started to taste like water. I would use Tik continuously for more or less three days and then cut out. When I woke up… I would reach under my head… under the mattress… and I would take out another half gram and just carry on. That's how my life went.*

[8] A South African name for the drug methamphetamine or 'meth'.

It was interesting to note that none of the subjects admitted to ever having critically reflected on their life decisions during the larger part of their gang membership. To this end, the rules and regulations of gangsterism seemed to simply be taken for granted, even it if meant severing relationships with families, friends or romantic partners. To at least some degree, this showed that many of the subjects' actions and decisions during this time, were not so much motivated by rational choice as they were by an uncritical obedience to the contexts and dominant culture in which they found themselves. Furthermore, given the subjects' general lack of guilt and remorse, triggers of regret were often inaccessible to them, leaving them to believe that they were simply acting in accordance with the shared norms of the group.

Pull factors

Concerning the pull factors that were perceived by the subjects to eventually guide them away from gangsterism, spiritual encounters with the Christian God stood central in all five narratives. However, this was assumed to be largely due to the sample of collected data, insofar as the provided narratives had all primarily been collected for the purposes of including short extracts of ex-gang members' life stories in a self-help book that focused largely on spiritual growth. Due to this, it was important for the purposes of this study to move beyond the mere identification of these spiritual encounters. Here the goal was to rather explore the value of Christianity as perceived by the subjects themselves. The most salient themes in this regard were the receiving of forgiveness through Grace, reconnecting with one's true or destined identity, reconnecting with others, regaining a sense of purpose, feelings of hope and freedom, having a source of self-confidence, as well as the continued experience of a loving and supporting father figure:

Sam: *So for me… my walk with the Spirit was special, it was intimate. When I came out after thirteen years being locked up in prison, I had to go and ask my family for forgiveness, for the wrong stuff that I've done. For the first time, I could tell my mom and dad that I love them […] when I met Christ, a new hope arised in my life. No matter where you come from, no matter who you are, there is a hope […] that freedom… to live, that freedom to move, that freedom to breathe […] I started a new life… because I regained hope in life and in society… a hope that I never had before.*

John: *I had such a confidence and boldness when I stepped into salvation. Honestly…nobody taught that to me. The spirit of the Lord guided me in all facets […] I don't know fatherly love. I don't know what it means to have a father that supports you and says that he is proud of you. My father never played a roll… he was there in the house but he neglected his role as a father. And the Father approached those areas in my life and I started to*

understand through scripture…and according to Jesus… what is father love. And I accepted that love.

One of the subjects, Ryan, had spoken specifically of having a spiritual encounter with God whilst in the process of high jacking a car. As Ryan was holding a gun to the drivers head, he noticed that the threat of violence wasn't instilling any fear in the victim, which surprised him:

Ryan: *I started to think who this guy was. Because this guy was answering me with no fear. I never saw anybody having a gun against his head like... still being calm. I was speechless. And I [asked] him: "Now, who are you?'' And he answered me he's a child of Christ, you know. And I was amazed... [these] Christians, you know. And, uhm, he started telling me that God loves me, that God has a plan with my life... That I didn't have to live this lie and... wear this mask that I was wearing to prove myself. And he said that God had a plan and purpose with my life.*

Desisting from gangs

Apart from experiencing what the subjects presented as spontaneous spiritual encounters, the eventual decision to desist seemed to be premeditated and conscious decisions on the part of all five subjects. Most often, a subject's decision to desist was motivated by a preceding critical reflection on their own lives. Such reflection or evaluation was not only brought forth by the aforementioned spiritual encounters, but also by the slow realization that gangsterism was no longer a way of life that they were either able or willing to continue. In the time leading up to their desistance, many of the subjects seemed to have confronted the idea that gangsterism wasn't relieving their feelings of anger and rage, and that it was neither living up to the promise of satisfying their need for love and belonging.

These realization were found to have left the subjects with an extreme sense of vulnerability and lack of personal agency. Right before their desistance, subjects had felt themselves to be living a lie, insofar as they were committed to a group consciousness that was no longer on par with their own. In these instances of vulnerability and dissonance, many subjects were found to have entered into an intimate, honest and vulnerable conversation with themselves:

John: *One afternoon I was sitting at my apartment block smoking a cigarette under a tree […] I saw all of this foul language and violence around me and I thought to myself: I don't fit into this world. And I said to myself: I can't fix everything in myself. While I looked at myself [I thought]: I can't fix everything alone. That night… on a Tuesday… I lay in my bed and thought back on my life and all the things that I've been through… and I thought about my life and where I hurt people… where I assaulted men… and where friends of mine were six feet underground… because they wanted to show me that they also had*

guts… they wanted to seek me… but it cost them their lives, because death overwhelmed them, because I had exposed them… and because I had implemented it… Drug lords and women who later became prostitutes and women who have now had abortions upon abortions […] and all sorts of rubbish that I had gotten up to… and it instilled a sadness in me.

As realizations such as these left the subjects exposed to their own vulnerabilities, it also seemed to open up the possibility of critically examining their lives and the direction they wanted their futures to go. To this end, their later decisions to desist from gangsterism were in some ways also presented as a reclaiming of their individual agency. This seemed to imply that the phenomenon of desistance allowed for the subjects to establish a distance between their own personal narratives and that of the group. In other words, the existing social identities of the subjects in some way became separable from their personal identities, the latter of which desistance allowed them to reclaim:

Ryan: *There was a lot of incidents that made me realize that what I was doing and the life that I was living was a lie… because every choice that I made, there was a negative consequence […] I didn't want to do the things that I was doing. But because I caught myself in the midst of these negative things… I had to just go with the flow. It was my identity. I was recognized, I had power… but because of our circumstances and the environments that we grow up in…[it] directs us away from our true identity, from who we're supposed to be.*

<u>After desistance</u>

In finally stepping away from gangsterism, many subjects were met with much resistance. For both John and Noah, there had been strong disapproval on the part of their fathers, particularly concerning their acceptance and commitment to Christianity. While Noah did acknowledge that this was mainly due his father's commitment to Islam, the reasons for disapproval on the part of John's father were not as clear. Furthermore, the decision to desist seemed to leave many of the subjects without an established support system. This also meant that desistance was often accompanied by isolation and hardships. As Brad swiftly noted: "[T]here are gates for getting in, but no gates for getting out". Consequently, the decision to desist left many of the subjects without any homes, jobs or income — finding themselves highly dependent on others. Following the fact that all subjects had committed themselves to Christianity prior to their desistance, it was found that some of the needed support had thereafter come from people in the Christian community.

None of the subjects revealed that their lives had been in any danger after their decision to desist. Although it was not made precisely clear why this was the case, it was implied in a few narratives that the subjects' roles as gang leaders had established an authority to which many gang members continued to submit. Often, the subjects' histories and reputations of violence alone was found to safeguard them from threat. However, it was not taken for granted that the subject's may have chosen to remain silent on these issues.

After having desisted, many subjects also remained active within gang-affected areas. While many subjects continued to live within these areas, they also later became actively involved in communities, especially in working with high risk individuals. Here the notion of risk was found to include youth who were at risk of joining gangs, as well as desisted individuals who had a history of gang membership themselves. Whether formally (through established organisations or intervention programmes) or informally (inter-relationally between peers), all subjects were found to play a role in facilitating and supporting the desistance of others. Through such facilitation and support, many of the subjects (4 of 5) were found to relate their new life purpose specifically to sharing the message of their desistance. In the case of Ryan, it was especially prominent to what extent his role as a leader remained important to him, even after his desistance from gangs:

Ryan: *I've no longer become the leader of a negative group but I've become the leader of the bible study group. Where people don't want to go, where people fear to go, that's where God is leading me to go.*

Furthermore, it was clear from all five narratives that the subjects attached great value to the telling of their life stories. This was not only apparent from the subjects' willingness to share their stories with others, but also through the various ways in which the subject's found their life-stories to be of instrumental value in their communities. Most of the subjects (4 of 5) had over the years become open to sharing parts of their testimonies more publically through organized talks with schools, churches, community outreach programmes, etc. Interestingly, these testimonials were not presented as clear counter-narratives to gangsterism, but rather on broader struggles of identity and belonging, as well as the deservingness to start one's life anew:

John: *It is very important… you have to tell the story of where you come from and where you have been called to… but there is a root. The reason why you got hooked and the reason why it manifested in your life.*

Ryan: *I am now only willing to lay my life down for the good of life. That role model that I never saw. I am that role model now… We get the [bible study] group together, but we don't preach. I don't tell them how to live their lives. We just talk about the scriptures. And then we get a leader from the group. Because then, when I have to go, that group will stay alive. It'll have its leader. We don't get the pastor to come and baptize. It's that guy's own responsibility. And the tattoos can stay and the cool clothes can stay… If you would've told me that salvation meant wearing a suit and a tie, I would have told you to take your salvation and shove it up your mother's ass. Because then I have no desire for the church… We say: 'Come as you are. But you won't stay as you are'. I still look like a gangster, but I'm part of a new gang now.*

Overall, it was acknowledged that the subjects' prior involvements in gangsterism and their past commitment to a dominating gang-culture, remained strong and reoccurring themes in their lives. None of the subjects were found to deny blame for their past wrongdoings, or to demand a complete cut off from their pasts. Rather, openly reflecting on their pasts seemed to allow the subjects to functionally make sense of their past experiences in the light of their futures. In this regard, a final noteworthy observation was made concerning the similar actions taken by subjects after their desistance. All subjects seemed to acknowledge the need to trace back their steps and ask for forgiveness from the people that they had wronged. Although the outcome of these actions weren't always ideal, many subjects nonetheless took the necessary steps to do so:

Sam: *When I came out after thirteen years being locked up in prison, I had to go and ask my family for forgiveness, for the wrong stuff that I've done.*

John: *I went back to each woman that I used… by each woman I stood and for each woman I repented for ever misusing their bodies and for hurting them and walking over them. And to be honest with you, many of them spat in my face, many of them were rude to me and some of them said it was okay […] I did it because I had lived badly and I had to go and set things straight with everyone […] A lot of people just stood there…didn't know what to tell me, because for so long time they had been walking around scared of me. And I came to humble myself before [them] and to ask them to free me from what I had done. [And so I Would say]: "I did wrong, my brother, I was living a bad life". I always left everyone with a small portion […] What actually hurt me the most while repenting… was when people would say: "It's okay, my friend"… because that wasn't enough.*

Conclusion

Despite the limited amount of research subjects, it had nonetheless been possible to identify a multitude of themes in the ex-gang members' narratives, the most salient of which have been described in this section. In what follows, a comparison between the results on the Western Cape Government and on ex-gang members will now be drawn.

3.3. Comparing frames: A dialogue

In this section, the aim is to explore how the framing elements of the WCG and of ex-gang members compare, by attempting to facilitating a dialogue between them. As mentioned in both the introduction and methodology chapters of this study, the use of the term 'dialogue' is of central importance here. In this section, the aim of facilitating a dialogue between frames will rest mainly on achieving a level of frame parity, whereby both frames may come to share equally in the development of a more inclusive and integrated understanding of what constitutes the problem of Western Cape gangsterism. To this end, the aim is not to have the varying elements compete for dominance, but to rather bring the WCG and ex-members' understandings of gangsterism together, so that the disparities between them may be clearly identified and possibly even challenged.

Before venturing into a specific comparison between various framing elements, it is useful to first identify the types of frames found in each respective case. As Benford and Snow (2000) rightfully note, processes of framing can occur on either a macro- or micro level. On a macro-level, frames are understood to mainly shape public or political discourse, while micro-level frames are mostly developed by individuals in their attempts to understand and make sense of pertinent issues, including identity issues relating to themselves (Benford & Snow, 2000). It is also possible to think of the distinction between processes of macro- and micro framing as producing either societal- or individual level frames (Benford & Snow, 2000). Similarly, Kinder and Sanders (1990) have suggested that frames can indeed serve both as "devices embedded in political discourse" and as "internal structures of the mind" (Kinder & Sanders, 1990, p.74). Bearing this distinction in mind, it will first be illustrated how the results presented in this study were found to reflect the development of frames on both a macro- and micro level.

Western Cape Government: The macro-level frame

The frame produced by the WCG is first and foremost a product of political discourse. Throughout the framing process, the WCG remains the gatekeeper of information in deciding which elements are selected, connected and made salient within the frame. This frame is also seen to shape a particular public discourse around the issue of gangsterism, the latter of which can be understood to produce a macro-level frame (Benford & Snow, 2000). In analysing frames that have been produced on a macro-level, it is important to first take into account the possible

agenda-setting(s) that might have been at play in the gatekeeper's selection and salience of certain information (Kingdon, 1995).

Put simply, the notion of agenda-setting can be understood to refer to "the list of [topics] to which governmental officials and those around them are paying serious attention" (Kingdon, 1995, p.3). Of course, this does not imply that a government's agenda-setting will necessarily produce a straightforward or transparent list (Kingdon, 1995). For example, while the WCG's frame on gangsterism was clearly seen to be tackling the topic of gangsterism as part of a straightforward agenda to create safer communities, the selection and salience of certain information had also revealed a possible hidden agenda within their political discourse (Kingdon, 1995). Here the notion of a hidden agenda need not necessarily be understood as a manipulative or malicious act on the part of the WCG. Rather, for the purposes of this study, this hidden agenda can more readily be understood as a secondary political agenda that constituted an intertextual discourse throughout the frame.

For example, let us assume that one of the WCG's main agendas was to create safer communities. To this end, the problem of gangsterism and its aftermath was presented as a clear and threatening safety-concern, not least through the observation that much of the WCG's narrative on gangsterism was being provided by the Western Cape Minister of Community Safety. Apart from identifying gangsterism as a topic in itself, the WCG also highlighted the many issues surrounding gangsterism. Firstly, these surrounding issues were found to relate to notions of cause-and-effect, i.e. a critical evaluations on the part of government, to identify the factors that were both perceived to be creating and to being created by the problem of gangsterism. At this point the WCG was found to highlight issues such as policing deficiencies, the lack of specialised units, corruption, as well as murder, attempted murder, illegal drug-trade, etc. Because of the multi-dimensional nature of local government, and the extent of accountability given their various departments, the identification of these factors could simply be seen in the light of the WCG's main agenda-setting.

On the other hand, the WCG's reiteration of the failures on the part of national government does seem to reveal a possible secondary agenda within their frame. In the WCG's unambiguously negative evaluation of national government, an intertextual discourse is thus found to take place. Such a discourse is seen to exert power by shaping public opinion on both the credibility and functionality of national government. This could, for example, be found in

statements such as "[t]he people of the Western Cape want to know why it has it taken more than four years of campaigning and the loss of countless lives before the national government has even considered the introduction of these much needed specialised gang units?"(WCG 6); as well as in statements mentioning that "this time the general public is more ready to believe some awful truths that they were, perhaps, not ready to acknowledge about their democratic government, even five years ago" (WCG 25). Statements such as these all seem to be questioning the integrity and efficiency of national government, while placing the local government in the obvious position of the protagonist. Without drawing conclusions on the truth-values of such claims, the important conclusion to be drawn here is that the WCG's frame on gangsterism was at the very least exerting its persuasive power in two distinct directions — one being towards members of the public (their potential supporters) and the other being towards national government (as their political competition).

Ex-gang members: The micro-level frame

In the case of the ex-gang members of the Western Cape, it must first and foremost be acknowledged that the research subjects' life-stories represented their own lived experiences and that this also meant that the representation of these life stories did not constitute nor shape public discourse. On the contrary, the life stories of these ex-gang members were rather understood to give insight into the subjects' own perceptions of their lives, and were thus used to explore how these individuals understood and made sense of their experiences of gangsterism. To this end, the framing processes that had been identified in these narratives were understood to have produced individual-level frames, the latter of which were not found to primarily serve the same function as the WCG's macro-level framing.

The function that was indeed found to be served by ex-gang members' framing of gangsterism, related mainly to McAdams' (2001) life story model of identity. In this light, it seemed apparent that the ex-gang members had developed a life narrative of the self, that allowed them to reflect on their own lives in some temporal coherence, the latter of which placed each subject's past, present and future on an identifiable continuum (See also McAdams, 2001). Following McAdams' model (2001), it was also acknowledged that the development of such personal narratives had made it possible for each narrating subject to establish a sense of unity and continuity with the self.

Similarities between frames

Overall, many clear similarities could be found between the various framing components of the WCG- and ex-gang member frames. Firstly, both frames were found to lack definitive descriptions of both gangs and gang membership. As mentioned earlier in this study, the difficulties in defining these concepts are also reflected in gangsterism research itself — leaving both the notion of gang-affiliation and gang-related crime without consistent definition (Decker & van Winkle, 1996; Esbensen, Winfree, He & Taylor, 2001; Sullivan, 2005). This certainly complicates the endeavour of finding appropriate ways to respond to whatever is perceived as the 'gang problem' (Decker & van Winkle, 1996; Esbensen et al., 2001). As has been rightfully observed, "[w]ithout a clear concept of what is a gang and who is a gang member, public officials [still] find themselves responding to an amorphous, ill-defined problem" (Decker & van Winkle, 1996, p.3). Even if we were to accept that gangsterism is a "complex phenomenon that cannot be explained by a single theory" (Bowers Du Toit, 2014, p.3), it is nevertheless functional for the purposes of public policy and intervention strategies, to understand exactly who is being referred to when using terms such as gangs, gang members, etc.

Aside from the fact that neither the WCG – nor the ex-gang member frames consistently defined gangs or gang-membership, it was nevertheless clear that both frames were pertinently highlighting specific demographics, namely that of 'coloured gangs' and the 'male, coloured gangster' (See also Dixon & Johns, 2001). Furthermore, it was also found that the geographical areas most dominant in both frames were the areas that together formed the generally termed 'Cape Flats'. Not only are these areas known to be historically disadvantaged (See Bowers Du Toit, 2014; Dixon & Johns, 2001); but indeed they also remain dominantly home to coloured population groups today (See Bowers Du Toit, 2014; Standing, 2003, 2006). While all five ex-gang members included in this study were men of a coloured race, four of them had also been raised within the Cape Flats. It was also noted that the WCG's reference to a "Cape gang epidemic" (WCG 6), referred specifically to the Cape Flats area and that this area in particular had been presented by the WCG to be "inflicted with gangsterism" (WCG 17).

Furthermore, both frames were found to emphasise various gang-related problems within the school environment. To this end, it was clear from both frames that the quality of schools and the need for service-delivery to school-youth were important themes in countering gangsterism. Finally, both frames were also found to acknowledge the existence of an embedded gang-culture

within the province, as well as the acknowledgement that many gang members felt themselves to be operating above the law, most often showing either resentment or complete apathy for the law and its criminal justice practices.

Disparities between frames

As a general point of departure, it is useful to refer to a remarkable observation made by Edelman (1993) where he states that: "the world is […] a kaleidoscope of potential realities, any of which can be readily evoked by altering the ways in which observations are framed and categorized" (Edelman, 1993, p.232). The truth-value of this statement was especially reflected in exploring the disparities between frames. Indeed, while each frame evoked a particular interpretation of the issues surrounding gangsterism, some of these interpretations and representations did seem to reveal a number of important differences and possible tensions between the frames.

In the first instance, the WCG was found to pertinently focus on notions of rational choice when dealing with the issues of gangsterism and gang-related crime. This was particularly made clear in statements such as "[w]e all have a choice whether or not to act within the boundaries of the law or whether we become a criminal" (WCG 30). However, the frames of ex-gang members seemed to reveal that both the individuals' decisions to become gang members, as well as their participation in gang-related crime, was not perceived by them as acts of rational choice, but were rather presented in their narratives as an uncritical obedience to the norms , values and expectations of the dominant culture in which they found themselves.

Secondly, regardless of acknowledging the existence of a gang-culture in the province, the WCG was still often found to frame gangsterism as an outside threat to the safety and well-being of society. Even though the WCG was clear and often justified in making their case on this matter, perceiving gangsterism in this way did seem to present an oversimplification of the problem (Standing, 2003). Such an oversimplification on the part of the WCG was often found to underestimate the role of gangsterism as both a cultural and social phenomenon within gang-affected communities. Here the WCG was seen to mostly underemphasise the cultural- and social realities of gangsterism, by portraying the problem of gangsterism merely as an abnormal and anti-social phenomenon within Western Cape society. This of course did not entirely reflect the experiences of the ex-gang members themselves. During the ex-gang members' years of active gang-affiliation, their entire social networks had been situated within a dominating gang-

culture. This mostly meant that for them, gangsterism was in fact a crucial part of their social organisation, which indeed highlighted the social relevance and social value that gangsterism had for these ex-gang members. Bearing this in mind, a critical engagement with gangsterism is likely to necessitate an equally important acknowledgement of its "complexity as a social and cultural phenomenon" (Daniels & Adams, 2010, p.46).

In the third instance, it was noted that the various ways in which the WCG- and ex-gang members' frames were developing, could in each case be "measured in terms of common cultural values" (Entman, 1993, p.52). This meant that the very identification of a problem would largely depend or be determined by whether or not it was perceived to step out of the boundaries of shared cultural norms and values. To this end, ex-gang members' narratives revealed times in their lives when gangsterism had indeed constituted the dominant culture in which they found themselves. For this reason, most of their actions had at that time not been perceived by them as stepping out of the boundaries of shared cultural values, the latter of which had been set by the culture of gangsterism. However, the WCG differed starkly from ex-gang members in this respect, insofar as their common cultural values (as a political entity elected in a democratic society) were more fundamentally perceived to be built upon shared constitutional values such as securing and supporting equal human rights, protecting freedoms and human dignity, and fulfilling the various functions of their constitutional mandate. To this end, gangsterism was simply understood by the WCG to step out of the boundaries of such shared values.

Fourth, while the WCG frame on gangsterism seemed to promote more of a 'law and order' approach to tackling the problem of gangsterism, the frames of ex-gang members seemed to be focussed more on issues of identity and meaning making. Throughout the WCG's narrative, the general plotline of *Overcoming the Monster* (Booker, 2004) seemed to stand central. Following Booker in this regard, this plotline was found to revolve mainly around an evil antagonist who in some way was posing a threat to the good-hearted protagonist. Translated to the WCG's frame on gangsterism, the local government was continuously seen to present itself as the tale's protagonist, demonstrating the various attempts to defeat the 'monster' of gangsterism and secure law and order in the 'homeland'. Even though research has long been suggesting that a general 'law and order' approach from local government could not be considered an efficient means of tackling the gang-problem (Kinnes, 2000), such an approach was nevertheless found to persist. Both the law and order approach from the WCG as well as the overarching presence of a

plot similar to Booker's (2004) *Overcoming the Monster*, reminded of a noteworthy passage by Maruna where he writes:

> The creation of a bogeyman may serve a distinct social purpose. If there is no common enemy, no Them, perhaps there can be no Us. Yet creating a Them also essentially relieves Us from having to examine ourselves for signs of deviance. If crime is something that wicked people do, we need not worry that our own behaviour is wrong. (Maruna, 2001, p.5)

Indeed, insofar as the WCG was found to draw a clear distinction between a Us and a Them, it could be argued that they were in fact safeguarding themselves to such an extent as to close the door on evaluating their own actions, as well as their own political discourse on gangsterism. Of course, this is not surprising in the realm of politics, especially bearing in mind the need to foster public support and to appeal to voters with ready and clear-cut policy agendas. However, it is also easy to envisage how such an approach can leave the various stakeholders in the Western Cape "stuck in the current impasse of attack and counter-attack, crime and reaction" (Dixon & Johns, 2001, p.6).

Regarding the ex-gang members' frames and the general focus on issues of identity and meaning making, a very different plotline was found. In this case, the ex-gang members' narratives seemed to reflect more of a Rebirth plotline (Booker, 2004), which was found to revolve mainly around the idea of a protagonist starting out as a villain, but later redeeming themselves over the course of the story (Booker, 2004). In contrast to the WCG's main plot, it was interesting to note that the framing of the ex-gang members had in this case presented the tension between a perceived 'good and evil' to be situated mainly within the framework of their own identity development. This was also found to be reflected in research demonstrating the strong link between Western Cape gangsterism and the development of identity and meaning making (Bowers Du Toit, 2014; Calix, 2013; Pinnock, 2016). Subsequently, this was also noted to have brought the ex-gang members to a point of excepting blame for their past wrongdoings, without simply projecting blame to external forces.

Furthermore, these processes of identity development were also found to reveal a certain "link between the self and society" (Hammack, 2008, p.224). Given the fact that the problem of gangsterism in the Western Cape lies deeply embedded in socio-historical inequalities, it also became possible to understand the problem of identity as one "deeply connected to questions

of [both] personal and social meaning" (Hammack, 2008, p.226). This also strongly related to issues of powerlessness in gang-affected communities (Bowers Du Toit, 2014). With feelings of powerlessness already being instilled at a very young age (particularly through a series of victimizations), ex-gang members were often found to have perceived gangsterism as a means to take back power or to at least achieve a sense of power. To this end, gangsterism was at first understood as a source of power for these subjects, not only insofar as it seemed to promise to alleviate them from the large scale economic deprivations they were in, but also insofar as it provided them with some sense of stability and personal validation, all of which had been lacking in their home environments (See also Daniels & Adams, 2010).

A final disparity to be mentioned here, relates specifically to the phenomenon of desistance. Indeed, it had only been through ex-gang members' narratives and their subsequent framings of gangsterism, that any mention had been made to individuals who had desisted from either a life of crime or violence. The WCG's frame made no mention of such occurrences, and were subsequently not found to shape any political discourse on the matter. This was found to resonate deeply with the following statement made by Maruna (2001):

> In the black-and-white world of good guys and bad guys, one is either a good person who makes forgivable mistakes or a common criminal who deserves no sympathy. An equally dark side of this equation, of course, is that once a person finds him-or herself on the wrong side of that line, the bogeyman stigma is likely to persist even when the deviant behaviours do not. (Maruna, 2001, p.5)

Seen in the light of the WCG's framing of gangsterism, it was worrisome to note that this might, in fact, have been the case. With the WCG neither acknowledging nor shaping any discourse around desistance, it was unclear whether or not they perceived it to even be a real possibility beyond mere chance. Overall, the WCG's did seem to focus more on prevention strategies, while also creating the impression that securing convictions, sentences and jail time were the real victories in dealing with gang-members and gang-related crimes. To this end, the WCG's framing of gangsterism showed no reason to believe that they indeed rejected the notion of 'once a criminal, always a criminal' (See also Maruna, 2001).

Negotiating between frames: The development of shared meaning

In earlier sections of this study, it was acknowledged that frames can help us to understand why conflicts exists and why certain actions are important within the development of such conflicts (Kaufman et al. 2013). By the same token, it was also argued that analysing the various frames present within a conflict, may aid in directing that conflict toward its resolve (Kaufman et al., 2013). While this should not be understood to imply that such framing analyses will effectively resolve the conflict at hand, theories on framing analysis could nevertheless be utilised in an attempt to at least negotiate a shared meaning between frames (Kaufman et al., 2013).

Regarding the possibility of such negotiation, it is important to note that no process of negotiation should start without a thorough understanding of the different framing positions of the different stakeholders. This is mainly due to the fact that theoretical negotiation would not be possible without first revealing the tensions in positions between stakeholders. So far, this study has already identified the various framing components of both the WCG- and ex-gang members' framings of gangsterism, and has also already revealed some of the most pressing disparities between these frames. The question now remains as to how such disparities could be challenged or perhaps even overcome?

One way of answering this question, is to explore the potential to negotiate between these frames. Ultimately, in attempting to develop a shared meaning between frames, it is also useful to understand the theoretical negotiation process through the lens of reframing (Kaufman et al., 2013). However, as Kaufman and colleagues note, "research shows that reframing is often not easy for parties. It requires taking on new perspectives, and often requires some degree of risk taking on the part of the parties" (Kaufman et al., 2013, p.7). At the same time, it is also acknowledged that reframing tends to work best "when changes in the context of the dispute can be made, such that incentives to consider new perspectives increase [...]" (Kaufman et al. 2013, p.7). Following these assertions, it will now be attempted to briefly explore the possible ways in which increasing the incentives to take on new perspectives, could aid in the development of more effective programmes and interventions targeting gangsterism in the province.

As a general point of departure, it is important to note that the very process of negotiation starts here on somewhat of an unfair (dis)advantage. Even though the aim of this study was to establish a level of frame parity between the various stakeholders, the WCG is nevertheless

exposed to a greater risk of having to adapt and compromise on their framing of gangsterism. The reasons for this are mainly two-fold. On the one hand, while it is impossible for us to either change or ask individuals to change their own experiences of gangsterism, it is still possible to explore the possibilities for shaping public discourse on gangsterism differently. Secondly, insofar as many of the WCG's current interventions against gangsterism are still not perceived to efficiently alleviate the province of its gang-problem, it has become strikingly important for the WCG to pay more attention to the lived realities of the individuals who constitute these target-groups (Dixon & Johns, 2001; Van Wyk & Theron, 2005). In what follows, the themes central to the development of a broader and more inclusive framing of gangsterism will now be identified.

In the first instance, it seems clear that an exclusive 'law and order' approach on the part of government will not constitute a sufficient response to the gang-problem (See also Kinnes, 2000). This also means that legislation alone will not be enough in combating the problem, and that what is needed is a more integrated and holistic approach (Kinnes, 2000). At present, the WCG does seem to present an overall approach that extends the role of the law, for example, by also focusing on the development of substance abuse treatment, youth holiday programmes, urban upgrading, etc. However, the WCG is still seen to place a dominant emphasis on the law, also presenting the law as the biggest crime deterrent and strongest weapon against crime (WCG 30, 35).

Furthermore, public discourse on gangsterism should try not to alienate and marginalise communities in tackling the gang-problem (Kinnes, 2000). To this end, it is important for the WCG to strengthen their relationship with communities, also by taking into account the circumstances in which community members may find themselves in. In order to achieve this, it will be important for the development of public discourse to keep the line of communication open between government and local citizens, and to allow for the voices of community members to be heard in both the planning and implementation of anti-gang policies (See also Van Wyk & Theron, 2005).

The third theme to be taken into account is the need to address socio-economic factors (See also Daniels & Adams, 2010; Dixon & Johns, 200; Lambrechts, 2013). Research suggests that the socio-economic factors in the Western Cape are most heavily impacted by the problem of violence , which is seen to have "devastating effects on [both the] economic and social [lives]" of Western Cape citizens, and even more so in the areas where gang-culture is seen to dominate

(Dixon & Johns, 2001, p.5). This implies that public discourse on gangsterism should direct more of its focus towards both identifying and tackling the roots of violence. Such a focus should also be seen to include discourse on violence-related trauma and the mental health issues that may develop from the experiences of such traumas (Daniels & Adams, 2010). Furthermore, a focus on issues of violence should also acknowledge that "retaliation for past victimization often underlies violence" (Pemberton & Aarten, 2015,p.5), and that any decent attempt to understand violence cannot rightfully dismiss the importance of understanding more about the possible victimization that lies behind it.

In the fourth instance, the phenomenon of desistance marks an incredibly important theme to be integrated into public discourse on gangsterism. Here it is important to acknowledge that criminals who desist are often found to have constructed powerful narratives on the unfolding of their life-events (Maruna, 2001). Maruna also notes that these narratives are often expressed by these individuals with an "inflated, almost missionary sense of purpose in life" (Maruna, 2001, p.9). Consequently, it is important to explore how these narratives of desistance can be introduced and incorporated into public discourse. If stories of desistance continue to be left out of the public discourse on gangsterism, it is unlikely that the government will foster enough public support to further the development of desistance programs. On the other hand, if stories of desistance are to be explored more fully, it may be possible for public discourse to greatly utilize such stories, particularly by exploring their potential to act as counter-narratives of the gang-problem.

Finally, in allowing narratives of desistance to form part of public discourse, it will subsequently also be possible to start expanding target-member inclusion, particularly by giving desisters the opportunity to partake in the planning and/ implementation of anti-gang policies and interventions. Since research has been found to suggest that the exclusion of target-group members has been detrimental to the effectiveness of the WCG's policy visions (Van Wyk & Theron, 2005), such inclusion should in fact be welcomed. Also, given the fact that many of the ex-gang members presented in this study were found to already play a key role in either facilitating or supporting the desistance of others, allowing such target-member inclusion will also be an effective way for government to strengthen their relationship with gang-affected communities.

4. STRENGTHS AND LIMITATIONS

As the dictum goes: You have to understand a problem before you can try to find its solution. Recognising that the many WCG interventions against gangsterism were not effectively countering the issues at hand, the likelihood of existing disparities between the WCG's understanding of gangsterism and that of target-group members, had to be investigated. In acknowledging this, the present study presented an attempt to not only generate theory on how the Western Cape Government and ex-gang members were framing gangsterism, but also set out to compare these framings by facilitating a dialogue between them. Neither of these purposes have in this way been put forth in research on Western Cape gangsterism before.

In the first instance, this tri-linear research movement provided a detailed description of what the framing elements of both the WCG and ex-gang members entailed. Secondly, through using the notion of dialogue, it effectively brought the different insights and perspectives of the various frames together, thereby developing a more inclusive and integrated understanding of gangsterism in the Western Cape.

Often, when different parties to a conflict are forced to share their views with one another, it is very likely for different framings to start competing for dominance through notions of debate. However, this was not the purpose of the present study. By using comparison through dialogue, the aim of this study was rather to reach a level of frame parity, whereby differing frames could come to share equally in the development of a newer, fuller understanding of what constitutes Western Cape gangsterism. In order to do so, it was thus necessary to "listen" to both sides equally, ensuring that insights from all framings could ultimately be integrated in a comprehensive and holistic manner.

The use of a qualitative research approach allowed this study to "[emphasize] the stories that people employ to account for events" (Bryman, 2012, p.584). This approach also made it possible to usefully represent the quality and context of the data. By using narrative inquiry as an overall methodological approach, the aim was thus not to prematurely set boundaries around the data, but rather to allow the data to speak for itself. Given the innovative focus of the present study, this was a clear advantage. Also, by distinguishing between Polkinghorne's *narrative analysis* and *analysis of narratives,* it was possible to analyse both the WCG and ex-

gang members' data sets within the overall scope of narrative inquiry. Ultimately, this also allowed for a full-circle methodological approach that brought both these modes of analysis together in a single study.

Furthermore, the use of published and official WCG speeches and public statements presented a clear strength regarding the data selection of the WCG. Indeed, these sources were valuable both in ascertaining and representing how the WCG was framing gangsterism in their communication to and with the public. A final strength to be mentioned here, is the choice to compare the WCG's framing of the issue with that of ex-gang members of the province. Not only did the narratives of ex-gang members provide this study with insights into the lived experiences of gang-members themselves, but it also went further in exploring the phenomenon of desistance and the lived experiences of those who have desisted from gangs. Ultimately, the narratives of ex-gang members had made it possible to identify both pull and push factors that may lead individuals towards and away from gangsterism. This study also showed that the inclusion of ex-gang members in the planning and implementation of anti-gang policies and interventions, may indeed be a helpful way of developing new and effective ways of responding to gangsterism, especially with regard to finding constructive, long-term solutions.

Next to the abovementioned strengths, the present study also had some clear limitations. Firstly, the research in this study was focused on a very specific context, namely gangsterism in the Western Cape. Hence, the results of the present study are not to be generalised to other contexts without analytic care and attention to nuances. While the hope is that the insights gained through this study may aid the Western Cape's fight against gangsterism, it seems safe to assume that each conflict situation will reveal its own tensions and power dynamics, and that both research and the solutions suggested therein should always remain context aware and context sensitive. However, this does not mean that the present study cannot influence and inform future research focussing on understanding or countering the global phenomenon of gangsterism. Importantly, this study has at least illustrated how framing theory, the comparison of framing elements and the use of narrative inquiry, can all be utilised in bringing the insights of different stakeholders together, thereby allowing various opinions and views to be voiced and integrated into a fuller understanding of the problem at hand.

A second limitation relates specifically to the small sample of ex-gang members included in this study. This was a clear result of the low accessibility of respondents simply due to geographical and time limitations. Although the provided narratives of ex-gang members did reveal sufficient variety and insightful recurring themes for the purposes of this study, further research would undoubtedly benefit from a larger sample. Given the phenomenon of desistance and the knowledge that some ex-gang members of the Western Cape are now also key players in facilitating and supporting the desistance of others, it seems highly plausible that many more narratives of desistance will be found to exist. However, the accessibility of these narratives may largely depend on the established relational networks and trust-relationships between researchers, communities, and target-group members.

A final limitation to be mentioned here, relates to the fact that the narratives of ex-gang members used in this study had not been primarily collected for the research aims put forth here. Although the narratives that were made available ultimately did provide sufficient insights for the purposes of this study, future research would benefit greatly from the use of primary collected data on ex-gang members' narratives (e.g. semi structured, in-depth interviews). This would especially be beneficial insofar as it would aid in the development of a more comparable structure between narratives, in also preparing open questions on predetermined research themes.

5. CONCLUDING REMARKS

This study has set out to facilitate a dialogue between the various framings of Western Cape gangsterism, as produced by the Western Cape Government and ex-gang members respectively. This study has generated theory on how these stakeholders are currently framing gangsterism, and has also attempted to achieve a level of frame parity, whereby the insights gained through the various frames could be integrated. Finally, the need for target-member inclusion was also reiterated, briefly illustrating the role that narratives of desistance might be able to play in this regard.

Although the phenomenon of desistance was finally found to present an important theme within this study, much research still remains to be done on this topic. To this end, future researchers should aim to explore processes of individuals' desistance from violent- or criminal groups, and should also investigate why some members of these groups are driven to rethink their lives and loyalties to the group, while others are not. It is likely that such studies will also benefit from the use of a overarching narrative framework in exploring these issues.

REFERENCE LIST

Adhikari, M. (Ed.). (2009). *Burdened by race: Coloured identities in South Africa.* Cape Town: UCT Press.

Agnew, R. (2006). Storylines as a neglected cause of crime. *Journal of Research in Crime and Delinquency*, 43(2), 119-147.

Bal, M. (1997). *Narratology: Introduction to the theory of narrative*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Benford, R.D. and Snow, D. A. (2000). Framing processes and social movements: An overview and assessment. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 26(1), 611-639.

Booker, C. (2004). *The seven basic plots: Why we tell stories*. New York: Continuum.

Bowers Du Toit, N.F. (2014). Gangsterism on the Cape Flats: A challenge to 'engage the powers'. *HTS Theological Studies,* 70(3). Retrieved from http://www.hts.org.za/index.php/HTS/ article/view/ 2727/ 5409

Bruner, J. (1986). *Actual minds, possible worlds (The Jerusalem-Harvard Lectures)*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Bruner, J. (2004). Life as narrative. *Social Research: An International Quarterly*, 71(3), 691-710.

Burke, K. (1945). *A grammar of motives*. New York: Prentice Hall.

Bryman, A. (2012). *Social research methods*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Calix, K.R. (2013). *Wie is ek? Coloured identity and youth involvement in gangsterism in Cape Town, South Africa*. Senior Honours Thesis: Stanford University.

Charlton, R.W. (n.d.). *The Numbers gang*. Retrieved from http://thenumbersgang.weebly.com/

Clandinin, D.J. (Ed.). (2007). *Handbook of narrative inquiry: Mapping a methodology.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Clandinin, D.J. and Connelly, F.M. (2000). *Narrative inquiry: Experience and story in qualitative research.* San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Clandinin, D.J. and Huber, J. (in press). Narrative Inquiry. In McGaw, B., Baker, E. & Peterson, P.P. (Eds.), *International encyclopedia of education* (3rd ed.) (pp. 1-26). New York, NY: Elsevier.

Clandinin, D.J. and Murphy, M.S. (2007). Looking ahead: Conversations with Elliot Mishler, Don Polkinghorne, and Amia Lieblich. In Clandinin, D.J. (Ed.). *Handbook of narrative inquiry: Mapping a methodology* (pp.632-650). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Connelly, F.M. and Clandinin, D.J. (1990). Stories of experience and narrative inquiry. *Educational Researcher*, 19(5), 2-14.

Coffey, A. and Atkinson, P. (1966). *Making sense of qualitative data: Complementary research strategies.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Covey, H.C. (2010). *Street gangs throughout the world*. Illinois: Charles C Thomas Publishers.

Daniels, D. and Adams, Q. (2010). Breaking with township gangsterism: The struggle for place and voice. *African Studies Quarterly*, 11(4), 45−57.

Decker, S.H. and van Winkle. (1996). *Life in the gangs: Family, friends and violence.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Dixon, B. and Johns, LM. (2001). Gangs, PAGAD & the state: Vigilantism and revenge violence in the Western Cape. *Violence and Transition Series*, 2(1). Johannesburg: Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation.

Edelman, M.J. (1993). Contestable categories and public opinion. *Political Communication,* 10(3), 231-242.

Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of Communication*, 43(4), 51-58.

Entman, R.M. (1994). Representation and reality in the portrayal of blacks on network television news. *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly*, 71(3), 509-520.

Entman, R. M. (2004). *Projections of power: Framing news, public opinion, and U.S. foreign policy.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Entman, R. M. (2007). Framing bias: Media in the distribution of power. *Journal of Communication,* 57(1), 163-173.

Esbensen, F. A., Winfree, T.L., He, N. & Taylor, T.J. (2001). Youth gangs and definitional issues: When is a gang a gang, and why does it matter? *Crime and Delinquency*, 47(1), 105–130.

Frye, N. H. (1957). *Anatomy of Criticism*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Gadd, D. and Farrall, S. (2004). Criminal careers, desistance and subjectivity: Interpreting men's narratives of change. *Theoretical Criminology,* 8(2), 123-156.

Gastrow, P. (1998). Organised crime in South Africa: An assessment of its nature and origins. *ISS Monograph Series,* 28(1). Retrieved from https://www.issafrica.org/uploads/Mono28.pdf

Gross, K. and D' Ambrosio, L. (2004). Framing emotional response. *Political Psychology,* 25(1), 1-29. Retrieved from http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1467-9221.2004.00354.x/epdf

Haefele, B.W. (1998). Gangsterism in the Western Cape: Who are the roleplayers? *Crime and Conflict,* 14(1), 19-22.

Hagedorn, J. M. and Davies, C. (2011). *The global impact of gangs*. Illinois: University Illinois Press.

Hammack, P.L. (2008). Narrative and the cultural psychology of identity. *Personality and Social Psychology Review,* 12(3), 222-247.

Kaufman, S., Elliot, M. & Shmueli, D. (2003). Frames, framing and reframing. In Burgess, G. and Burgess, H. (Eds.), *Beyond Intractability*. Retrieved from http://pitchanything.com/wp-content/uploads/_pdfs/PITCH%20ANYTHING%20COMPANION%20MATERIAL-FRAMES%20FRAMING%20AND%20REFRAMING.pdf

Kinder, D.R. and Sanders, L.M. (1990). Mimicking political debate with survey questions: The case of white opinion on affirmative action for blacks. *Social Cognition,* 8(1), 73-103.

Kingdon, J.W. (1995). *Agendas, alternatives and public policies* (2nd ed.). New York: Longman.

Kinnes, I. (2000). From urban street gangs to criminal empires: The changing face of gangs in the Western Cape. *ISS Monograph series,* 48(1). Retrieved from https://www.issafrica.org/uploads/Mono48.pdf

Lambrechts, D. (2013). *The impact of organised crime on social control by the state: A study of Manenberg in Cape Town, South Africa.* Dissertation presented for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the faculty of Arts and Social Sciences (Faculty of Political Science) at Stellenbosch University. Stellenbosch: SUNScholar.

Magidi, M.D. (2014). *Experiences of gangsterism by non-gang affiliated high school learners in Hanover Park- Western Cape.* Dissertation presented for the degree of Masters in Social Work in the faculty of Community and Health Sciences (Department of Social Work). Cape Town: University of Western Cape.

Maruna, S. (2001). *Making good: How ex-convicts reform and rebuild their lives.* Washington: American Psychological Association.

McAdams, D.P. (2001). The psychology of life stories. *Review of General Psychology,* 5(2), 100-122.

McMaster, L. (2010). *In search of a family: The challenge of gangsterism to faith communities on the Cape Flats.* Dissertation presented for the degree of Doctor of Theology in the faculty of Theology (Department of Practical Theology and Missiology) at Stellenbosch University. Stellenbosch: SUNScholar.

Pemberton, A. and Aarten, P.G.M. (2015). *Narrative as a paradigm for studying victimization and radicalization.* (forthcoming)

Polkinghorne, D.E. (1995). Narrative configuration in qualitative analysis. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 8(1), 5-23.

Polletta, F. (2006). *It was like a fever. Storytelling in protest and politics.* Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Polletta, F. (2009). How to tell a new story about battering. *Violence against Women,* 15(12), 1490-1508.

Pinnock, D. (2016). *Gang Town.* Cape Town, Tafelberg Publishers.

Redpath, J. (2001). The bigger picture: The gang landscape in the Western Cape. *Indicator SA*, 18(1), 34-40.

Riessman, C. K. (2008). *Narrative methods for the human sciences*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Spergel, I.A. (1995). *The youth gang problem: A community approach.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Standing, A. (2003). The social contradictions of organised crime on the Cape Flats. *Institute for Security Studies Paper No. 74,* 1-15.

Standing, A. (2006). *Organised crime: A study from the Cape Flats*. Pretoria: Institute for Security Studies.

Sullivan, M. L. (2005). Maybe we shouldn't study "gangs": Does Reification obscure youth violence? *Journal of Contemporary Criminal Justice*, 21(2), 170-190.

Van Wyk, B.E. and Theron, W.H. (2005). Fighting gangsterism in South Africa: A contextual review of gang and anti-gang movements in the Western Cape. *Acta Criminologica,* 18(3), 51-60.

Wasson, D.L. (2015). Janus. *Ancient History Encyclopedia.* Retrieved from http://www.ancient.eu/ Janus/

Weisel, D. L. (2002). The evolution of street gangs: An examination of form and variation. In Reed, W. & Decker, S. (Eds.), *Responding to gangs: Evaluation and research* (pp. 25−65). Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Justice, National Institute of Justice.

APPENDIX A

Overview of Official Western Cape Government Documents Used in this Study

***WCG 1**: Minister Schäfer acknowledges province's top achievers*

14 January 2015

Extract from Minister Debbie Schäfer's speech from 2014 NSC Awards

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/minister-sch%C3%A4fer-acknowledges-provinces-top-achievers

***WCG 2**: Community networks must never protect Criminals*

27 February 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/community-networks-must-never-protect-criminals

***WCG 3**: MJC to partner with Western Cape Government for Youth Safety*

8 March 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/mjc-partner-western-cape-government-youth-safety

***WCG 4**: Gauteng police implicated in selling guns to Cape gangsters – Huge breakthrough*

23 March 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/gauteng-police-implicated-selling-guns-cape-gangsters-%E2%80%93-huge-breakthrough

***WCG 5**: Western Cape wants more police officers, vehicles and visible policing*

14 April 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/western-cape-wants-more-police-officers-vehicles-and-visible-policing

***WCG 6**: Cape Gang Epidemic needs Immediate action, Not delayed Considerations*

30 April 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/cape-gang-epidemic-needs-immediate-action-not-delayed-considerations

***WCG 7**: Gang conviction – Specialist units can enable even more victories*

14 May 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/gang-conviction-%E2%80%93-specialist-units-can-enable-even-more-victories

***WCG 8**: SAPS Budget- Minister Nhleko has Opportunity to Adequately Resource Western Cape*

14 May 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/saps-budget-minister-nhleko-has-opportunity-adequately-resource-western-cape

***WCG 9**: Minister Plato comments on national police minister's budget speech*

15 May 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/minister-plato-comments-national-police-ministers-budget-speech

***WCG 10**: WC SAPS needs more resources, return of specialised units and reservists*

28 May 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/wc-saps-needs-more-resources-return-specialised-units-and-reservists

***WCG 11**: George ""Geweld"" Thomas and co-accused's sentencing welcomed*

3 June 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/george-%E2%80%9Cgeweld%

E2%80%9D- thomas-and-co-accused%E2%80%99s-sentencing-welcomed

***WCG 12**: Min. Albert Fritz and Min. Nomafrench Mbombo to conduct youth day walkabout*

12 June 2015

Invitation

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/min-albert-fritz-and-min-nomafrench-mbombo-conduct-youth-day-walkabout

***WCG 13**: DCAS adds value to youth of Elsies River*

18 June 2015

Unspecified news document

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/dcas-adds-value-youth-elsies-river

***WCG 14**: Drug abuse, Domestic Violence and Gangsterism requires Combined Interventions*

21 June 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/drug-abuse-domestic-violence-and-gangsterism-requires-combined-interventions

***WCG 15**: Beaufort West draft safety plan to tackle crime, gangs and drugs holistically*

20 July 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/beaufort-west-draft-safety-plan-tackle-crime-gangs-and-drugs-holistically

***WCG 16**: Stabilisation Unit Launch – Vision into action*

24 July 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/stabilisation-unit-launch-%E2%80%93-vision-action

***WCG 17**: Premier Zille and Mayor De Lille unveil historic plans for Manenberg*

24 July 2015

Unspecified news document

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/premier-zille-and-mayor-de-lille-unveil-historic-plans-manenberg

***WCG 18**: Inside Government: Re-imagining Manenberg is a choice*

27 July 2015

Newsletter by Premier Helen Zille

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/inside-government-re-imagining-manenberg-choice

***WCG 19**: Inside Government: Putting the "Go" back in George*

24 august 2015

Newsletter by Premier Helen Zille

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/inside-government-putting-%E2%80%9Cgo%E2%80%9D-back-george

***WCG 20**: Media statement: Spy claims are ridiculous*

18 September 2015

Media statement

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/media-statement-spy-claims-are-ridiculous

***WCG 21**: Crime stats 2015 – National SAPS management is failing the people*

29 September 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/crime-stats-2015-national-saps-management-failing-people

***WCG 22**: Crime Stats 2015 – Khayelitsha violent crimes still a threat to safety*

1 October 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/crime-stats-2015-%E2%80%93-khayelitsha-violent-crimes-still-threat-safety

***WCG 23**: Inside Government: The puzzle of gangs, drugs, police and politics in the WC*

15 October 2015

Newsletter by Premier Helen Zille

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/inside-government-puzzle-gangs-drugs-police-and-politics-wc

***WCG 24**: SAPS Western Cape Annual Report: Honest reporting welcomed*

4 November 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/saps-western-cape-annual-report-honest-reporting-welcomed

***WCG 25**: Inside Government: The "Unholy Triad" of gangs, cops and elections in the WC*

23 November 2015

Newsletter by Premier Helen Zille

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/inside-government-unholy-triad-gangs-cops-and-elections-wc

***WCG 26**: Scottsdene MOD cluster offers youth sporting opportunities*

30 November 2015

Unspecified news document

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/scottsdene-mod-cluster-offers-youth-sporting-opportunities

***WCG 27**: Community Safety partners with religious fraternity for safer school holidays*

7 December 2015

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/community-safety-partners-religious-fraternity-safer-school-holidays

***WCG 28**: DoCS expands youth holiday programmes to Easter holiday*

29 January 2016

Unspecified news document

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/docs-expands-youth-holiday-programmes-easter-holiday

***WCG 29**: Inside Government: The criminal threat to broadband for disadvantaged schools*

8 February 2016

Newsletter by Premier Helen Zille

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/inside-government-criminal-threat-broadband-disadvantaged-schools

***WCG 30**: Hawston murder – Targeting of SAPS and family members condemned*

8 February 2016

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/hawston-murder-%E2%80%93-targeting-saps-and-family-members-condemned

***WCG 31**: Minister Plato and SAPS to conduct safety outreach in Uitsig*

16 February 2016

Invitation

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/minister-plato-and-saps-conduct-safety-outreach-uitsig

***WCG 32**: President Zuma's #SONAreply promise – Specialised drug and gun units for SAPS*

18 February 2016

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/president-zuma%E2%80%99s-sonareply-promise-%E2%80%93-specialised-drug-and-gun-units-saps

***WCG 33**: SAPS failures – Minister Plato supports Major-General Goss' search for justice*

22 February 2016

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/saps-failures-%E2%80%93-minister-plato-supports-major-general-goss%E2%80%99-search-justice

***WCG 34**: Budget 2016 – No mention of promised specialised drug and gun units*

28 February 2016

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/budget-2016-%E2%80%93-no-mention-promised-specialised-drug-and-gun-units

***WCG 35**: Belhar – POCA a powerful tool against gangsters, drugs and criminals*

8 March 2016

Statement by Dan Plato, Western Cape Minister of Community Safety

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/belhar-%E2%80%93-poca-powerful-tool-against-gangsters-drugs-and-criminals

***WCG 36**: Minister Plato and SAPS embark on a POCA safety outreach campaign*

8 March 2016

Invitation

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/minister-plato-and-saps-embark-poca-safety-outreach-campaign

***WCG 37**: Minister Plato and SAPS embark on a POCA safety outreach campaign in Manenberg*

15 March 2016

Invitation

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/minister-plato-and-saps-embark-poca-safety-outreach-campaign-manenberg

***WCG 38**: Budget vote 7 on social development*

25 March 2015

Speech

Retrieved from: https://www.westerncape.gov.za/news/budget-vote-7-social-development